UTAH HISTORICAL QUARTERLY

Cultural Perspectives

WINTER 1975 VOLUME 43 NUMBER 1
EDITORIAL STAFF
Melvin T. Smith, Editor
Stanford J. Layton, Managing Editor
Miriam B. Murphy, Assistant Editor

ADVISORY BOARD OF EDITORS
Thomas G. Alexander, Provo, 1977
Mrs. Inez S. Cooper, Cedar City, 1975
S. George Ellsworth, Logan, 1975
Glen M. Leonard, Bountiful, 1976
David E. Miller, Salt Lake City, 1976
LaMar Petersen, Salt Lake City, 1977
Richard W. Sadler, Ogden, 1976
Harold Schindler, Salt Lake City, 1975
Jerome Stoffel, Logan, 1977

Utah Historical Quarterly was established in 1928 to publish articles, documents, and reviews contributing to knowledge of Utah's history. The Quarterly is published by the Utah State Historical Society, 603 East South Temple, Salt Lake City, Utah 84102. Phone (801) 328-5755.

Members of the Society receive the Quarterly and the bimonthly Newsletter upon payment of the annual dues; for details see inside back cover. Single copies, $2.00.

Materials for publication should be submitted in duplicate accompanied by return postage and should be typed double-spaced with footnotes at the end. Additional information on requirements is available from the managing editor. The Society assumes no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion by contributors.

The Quarterly is indexed in Book Review Index to Social Science Periodicals, America: History and Life, and on Biblio Cards.

Second class postage is paid at Salt Lake City, Utah.

ISSN 0042-143X
# Contents

**WINTER 1975 / VOLUME 43 / NUMBER 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IN THIS ISSUE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UTAH FILMMAKERS</td>
<td>OF THE SILENT SCREEN</td>
<td>Richard Nelson</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THREE WOMEN AND THE LIFE</td>
<td>OF THE MIND</td>
<td>Maureen Ursenbach</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADA DYER: BRIGHT LIGHTS AND LILACS</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chris Rigby</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SARAH ELIZABETH CARMICHAEL:</td>
<td>POETIC GENIUS OF PIONEER UTAH</td>
<td>Miriam B. Murphy</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE RITUALIZATION OF MORMON HISTORY</td>
<td></td>
<td>Davis Bitton</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOOK REVIEWS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOOK NOTICES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECENT ARTICLES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HISTORICAL NOTES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**THE COVER** The Salt Lake Theatre was the symbol of cultural aspiration and achievement on the Utah frontier. As a symbol it has remained so evocative that since its demolition in 1929 two replicas of the structure have been built—the Daughters of Utah Pioneers Museum and the Pioneer Memorial Theatre. Andrew J. Russell captured this pristine view, ca. 1862, of the building and upper State Street, including Eagle Gate and the Beehive House. Photograph courtesy of the Oakland Museum.

© Copyright 1975
Utah State Historical Society
LEONARD J. ARRINGTON.
Charles C. Rich: Mormon General and Western Frontierism . . . . DENNIS L. LYTHGOE 86

LEONARD J. ARRINGTON AND THOMAS G. ALEXANDER. A Dependent Commonwealth: Utah's Economy from Statehood to the Great Depression . . . . JAMES L. CLAYTON 87

DANIEL TYLER, ed. Western American History in the Seventies . . . . JOHN D. SYLVESTER 88

F. ROSS PETERSON. Prophet without Honor: Glen H. Taylor and the Fight for American Liberalism . . RICHARD W. ETULAIN 89

GLORIA GRIFFEN CLINE. Peter Skene Ogden and the Hudson's Bay Company . . HARVEY L. CARTER 90

Books reviewed

W. EUGENE HOLLON. Frontier Violence: Another Look . . BARTON C. OLSEN 91

RICHARD E. LINGENFELTER. The Hardrock Miners: A History of the Mining Labor Movement in the American West, 1863-1893 . . . . JOHN E. BRINLEY, JR. 92

S. LYMAN TYLER. A History of Indian Policy . . . ROBERT W. DELANEY 93

THOMAS B. MARQUIS. Memoirs of a White Crow Indian (Thomas H. Leforge) . . RICHARD H. FAUST 94

MARY LEE SPENCE AND DONALD JACKSON, eds. The Expeditions of John Charles Fremont. Volume 2: The Bear Flag Revolt and the Court-Martial . . . . NORMAN E. TUTOROW 95
In this issue

The question of cultural achievement and appreciation in Utah has been among the most persistent and interesting in our state’s historiography. Nearly every Utah historian has addressed himself to this question at one time or another, but the respective judgments are still far from a consensus. Perhaps this issue of the Quarterly, devoted to matters cultural, will help sharpen perspectives and offer new food for thought in this area.

As the above photo suggests, the popularity of movies had an early beginning in Utah. Less well known, but an important part of the state’s cultural heritage, is the experimentation with movie production in Utah during the film industry’s initial years. That story is told in this issue, complemented by an interpretive essay on ritualization in Mormon history. Both articles bring new research and vision to bear on the meaning and significance of popular culture in Utah.

The focus in each of the other articles is on belletristic personalities and achievement in Utah history. The figures involved do not necessarily comprise a representative sample, but their stories are told in sufficient breadth and detail to point the reader toward a number of intriguing generalizations. At the very least it is plain that there were peculiar factors within the Utah milieu serving both to stimulate and discourage cultural creativity. The conclusion is also inescapable that regardless of one’s creative talent, a person and his works will forever remain a product of a particular time, place, and historical circumstance.
Studio and property is leased and owned by this company, and no other local motion picture manufacturing concern is in any way interested.

The Arrowhead Motion Picture Co. is THE ONLY ONE in this intermountain country having a studio and doing studio work.

Manufacturers of Motion Pictures

ARROWHEAD MOTION PICTURE CO

NOW OPEN

A cordial invitation is extended to the public to visit

OUR STUDIO,

234-236 Edison Street, Salt Lake City, Utah

This Company Has No Stock for Sale
Utah Filmmakers of the Silent Screen

BY RICHARD NELSON

Since the days of the pioneers live theatre has played a major role in the cultural life of Utah. By the end of the nineteenth century, with Mormon church backing, Salt Lake had become a leading dramatic center in the Intermountain West. Boasting the nationally recognized Salt Lake Theatre, Utahns were able to see and enjoy a number of highly popular vaudeville, minstrel, and touring stock presentations. Conversely, the movies were a recent innovation in 1900. Not until 1896, the year of Utah’s statehood, did the new invention receive its first successful U. S. theatrical screening in New York City, far removed from the still-remote mountain state. And despite Thomas A. Edison’s personal prestige, the new motion picture industry remained somewhat disreputable. Contemporary accounts and editorials in Utah as elsewhere echoed the concern, particularly of churchmen, that the unparalleled impact of the moving picture image would harmfully influence susceptible minds. Nevertheless, the emerging art found an audience among Utahns and was definitely established in the state not long after the turn of the century. After their first public appearance in Salt Lake City, the movies quickly won acceptance throughout the state.¹

Soon outgrowing the nickelodeon arcades, the new entertainment proliferated in converted storefront showhouses devoted exclusively to the showing of moving pictures. These theatres mushroomed along Main

Mr. Nelson is assistant editor of California Intermountain News.

¹ See John S. Lindsay, The Mormons and the Theatre (Salt Lake City, 1905); Horace Whitney, The Drama in Utah (Salt Lake City, 1915); Luke Cosgrave, Theater Tonight (Hollywood, 1952); Douglas Allen, “Drama among the Mormons,” Theatre Arts, 42 (December 1958), 52–55; “Moving Picture Shows,” Deseret News, January 8, 1909, and June 30, 1909; and “Growth of ‘the Movies’,” Salt Lake Tribune, December 1, 1913.

As early as 1903 Charles P. Madsen and Co. was making projection equipment available locally. See R. L. Polk and Co., Salt Lake City Directory, 1903 (Salt Lake City, 1903), 607, 1124. By 1908 listings for film exchanges began to appear. See Polk, Salt Lake City Directory, 1908, 1265.
Street in downtown Salt Lake. Helen Garrity in her valuable essay on “The Theatre in Utah” paints a vivid—if somewhat exaggerated—picture of what the early film patrons experienced:

What had been a quiet dry goods store front would suddenly blaze with lithograph three-sheets proclaiming to the surprised stroller that “Heaven Protects The Working Girl.” What happened to villains, regardless of their station in life, was depicted in no uncertain terms. In an era given to melodrama, the right vehicle had been found for it. Although the new art was silent, with subtitles for dialogue and pantomime as a means of emotional expression, it had the new and fascinating advantage of ACTION.

The first movie-goers were not discouraged by bare halls lined with chairs. They would face any sort of mechanical aberration to see locomotives run head-on on the screen, ships sink, Indians wipe out wagon trains and Keystone Cops create an hilarious travesty of the law. Down in front of the rows of chairs, a hard-working pianist ground out “Asleep in the Deep,” “Hearts and Flowers” or the “Poet and Peasant Overture,” often hard put to keep up with the movement on the screen. Occasionally the theatre manager who usually operated the movie machine, flashed on a slide chiding the audience, “Don’t Blame The Piano Player He’s Doing The Best He Can.”

Despite these hardships and primitive beginnings, the motion picture began to prosper. Not long after the passing of the new century’s first decade, Utah exhibitors began building elaborate theatres in which to screen their films. Typical of the industry’s prosperity within the state was the opulent American Theatre that opened with much fanfare at 241 South Main on July 8, 1913. At the time it claimed to be the largest movie palace in the world and boasted a seating capacity of three thousand.

In 1914 the locally owned Liberty Theatre Company, which ran both the Liberty and American cinemas, made history when it began publishing the illustrated American Photoplay Weekly magazine. Although manufacturers had long produced descriptive literature promot-

---

2 Helen Garrity, “The Theatre in Utah,” in Wain Sutton, ed., Utah—A Centennial History, 3 vols. (New York, 1949), 2:1015–16. Cinema historian Anthony Slide feels that “the description by Helen Garrity can hardly be described as accurate, vivid as it might be. As early as 1909, pianists were playing suitable music to accompanying films, and there never were slides such as ‘Don’t Blame the Piano Player, etc.’” Anthony Slide to Richard Nelson, December 12, 1973. It is nevertheless possible that Utah showmen did in fact utilize slides. See, for example, Kenneth Macgowan, Behind the Screen—The History and Techniques of the Motion Picture (New York, 1965), 128–30.

2 “Palatial Motion Picture House, Largest of its Kind in the World,” Deseret Evening News, July 4, 1913; “New Motion Picture Theatre on Main Street is the Largest in the United States,” ibid., July 8, 1913; and George Blaisdell, “C. W. Midgley, Exhibitor of Today,” Moving Picture World, 15 (February 22, 1913), 770–71. Earlier theatres in Salt Lake were also attractive although on a more modest scale. See, for example, the photograph opposite p. 1380 in Polk, Salt Lake City Directory, 1908.
ing their films, this was the first periodical of its type to be published by an individual theatre chain. In addition to containing information about “the pictures and players to be seen at the AMERICAN and LIBERTY theatres for the coming week,” it included “gossip of the players, notes from the studios, and interesting NEWS about the photoplay world in general.”4 As many as five thousand copies were distributed without charge throughout the city each week.

Not only was Utah becoming a major Intermountain show area, but as early as 1905 moving pictures about the inhabitants of the state were being made. The first effort, a rather crude comedy built around the theme of polygamy, was the American Mutoscope and Biograph Company’s A Trip to Salt Lake City. Set entirely in the interior of a Pullman sleeping car, it portrayed the problems faced by a harried polygamist when all his many children wanted a drink of water at the same time. Although relatively innocuous, the picture was important in that it foreshadowed later interest in the Mormon people by filmmakers.5 Within six years photoplays based upon the widespread anti-Mormon literature of the period began to make their appearance.

The Danish-made A Victim of the Mormons (Mormonens Offer)—the first and among the best of its type—had the advantage of competent acting, an exciting story line, and quality production. After premiering in Copenhagen on October 2, 1911, it went into worldwide release. A number of articles on the film and others like it soon began to appear regularly in the national motion picture trade journals.6

Once the attention of Utah’s governor, William Spry, was directed to A Victim of the Mormons, a bitter battle ensued for the censorship of films of this kind, not, as he said

4 American Photoplay Weekly, 1 (January 31, 1915), 1, 8.
5 For differing opinions on the Utah capital as a show area see “Salt Lake Foremost Moving Picture City in United States,” Deseret Evening News, January 26, 1914, and “Salt Lake Styled Dead Head City of America,” ibid., November 24, 1914. For a description of the film see Kemp R. Niver, Motion Pictures from the Library of Congress Paper Print Collection 1894–1912 (Berkeley, 1967), 100–101. The print has survived and copies are available commercially from Blackhawk Films Inc. of Davenport, la.
6 For example, see “Mormon Pictures in Demand,” Moving Picture World, 11 (February 10, 1912), 470; “Marriage or Death,” ibid., 11 (February 17, 1912), 614; “Mormon Governor Threatens to Bar Films in Utah,” Morning Telegraph (New York City), January 28, 1912.

Titles of representative photoplays of this period are suggestive of their content: The Flower of the Mormon City (Mormonbyens Blomst) (1911), Marriage or Death (1912), The Mountain Meadows Massacre (1912), A Mormon Episode (1912), The Mormons (1912), A Study in Scarlet (1914), the serialized The Adventures of Deadwood Dick: Deadwood Dick and the Mormons and Deadwood Dick Spoils Brigham Young (both 1915), and The Mormon Maid (1917). Later productions of a similar nature include Riders of the Purple Sage (1918), The Rainbow Trail (1918), Married to a Mormon (1922), and Trapped by the Mormons (1922, later re-released as The Mormon Peril).
on behalf of the "Mormon" Church, but as a protest on behalf of the State of Utah. While as a member of the "Mormon" Church I am glad to appeal to the manufacturers of the objectionable films to suppress them . . . [my protest] represents the objection of the people of a sovereign state, knowing that the exploitation of the pictures in question will do irreparable injury to Utah by poisoning and prejudicing the minds of the younger generation especially against the state.7

His actions brought little more than an illusory victory, however, and this first attempt at censorship can only be labeled a failure.8

Although anti-Mormon portrayals dominated the silent screen picture of Utah society, this was not the only film vision available. For example, The Uprising of the Utes (1910) and A Perilous Ride (1911) both dealt with the Ute Indians.9

The first known nonfiction photoplay of Utah life made its appearance in 1912. This was an Edison Company documentary appro-

8 Spry and the local newspapers originally felt that the attempt at suppression was successful. They were in error. See Richard Nelson, "A History of Latter-day Saint Screen Portrayals in the Anti-Mormon Film Era 1905–1936" (M.A. thesis, Brigham Young University, 1974), 33–46. See also Linda Lambert, "The Image of Mormons in Films," New Era, 2 (May 1972), 12–15; and William L. Roper and Leonard J. Arrington, William Spry: Man of Firmness, Governor of Utah (Salt Lake City, 1971), 94–95. While both these latter accounts are generally accurate, they uncritically accept the first euphoric reports of the contemporary Salt Lake dailies.

Posters advertise showing of sensational anti-Mormon film in England.
Utah State Historical Society photograph, Widtsoe Collection.
Utah Filmmakers

strictly entitled Salt Lake City, Utah and its Surroundings. According to the trade synopsis appearing in The Moving Picture World:

This city by the inland salt sea makes a novel subject for the motion picture devotee who wishes to combine knowledge with pleasure. Salt Lake City is beautifully located at the base of the high mountains that almost encircle it and one is given a complete and thorough view of the surrounding country from Immigration [sic] to Cottonwood Canyon, from the bathers in the Salt Lake to that masterpiece of Western architecture, the Mormon Temple, which lies in the very heart of the city.10

About this time local as well as other out-of-state film interests began to utilize Utah for moviemaking purposes. As early as 1911, pioneer Utah showman and director Harry Revier was listed in a Salt Lake City directory as a manufacturer of moving pictures.11

One of the most important photoplays from this period was the monumental One Hundred Years of Mormonism (1913). Although strangely neglected by most cinema historians, the film is important for a number of reasons. For example, its length was truly mammoth for its era—six reels of approximately ninety minutes running time. Indeed its promoters claimed, with only slight overstatement, that it was the longest picture ever completed devoting itself to a single story. In addition to its innovative feature dimensions, it had the advantage of active cooperation by Latter-day Saint church authorities.

The sweep of production was impressive. The basic story of Mormonism from Joseph Smith’s purported first angelic vision through the long migration and building up of Utah was included in one hundred scenes. Church leaders, including President Joseph F. Smith, declared the film “commendable” after a special preview showing was arranged for them in Salt Lake City. Parts of the movie were actually shot in Emigration Canyon for authenticity, and the part of Brigham Young was played by one of his grandsons, Frank Young. This certainly acted to counterbalance the common screen impression held by filmgoers of a Utah trapped in the grip of a depraved theocratic government.12

10 Moving Picture World, 14 (November 9, 1912), 586. Its use was authorized by the LDS church educational program. See “List of Educational Films Recommended for the Use of the L.D.S. Schools by the Committee on Films,” Adam S. Bennion Speech Collection File on the Committee on Films, Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo.

11 Polk, Salt Lake City Directory, 1911, 837, 1240. Revier’s name disappears from the 1912 directory, although it is known that he assisted Walter Park that year in the Salt Lake filming of the apparently uncompleted The Romance of Mormonism. See “Films to Picture Mormonism’s Story,” Salt Lake Tribune, January 27, 1912. Revier’s film work for Ogden Pictures is discussed later. For more on his subsequent Hollywood career see Kenneth W. Munden, ed., The American Film Institute Catalog, Feature Films, 1921–1930 (New York, 1971). Vol. 2 lists Revier’s work in the alphabetical credit index under his name.

Still from the movie One Hundred Years of Mormonism depicts Joseph Smith translating and Martin Harris acting as scribe. Photograph from the Young Woman's Journal, January 1913.

One Hundred Years of Mormonism was released by the Utah Moving Picture Company, a firm that was actually a California-based corporation organized in the fall of 1912 by West Coast interests to finish filming the partially completed picture and exploit its subsequent exhibition. At that time it took over all rights to the photoplay held by the Ellaye Motion Picture Company and the Golden State Picture Company.

Harry A. Kelly, the president and general manager of Ellaye, had originated the idea for the film and was able to convince LDS church officials to provide assistance. Ellaye was also able to raise $50,000 in cash backing—it is not clear whether the church provided part of this—and in its contract with the Mormons agreed to give them control over the final release version in return for their aid. However, when Ellaye found it could not complete the film “under the rigid terms of the contract” it sold its interests in the picture—then three-fifths completed—to the Utah Moving Picture Company which controlled greater capital reserves.

This film is highly significant not only for its sympathetic portrait of Utah but for its manufacture and release which closely coincided with the emergence of sustained interest in the formation of a viable Utah

(February 1913), 74-80; “Mormon Pictures,” Motography, 8 (August 3, 1912), 110; and P. M. Powell, “Doings at Los Angeles,” Moving Picture World, 15 (March 1, 1913), 875.

3 P. M. Powell, “Doings at Los Angeles—The Mormon Picture,” Moving Picture World, 15 (January 18, 1913), 251. It is not clear whether Ellaye was a Salt Lake or California company. Powell calls it “the Ellay [sic] Company of Salt Lake City,” while it is described as “the Ellaye Motion Picture Company of Los Angeles” in Motography, August 3, 1912. Likely it was a California group (Ellaye-L.A.) with Salt Lake connections. No incorporation or business record could be found for Ellaye or the other firms connected with One Hundred Years of Mormonism in the Utah State Archives. There is some additional confusion as to which company officially released the picture. According to “History of ‘Mormonism’ in Picture,” Desert Eveniing News, January 25, 1913, Five Continents Exchange & Sales Co, released the film. However, other reports provide different names for the distributing organization.
motion picture industry. Following his stint with the Ellaye interests, Harry Kelly resurfaced as producer and general manager for a strictly Utah film production company. Although the Utah Motion Picture Company had a confusingly similar name to the exhibitors of *One Hundred Years of Mormonism*, the new group was quick to point out to the movie tradesmen that they had nothing to do with the older company. Kelly himself displayed some bitterness, charging publicly that the California-based Utah Moving Picture Company had failed to credit him for his work on *One Hundred Years of Mormonism* and that he alone was "the author of the scenario followed in the production." They in turn denied that they had used Kelly's screenplay:

> The makers of the film say that Nell Shipman was engaged by them to write the scenario, and that although a scenario was taken over from Mr. Kelly by the Golden State company it was found unsuitable and was not used. Mr. Kelly retorts that he employed a detective to watch the entire production of the picture and that his scenario was faithfully followed from start to finish. With both sides of the story now before them readers are invited to accept the version they prefer.  

With headquarters in Salt Lake City, the Utah Motion Picture Company planned to manufacture a variety of dramas, comedies, and educational subjects. By February 1913, under Kelly's management, they had completed two 1000-foot westerns and made a start at building a studio in the Utah capital. Plans were to utilize local settings during the summer months and then shift shooting to southern California for the winter. Despite high hopes and promise, the company soon disappeared from Utah annals.

Out-of-state producers were still shooting pictures with Utah themes. Among the more favorable was the Bison Company's two-reeler *The Romance of the Utah Pioneers* (1913) which remains the earliest known treatment of the handcart immigrants. Locals, too, continued to enter

---


15 Powell, "Doings at Los Angeles—Two 'Utah M.P. Companies,'" 667. It would appear that Kelly was exaggerating his influence to gain publicity for his new and competing firm. According to an earlier account in *Moving Picture World*, January 18, 1913, p. 251, much data was worked over to shape the story for filming. Los Angeles screen writer Nell Shipman was hired for $2,500—"a new scale"—to prepare the working scenario. This is another indication of the importance of this neglected production. The author is grateful to Nell Shipman's son, Barry, himself an industry figure, for his assistance.

16 Powell, "Doings at Los Angeles—Two 'Utah M.P. Companies,'" 667; "Roll of the States—Utah," *Motography*, December 7, 1912, p. 452. According to the second account the company was capitalized for only $2,000 which may be reason for its short life. Its first picture—"between 700 and 800 feet of views of Salt Lake City and places of interest in the vicinity"—was to be released around January 1, 1913.
Local investors failed to respond to Satchwa's appeal for funds despite the success of Big Heart. The following year several additional photoplay entrepreneurs of more lasting importance began operations within the state. Most notable among these were the Satchwa General Amusement Enterprises Company and the Arrowhead Motion Picture Company.

Local investors failed to respond to Satchwa's appeal for funds despite the success of Big Heart.

the industry. Among those in 1913 was the Utah Theatre Company. The following year several additional photoplay entrepreneurs of more lasting importance began operations within the state. Most notable among these were the Satchwa General Amusement Enterprises Company and the Arrowhead Motion Picture Company.

27 "Romance of the Utah Pioneers," Moving Picture World, 15 (January 4, 1913), 84. See Nelson, "History of Latter-day Saint Screen Portrayals," for particulars on all LDS-related motion pictures discussed in this article. See also "Roll of the States—Utah," Motography, 9 (May 17, 1913), 380. According to this report the Utah Theatre Co. was incorporated in Salt Lake and capitalized at $50,000. However, the author could find no reference to the firm in the Utah State Archives.
Although now largely forgotten, Satchwa did manage to complete a major film entitled *Big Heart* which premiered at the American Theatre in Salt Lake on November 31, 1914. The company maintained offices and a plant downtown in Salt Lake's mining exchange building. Drawing on local theatrical talent, it capitalized on the the scenery and settings in and around the city in making the picture. Satchwa's president Briant S. Young wrote the screenplay, a tale of Indian love and sacrifice in which a brave came to the aid of a young waif when she suffered under the brutal hand of a callous and intoxicated bully. Wanda Lyon, a noted Utah opera and stage star of the day, took the lead part. Others in the cast included M. V. Martin, Harry McCullough, and A. E. Moore.

Local critics gave the film all-around plaudits. The *Salt Lake Tribune* reviewer called it a "hit" and praised Victor C. Dry's cinematography and the acting ability of the principal players:

> The photography is remarkably good and there is evident ability in the entire cast. Seemingly the Satchwa has gathered together a company of people who, with more extended training, will be able to play the picture parts as well as their professional fellows of other studios... The Indian of the play is a real Cherokee, who was brought to Salt Lake from Oklahoma City to take the part which he played. There are scores of pretty incidents throughout the pictures, indicating the ability of both the actors and directors to get those things on the screen which appeal naturally to audiences.\(^19\)

This was complemented by an enthusiastic article in the *Salt Lake Telegram* which proclaimed that "the local company... bids fair to become one of the leading film companies in the country."\(^20\)

These reviews encouraged Satchwa to solicit public investment. Young placed a large advertisement in the December 3, 1914, edition of the *Salt Lake Tribune* to trumpet the potential financial returns to investors. At the time, Satchwa claimed to be producing two reels each week and estimated their net earnings for the coming year to be between $80,000 and $160,000. The local citizenry was urged to take advantage of a "Limited Number of Shares Now for Sale at $10.00 Per Share." Despite these expectations, the *Salt Lake Telegram*'s prediction of future greatness appears to have been premature. The call for local investment


\(^{19}\) "Salt Lake City Girl in Salt Lake Moving Picture Drama."

\(^{20}\) "Salt Lake Picture Ready."
had the already familiar ring of the unstable "wild-cat" film operations that have continued to plague the industry. Satchwa ultimately collapsed financially and disappeared in 1915.  

The following year Briant S. Young reemerged as the president and managing director of another film concern, the Overland Feature Film Company, with offices and studio at 3000 Seventh East in Salt Lake City. This firm, however, was also short lived and within a year disappeared from local directories.

Satchwa's prime local competitor was the Arrowhead Motion Picture Company. In many respects Arrowhead's history paralleled that of Satchwa. Incorporated in Salt Lake on October 20, 1914, with $10,000 in capital stock, the new company began auspiciously. Arrowhead's president, W. B. Kelling, quickly arranged for a studio to be established at 234-236 Edison Street and opened the new facilities for public inspection in early December. That same month also witnessed the completion of the fledgling studio's first film release, *Flanagan's Bull Pup*, "a comedy with plenty of action." Other photoplays in various stages of production included *Bond Makes Good* (an Alaskan mining tale), *The Bridge of Gold* (a society drama with some of the scenes laid in New York), and *The Gambler's Ghost* (an outdoor adventure of the Northwestern Mounted Police that was expected to become "one of the sensations of the year").

Arrowhead managed to line up a company of fourteen actors and directors and had plans to organize a second location production crew for out-of-state filming. Among those employed by the studio were William Shilling, a director with vaudeville and photoplay acting experience; Frederick Harris, an assistant director formerly with the Jesse L. Lasky and Hobart Bosworth film companies; Norman Fowler, previously associated with the Carlyle-Blackwell Favorite Players in heavy and character roles; and several local actors and actresses including Miss Venus Romney.

In order to make itself better known and perhaps counter the growing interest shown in Satchwa by state residents, Arrowhead placed

---

21 "What Does Your Money Earn?" *Salt Lake Tribune*, December 3, 1914. According to Utah, Secretary of State, Corporation Archive File No. 10953, State Capitol, Salt Lake City, Satchwa went into suspension in 1915 for failure to pay taxes.


24 "Arrowhead Company Makes First Film."
Utah Filmmakers

several full-page and a number of smaller advertisements in the Salt Lake newspapers. Satchwa had declared in its ad of December 3 that it was the “Only Company Producing In The Intermountain Area” and that it occupied “8400 square feet of space in the Mining Exchange building, with offices, laboratories, costume rooms, dressing rooms, drill rooms, etc. etc.” 25 Arrowhead in turn claimed in its December 4 notices that it was “THE ONLY ONE in this intermountain country having a studio and doing studio work” and pointedly drew attention to the fact that “This Company Has No Stock for Sale.” 26 This war of words between the two companies was particularly futile. Like Satchwa, Arrowhead was able to continue production for a short period until it succumbed to insolvency and discontinued operations in 1916. 27

The year Arrowhead folded, the Deseret Film Company incorporated in Salt Lake for the manufacture of “Motion Pictures, Animated Cartoons, Fashions, Weddings, Celebrations, Festivals, Rallies, Etc, for Advertising, Historical and Souvenir Purposes.” Although some filming of LDS church subjects was undertaken, rather than producing feature movies of its own, the company soon became a distributor of other cinéastes productions. 28

Other Utahns were also taking an interest in film. Lester Park, a Mormon, contributed much to the development of an indigenous film industry within the Beehive State. He is generally recognized as holding “the unique honor of having been the first man to show a motion picture in the state.” As early as 1905, Park attained a prominent position as a local exhibitor and became nationally known when he joined the protest against the release of A Victim of the Mormons. Park later moved to Denver where he managed the local office of the Mutual Film Corporation. In 1916 he returned to Salt Lake City to head the Photoplay Exchange Company but left that early in 1917 to play an important role in organizing the Ogden Pictures Corporation. This was the first major motion picture operation in Utah to be located outside of the capital. Albert Scowcroft, another local film pioneer, was also a prime mover in the development of Ogden Pictures as a viable concern. 29

25 “What Does Your Money Earn?”
27 Utah, Secretary of State, Corporation Archive File No. 10874.
28 Polk, Salt Lake City Directory, 1916, 253. See also subsequent directories. According to Utah, Secretary of State, Corporation Archive File No. 11755, Deseret went into suspension in 1919.
29 In 1917 Inter-Mountain Film Co. operated out of Salt Lake as a manufacturer of educational motion pictures. See Polk, Salt Lake City Directory, 1917, 441. The following year,
Establishing a nationally recognized film-producing center outside the mainstream of Hollywood and New York was a difficult undertaking. To Park, vice-president of the company, must go the credit for originating the idea of locating in Ogden. Speaking in September 1917 from Ogden Pictures' New York office, Park explained to reporters the motivation behind locating in Utah:

> When the idea of forming a producing concern with the main plant at Ogden, first occurred to me, I was prompted largely by a sense of civic pride. In placing the matter before some of the biggest capitalists of the middle west, who reside at Ogden, they readily saw the opportunity of boosting their home town and while, of course the financial backers of our institution have every natural desire to conduct our business along profitable lines, nevertheless the underlying motive that prompted their support was that Ogden would be “placed on the map.”

How much of this was hyperbole is hard to say, but Park and Scoewcroft, Ogden’s president, were able to line up respectable backing and talent. Lillian Walker, a popular actress formerly with Vitagraph, was signed amidst much fanfare to appear in a series of five-reel productions. Aaron Hoffman, a prominent screen writer who claimed to have introduced Olga Petrova to film audiences, was engaged to produce scenarios. Harry Revier, a veteran director and himself a pioneer Utah movieman, was named chief director for the new studio.

Their first production, utilizing the Alhambra Theatre in Ogden for interior shooting, was *The Lust of the Ages*, a drama in seven parts. The trade review in *Motography* was excellent and the new release was good enough to allow the young firm to shoot a second photoplay entitled *The Grain of Dust*, a society drama from the novel by David Graham Williams. One report indicates that this second picture was made in the East rather than in Ogden, with plans—apparently never realized—to

---


produce a third film in Utah. *The Grain of Dust* was belatedly distributed in 1918 by Crest Pictures which originally had an interest in the foreign exhibition rights. 32

Scowcroft notified reporters that Ogden wanted to utilize new technical advances in manufacturing and exhibiting its films that would have involved the early use of a three-dimension process. In September 1917 he told *Motography* of his company’s ambitious plans:

> We hope to reach the photoplay public with a few additional startling innovations that will convince them of the wonders that motion pictures can really perform. Several such innovations, we are advised by our attorneys, are patentable and we have already applied for patent rights on them. When I state that I hope to present them to the world, through the medium of Ogden Pictures, a stereoscopic form of photography that will present the characters on the screen almost as if they were in the flesh and on the stage, you can well appreciate what I have in mind. 33

Unfortunately, little is now known about the inventions mentioned by Scowcroft or the later work of Ogden Pictures. The company officially suspended operations in 1919, but Scowcroft’s untimely death in November 1918 likely had ended whatever chances Ogden had to remain in


33 “Pleased with Ogden Pictures,” 629.

*The American* was an early Salt Lake City movie house on Main Street. *Utah State Historical Society* photograph by Earl Lyman, Bennett Collection, gift of Inkley’s.
film production. In less than a year the company disappeared from Ogden city directories, apparently the victim of financial instability. Now only an obscure footnote in the history of American cinema, Ogden Pictures nevertheless represented the first successful local attempt to create a nationally recognized studio outside the Utah capital.34

A number of other Utahns entered the industry in a variety of positions during the silent era. *The Child and the Beast*, made in 1915 as part of a national prohibitionist campaign, starred Judge Willis Brown of Salt Lake City. The photoplay dramatized four cases appearing before his court in which alcohol proved the downfall of otherwise decent people. William H. Swanson and William W. Hodkinson emerged from the state to make national reputations as film company heads. Notable industry figures were such famous directors as James Cruze (*The Covered Wagon, The Pony Express*), and Frank Borzage, whose 1927 *Seventh Heaven* won him an Academy Award. Among the many other actors, actresses, and directors with Utah backgrounds one finds Violet Bird, Edwina Booth, Betty Compson, Luke Cosgrave, Hazel Dawn, John Gilbert, Reed Howes, DeWitt C. Jennings, Eleanor Lawson, Willard Mack, Norman Peck, Marjorie Rambeau, Mack Swain, Mary Thurman, and Loretta Young.35

34 Scowcroft was born in Britain in 1870 and came to Utah as a child with his LDS-convert parents. His interest in motion pictures led him to push construction of the Liberty and American theatres in Salt Lake, the Alhambra Theatre in Ogden, and other showhouses in Utah and Idaho. He started Ogden Pictures Corp. in 1917. See “Albert Scowcroft Dies of Pneumonia,” Deseret Evening News, November 30, 1918; “Albert Scowcroft, One of Ogden’s Most Prominent Business Men, is Dead,” Ogden Standard, November 30, 1918; and Noble Warrum, ed., Utah Since Statehood—Historical and Biographical, 4 vols. (Chicago and Salt Lake City, 1920), 4:546. Between March 3 and July 23, 1917, there are nearly forty references to Ogden Pictures in the Ogden Standard. See also Polk, *Ogden City Directory*, 1918, 308, and Utah, Secretary of State, Corporation Archive File No. 12524.


In addition, special mention should be made of the Clawson brothers, Chester and Shirley, who were “the motivating force” behind continued LDS church interest in motion pictures during the silent years. Much of their work is now of great historical interest and forms an invaluable documentary film record of early twentieth-century Mormon activities and leadership. Their feature film plans never reached completion, however, and a tragic fire in 1929 killed one of the brothers and ended their active work in motion pictures. Fortunately, copies of much of their exposed film survived the fire and are now preserved in the LDS church archives.36

Yet another local motion picture company had its genesis as early as May 26, 1927, when the Deseret News welcomed the temporary stop-over of a large contingent of screen executives following a Hollywood trade convention:

We were glad to have these men with us if only for a short time. Moving picture people as a class are keen observers and rare judges of beauty and a tribute from them is a compliment of value and one much to be desired. Come again gentlemen.37

This extremely solicitous attitude by the church-owned paper reflected serious interest by Mormon authorities in having a motion picture studio situated in Salt Lake. This interest was likely fostered by the continuing negative film portrayals of Utah Mormonism.38

Within ten months of the Deseret News editorial, the Pioneer Film Corporation, reportedly capitalized at $200,000, was operating in Salt Lake. Although Norman L. Sims was named president of the new studio, the creative force behind it appears to have been George Edward Lewis, a rather obscure Hollywood producer best known for his work on the Alaskan-made The Cheechakos.39 Lewis cited twenty-one reasons for his move to Utah, including the observation that the state

... actually has more days of sunshine than southern California, making it possible to go forward with production throughout the year.

36 For details on the Clawsons see: David Kent Jacobs, “The History of Motion Pictures Produced by the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints” (M.A. thesis, Brigham Young University, 1967), 11–31; Utah, Secretary of State, Corporation Archive File No. 15525; Polk, Salt Lake City Directory, 1914, 245, 1158; Polk, Salt Lake City Directory, 1915, 132, 1137; Polk, Salt Lake City Directory, 1919, 786, 1048; “Motion Picture Producer Dies as Blasts Wreck Laboratory,” Salt Lake Tribune, October 24, 1929; “S. L. Film Blast Kills 1, Traps 3, Gas Hurts Many,” Deseret News, October 23, 1929.


39 “Film Producers Decide on S. L. as Permanent Home,” Deseret News, March 24, 1928. The American Film Institute Catalog credits Lewis with only the 1925 Arrow production North of Nome for which he suggested the theme but did not produce or direct.
Another was that, as Utah has produced more stage and screen talent than any other state, a producing company here could draw upon this source of talent to advantage. Utah's great variety of scenery and the wide range of state's industries, he pointed out, would make it possible to make any sort of picture without travelling great distances in search of suitable background. Illustrating this point, he said the Great Salt Lake would do as well in filming marine scenes as the Pacific Ocean.40

The company announced plans to build an elaborate twenty-acre studio "in some picturesque region on the outskirts of Salt Lake, which would be as complete in every way as any in Hollywood." By November 1928 it was announced that a twelve-acre site in Sugar House had been acquired. J. G. Sargent, representing the moviemen, told reporters that Pioneer would specialize in westerns and films "dealing with the romantic side of western life." 41

Specific announcements of the new group's plans for filming appeared in the March 24, 1928, Salt Lake papers. First up was a feature entitled The Exodus—also referred to as The Exodus of the New World—which would dramatize the journey of the Mormon pioneers across the plains in 1847, from the Missouri River to Salt Lake Valley. Two grandsons of Brigham Young were enlisted to aid in the production. Levi Edgar Young was to observe the making of the picture to assure its historical accuracy. Richard W. Young, then president of the Utah Bar Association, was named as counsel and placed on the board of directors. 42

There were high hopes for Pioneer. Lewis managed to acquire some unusual footage showing the stampede of fifteen hundred head of buffalo, and this was to be later intercut into the picture to give it dramatic punch. Lewis even submitted his proposed scenario to a number of prominent Salt Lake residents, including LDS church authorities, who gave him their approval. To bolster anticipated box office, popular Hollywood stars Marie Prevost and Ben Lyon were imported and backed by a supporting cast that included Andrus (Anders) Randolph, Jimmie Mason, Russell Simpson, and Jean the Shepherd Dog.

Actual filming was completed by November 1928, and the editing subsequently accomplished in Hollywood. The picture excited national interest, including columns by Louella Parsons and others. Lewis proudly addressed the Salt Lake City Chamber of Commerce that month and promised the new studio facility would soon be a reality. He told his

40 "Pioneer Trek to be Filmed in Salt Lake," Salt Lake Tribune, March 24, 1928.
41 Ibid. "Film Studio Soon Promised," ibid., November 23, 1928.
42 "Pioneer Trek to be Filmed in Salt Lake."
audience that The Exodus itself was nearly ready and noted that “no less than $55,000 of outside capital” was spent within the state on the production. Despite the fact that the film was nearing completion, its release timing was poor. With “talkies” beginning to sweep the country, silent films began to suffer noticeably at the box office. Spokesmen for Pioneer talked of adding a sound track to The Exodus, but this was never done, probably because of a lack of funds.43

In the interim Pioneer representatives previewed a single-reel documentary of Salt Lake City before interested civic officials and announced that plans for a national distribution network for its films were complete.44 Money problems continued to plague the company, however, and Pioneer’s directors began to look for alternate modes of financing. Accordingly, an attractive illustrated advertisement appeared in the Christmas edition of the Deseret News which urged the public to take advantage of the “New Christmas Gift Plan” and purchase Pioneer Film stock. The certificates themselves were offered in units of sixty dollars each. These included one share of preferred stock listed at fifty dollars and five shares of common stock at two dollars each. Prospective investors were urged to consider the “real value” such a holiday gift could be for a loved one. The ad also pointed out additional benefits:

Owners of Pioneer Film stock will be partners with us in our plan for boosting and advertising Utah to the world. THE EXODUS tells a gripping, thrilling, heart appealing story of Utah’s early days. It portrays the heroic historic journey of Brigham Young and his group of sturdy pioneers over plains, mountains and deserts to Salt Lake in 1847.

Buffalo stampedes, Indian attacks, crossing rivers and other streams when there were no bridges, marauding gangs of horse thieves, thrills that none but our forefathers have ever experienced, all interwoven with a wonderful love story—these and scores of others are gripping features of THE EXODUS.

The story will be flashed on screens throughout the world. No single agency will do as much to advertise our matchless state in 1929.

The Exodus will be ready for universal release early in January. Why not join our happy family of Utah boosters and participate in the profits of the Exodus? 45

Despite these expectations, the picture was not to receive its world premiere until March 2, 1929, when it opened under the new title of All

---

44 “Salt Lake, Utah, Scenic Film Shows Officials,” Deseret News, November 13, 1928.
45 “Buy Pioneer Film Stock,” ibid., December 22, 1928.
The makers of Corianton signed an exclusive contract with the Tabernacle Choir in 1929. However, the severe economic conditions of the period led to the collapse of the company, and the film was never completed.

*Faces West* at the Victory Theatre in downtown Salt Lake. Enhanced by an impressive twenty-six-piece orchestral and vocal prologue and the organ accompaniment of Jewell Cox, *All Faces West* nevertheless proved a great financial disappointment to the Utah moviemakers, despite public statements to the contrary. Although it obtained good local reviews, the film maintained only a single week run, which was about average for the period.

*Salt Lake Tribune, March 2, 1929*: “Utah-Made Film Has Premier at Victory Theater,” *ibid.,* February 24, 1929; “Utah Picture Holds Interest at Victory,” *Deseret News,* March 4, 1929. *All Faces West* was also the title of a subsequent musical play by Roland Parry made popular in Utah in the early 1950s. As Parry wrote the theme song for the original film production, there is a clear relationship between the two.
During the Salt Lake screenings, another advertisement appeared in the *Deseret News* which again urged investment in the Pioneer Film Corporation. Response was similarly disappointing. By September Pioneer faced an equity suit for $150,000 on its failure to pay interest on money owed a Chicago businessman, Max E. Miller. A receiver was named later that month, and the company went into suspension.\(^{47}\) Within a month the stock market crash ended all chance for national or international distribution of *All Faces West*. So completely has this photoplay been lost that even the generally authoritative *American Film Institute Catalog* failed to include it in its listings.

The Pioneer Film Corporation at least managed to complete and release one feature and a short documentary. The other contemporary Utah attempt to enter the picture business was not even able to manage this. This less successful film company was the Corianton Corporation, actually incorporated in Delaware, but with interests intimately connected to the Intermountain state.

Public attention was first directed towards this latest film enterprise when the *Deseret News* announced in November 1929 that a major motion picture version of *Corianton*, a story based upon ancient American characters found in the Book of Mormon, was soon to enter production. *Corianton* had earlier been a popular Utah stage play and had made its author, Orestes Bean, a well-known figure among the state’s dramatists. The venture was to be jointly produced by Lester Park, formerly associated with Ogden Pictures; his brothers, Byron and Allen Park; and author Bean.\(^{48}\)

The Corianton group managed to sign an exclusive contract with the Tabernacle Choir to provide music to accompany the proposed photoplay. Negotiations took over a year and a half to complete, and only through the enthusiasm of Bishop David A. Smith—president of the choir—were LDS church officials convinced that the magnitude of the undertaking warranted use of the singers. Edgar Stillman Kelley completed the accompanying musical score which occupied “twelve wonder-


\(^{48}\)“Film to Be Made from Corianton,” *Deseret News*, November 2, 1929; “Theatre Sidelights from ‘Corianton,’ Forthcoming Talking Picture,” *ibid.*, November 9, 1929. Orestes Utah Bean’s *Corianton, An Aztec Romance* (Salt Lake City, ca.1904) was based upon Book of Mormon characters popularized in a serial appearing in the LDS publication *Contributor* in 1889. For additional background on the play see Cosgrave, *Theater Tonight*, 136–39, 160, 177–78, and 182.
Watercolor rendering of a proposed set for Corianton depicts ancient American structure based on the Book of Mormon story. Courtesy of Edward Hoggan.

ful records.” It also appears that some filming of the choir was embarked upon.49

Apparently, it was the musical nature of the picture—which was to incorporate the new “all talking, all singing” format—that attracted church support. For example, the Deseret News editorialized:

Though it will take over a year in the making “Corianton” when produced will be made one of the outstanding masterpieces of its kind in America, principally because of its musical features. The entire production is already financed and advance preparations are already underway.50

Despite the claim of fiscal solidarity, the market decline had its effect. Byron Park, general sales and financial manager for the proposed musical, took a full-page advertisement in the December 21, 1929, Deseret News to explain the situation and respond to “rumors...circulated—some innocently—some maliciously” about Corianton’s financial health.51 Perhaps influenced by the failure only months earlier of Pioneer Film Corporation, Park felt constrained to deny that Corianton was a “MORMON” enterprise or is being financed or sponsored by the Church as one of its activities. Nothing could be further from the

49 “A Frank Statement by Byron Park,” Deseret News, December 21, 1929. According to Park’s obituary he “was the first to make a motion picture recording of the Tabernacle Choir.” See “Funeral Rites Held Tuesday for Byron Park,” Deseret News, August 22, 1950, and “Ex-Salt Laker Dies after Coast Crash,” Salt Lake Tribune, August 23, 1950. Because these accounts do not definitely state that the filming was connected with Corianton there is still doubt as to when this occurred. For further information see Jack Sears, “Anthony C. Lund and Tracy Y. Cannon Sponsor New Movie Star,” Deseret News, December 21, 1929.

50 “Film to Be Made from Corianton.”

51 “A Frank Statement by Byron Park.”
truth. The Church is not in the Motion Picture business. And it has never been asked to finance or sponsor "CORIANTON" . . . "CORIANTON" stands on its own merits.\textsuperscript{52}

In the face of these denials, Park deftly announced that "owing to changed financial conditions during the past few months brought about by causes well known to the public, a limited number of capital stock of the Corianton Corporation for which finances were pledged, cannot be taken up by the original subscribers." \textsuperscript{53} He then urged readers who desired to participate in "this great production in its All-Talking Motion Picture form" to send for detailed information as to how they could invest $100 or more. His appeal proved ineffective. In May 1930 trading in the company's stock was suspended in New York, and the whole production died, a casualty of the new economic conditions.\textsuperscript{54}

Thus, in the silent era's waning hour, ended the last serious attempt to establish a motion picture production company with close Utah ties. No comparable activity would resume until the late postwar period, although in the interim outside movie interests would rediscover in Utah's striking scenic vistas a desirable backdrop for a host of western and action pictures. Even today Hollywood continues to make a significant number of theatrical and television productions on location in the state.\textsuperscript{55}

What, then, can be said about Utah's pre-1930 film industry? First, local interest in manufacturing and distributing moving pictures was pronounced. Although hampered by limited financing and remoteness from the major moviemaking centers of Hollywood and New York, Utah producers were still able to attract considerable national attention. Additionally, while it is true that these first attempts to establish local studios were largely failures and peripheral to popular acceptance of the picture business as a whole, it should be recognized that the state contributed its share to the development of a viable American film industry. And finally, despite the fact that few of the motion pictures made in Utah by local producers can be considered of lasting pictorial import, they do represent an aspect of cinema and state history that retains a continuing fascination and interest.

\textsuperscript{52} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{53} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{54} "Bars Sale of Stock in Talkie Venture," \textit{New York Times}, May 18, 1930, and "Mormon Talkie Company Stopped from Stock Sale," \textit{New York City Zits}, May 24, 1930. According to Utah, Secretary of State, Corporation Archive File No. 19209, the Corianton Corp. remained alive in Utah records until April 4, 1932, when it was suspended for failure to pay state taxes.
\textsuperscript{55} Nelson, "History of Utah Film," 36-61.
Three Women and the Life of the Mind

BY MAUREEN URSENBACH

Plaster sculpture of Eliza R. Snow. Utah State Historical Society photograph, Morgan Collection.
IN THE HAMLET OF Dernford Dale, near the university town of Cambridge, England, a dressmaker employed by a lady of the upper middle class let slip to her mistress that for some years she had been a Latter-day Saint, a Mormon. She bore firm testimony, and after an initially explosive reaction, the lady listened, called for the elders, and with one of her daughters was baptized. That was in 1850. Some three years later the seamstress was dead, killed in a steamer explosion, and together the lady, her four children, and their still unconverted father were among the new immigrant arrivals in Great Salt Lake City.

What was there here for such a woman as this Hannah Tapfield King? She was cultured, educated, and creative; she had published two small books in England and frequently wrote poetry and long letters. Gregarious, elitist, but no longer wealthy—her husband had used their last money to pay fifty dollars to the Perpetual Emigration Fund and to buy a small house—Hannah King learned to cope with poor furnishings and food shortages. Her family, with only one teenaged son still unmarried, required little of her time. To fill her day she could sew, cook, and visit, the womanly occupations, but with other women she felt out of place. She recounted in her diary one attempt at female conviviality:

Spent the afternoon at Sister Orson Spencer's. Met there Sister Benson and Sarah Pratt. Sister Wienal went with me. Enjoyed it pretty well, but did not like the feeling of these women. They want to be something. If they would be content to be what they are or might be, they might be intelligent, agreeable women. They dared not come out on that strain before me, so they kept hinting and dabbling. Silly women! They only exposed their ignorance and ill manners, and what do they know of the English, or English society? ¹

The afternoon had obviously been a social failure. These were intelligent women, intimidated, perhaps purposely or self-defensively, by one of their kind. It happens continually. The episode does suggest a social problem which goes beyond four women on one tense afternoon. In the heterogeneous society of the frontier settlement it could hardly be expected that, however intelligent the women might be, they would all be intellectuals, eager to discover, express, and refresh their own thoughts. What was there for any woman of intellect in Utah society in the 1850s?

¹ Hannah Tapfield King, Journal, April 22, 1857, p. 141, typescript, Archives Division, Historical Department, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City.
There was a kind of intellectual sisterhood, for one thing. Women of similar interests, then as now, were naturally drawn together: new mothers clustered to talk about their babies; musical women congregated to sing and play; seamstresses gathered around the quilting frames; and women who lived the life of the mind sought each other. Hannah King recorded simply but significantly one such meeting which took place just a few weeks after her arrival in the valley:

Wednesday. Went with Sister Cook to call on Sister Snow. I had long heard of her by name. Now saw her face to face. I like her and believe we shall be sisters in spirit... .

That these two women, Hannah Tapfield King and Eliza Roxcy Snow, did become intellectual sisters is affirmed in the poems each wrote and dedicated to the other and a photograph in which the two pose together. Poetry they shared, things of the mind and the spirit. Hannah wrote to Eliza in 1861:

My Spirit bends instinctively to thine:
And at thy feet I fain would sit and learn
Like Paul of old before Gamaliel

In some respects Hannah King became a poetic disciple of Eliza Snow as she had been of poetess Eliza Cook in England. She recorded her immigration to the valley in a long verse, and later in her life published an epic of some eighteen hundred lines eulogizing the Prophet Joseph Smith. Her little volume Songs of the Heart, printed in Salt Lake City in 1879, contains several poems dedicated to friends in the gospel in a style similar to those that filled Eliza Snow's volumes. Unlike Eliza, however, Hannah's main poetic thrust remained the semiconfessional revelation of her personal response to experience.

More than just poetry and intellectual sisterhood encouraged Hannah King and Eliza Snow in the things of the mind. In 1854 at Lorenzo Snow's hall they participated in the newly organized Polysophical Society whose avowed purpose was, as Eliza expressed it in an opening poem, "to impress the mind / With heavenly wisdom and with classic lore." The group met every other Tuesday at Eliza's brother's commodious house until they became too numerous, at which time they moved to the Seventies Hall or, occasionally, to the Social Hall.

2 Ibid., p. 117.
3 Hannah Tapfield King, "Lines, Affectionally addressed to Sister Eliza," photocopy of holograph, LDS Archives.
4 Deseret News, January 11, 1855.
In her biography of Lorenzo, Eliza described a typical gathering as “a magnificent moral, intellectual and spiritual picnic.” The picture is delightful for its quaint ceremoniousness: ladies and gents in full finery—as far removed from frontier dress as they could manage, retrenchment not yet having been called for. Seated around a hall sparsely decorated with what few refinements the community offered, they listened to each other recite original poetry, perform on instruments, expound extemporaneously, and, on rare and special occasions, sing in tongues. A master of ceremonies apparently conducted the exercises and “a small lad, wearing an appropriate badge indicative of his office,” carried notes from the master of ceremonies to members of the group as their turn to perform approached. All this began in the winter of 1854, just seven years after the arrival of the first settlers in the Great Basin wilderness.

Eliza Snow and Hannah King were not the only women involved in the Polysophical Society. Zina Diantha Young attended, and Helen Mar Whitney and Sarah Kimball, to name a few. In a time of general male domination of things intellectual and in the context of a priesthood-directed society, the women were there as equals, performing as well as listening with their brothers and husbands.

One such woman was Martha Spence Heywood, not mentioned in any of the accounts of the society—most likely because of her own hesitant nature—but who did attend the Polysophical meetings briefly. Her life, like those of Hannah King and Eliza Snow, demonstrates a strong-willed independence. Against her parents’ wishes, she left Dublin, a sickly girl of twenty-two, to follow her three brothers to America. As she wrote later:

My father’s anger was very severe, my mother’s more silent but deeper, and in a few months I left without one cent to defray the expenses of a journey across the Atlantic, then October 1834 in my 23rd year. I landed in New York with a debt of $40—and not a cent to pay the first week’s board. But even in a common boarding house we were regarded (a sister having accompanied me and in the same predicament) as worthy of sympathy, and instead of taking our little items of jewelry there was exertions made to find us sewing to pay our expense.6

6 Eliza R. Snow Smith, Biography and Family Record of Lorenzo Snow... (Salt Lake City, 1884), 250 ff.

Both Hannah and Eliza contributed to the society often. The musical offerings were diverse; mention is made of two pianos being played by ladies of the group, half a dozen violins, bass, guitar, some woodwinds, and an occasional bagpipe.

6 Martha Spence Heywood to Emmeline Free Young, December 9, 1855, Brigham Young Collection, LDS Archives.
Martha must have felt some compunction at having so adamantly opposed her parents’ wishes, for within three years she was back in Dublin, attempting to mollify her mother to her leaving again. Her words must have seemed more poison than balm: Martha felt long afterwards that her mother’s death shortly after her second leavetaking resulted from that event.

From the point of Martha’s return to upstate New York her story follows the familiar pattern of hearing the Mormons’ message, converting, and joining the Saints at Kanesville, Iowa, and then, in the care of one Joseph Heywood moving on to Utah. Martha’s duties on the trail were unfamiliar to her: she admitted later that she had never washed her own clothes until she was thirty years old, nor had she ever cooked or kept house before her arrival in Utah. During the trek west, Martha saw and recorded her experiences from an isolation imposed by her care of Heywood’s sickly nephew: “How much would I not give at times to see some choice spirits to mingle with as I was wont to do in past times,” she recorded in her loneliness. But isolation also brought occasional respite, when she could withdraw into the world of her thoughts. “Enjoying my mind,” she called it. She could read occasionally, which she described as “a relief to my general feelings.” And she could write: “I have composed and written some verses to Mrs. Johnston and two pieces for the Guardian, besides some others for myself.” The line suggests that writing for publication in the Frontier Guardian, the Saints’ newspaper, edited by Orson Hyde in Kanesville, was common practice for Martha, but a search of the volume covered by her stay there and her trek west reveals nothing bearing her name. However, about half the poems printed are unsigned, and some two or three bear enough similarity to her one extant poem and to the themes and ideas of her diary, that they could well be hers.

With the wagon train’s arrival in Salt Lake Valley, Martha was installed, to her initial disappointment, in the Heywood household where she felt a greater kinship to Serepta, Joseph’s wife, than to the man himself. Nevertheless, when Joseph proposed marriage to Martha and removal to a new settlement in the south, she accepted, apparently not the least regretting leaving the social and burgeoning cultural life of Salt Lake City in 1850. During her brief stay in the city she had been involved in two “exhibitions,” or recitals of dramatic readings, and the founding

\[\text{Martha Spence Heywood, Diary 1850–56, August 31, 1850, typescript, Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City.}\]
\[\text{Ibid., September 22, 1850.}\]
Three Women

of an Elocution Society. Something must have gone amiss with that latter enterprise—perhaps Mr. Barlow’s unexpurgated reading of Maw Worm, to which the audience reacted in such a way that Martha condemned them as being “rather fastidious on account of their ignorance”—for just before her leaving, she recorded:

Elder Kimball called here on Monday to express to me his wish that I would withdraw from the Elocution Society, that it might be the means of breaking up the Society or drawing away his wives—I tendered my resignation on Tuesday evening and was retained an honorary member.⁹

Even so, she could not be long without some sort of intellectual association: before she left for the Salt Creek settlement (Nephi, Utah) with her husband, she tried, with Brother Hall, the missionary who had converted her, to “get up” a French class.¹⁰ The project failed for lack of books. Once in Salt Creek, she participated with enthusiasm in the founding of the Mount Nebo Literary Association—this amidst the labor of building a city and warring with Indians, of keeping school and becoming mother to a son and a daughter.

So passed the time in Nephi, until Martha’s weakness, her daughter’s death, and her husband’s release as president of the settlement brought them back to Salt Lake City in early spring 1856. In April she recorded in her diary a visit with Sister Eliza Snow, and May found her attending the “Pollysophical” Society. On Friday evening, May 23, she heard her name called in the society, and the following week she made her debut as contributor, reading a piece she had written some years earlier. Subsequently Martha wrote and presented other pieces to the society.

The Polysophical Society did not long survive. As often happens in a controlled community, suspicion was cast upon intellectual activities. Brigham Young had been a sometime participant in the group’s affairs, but even his patronage was not enough to protect the society from suspicion. By 1856 reformation was sweeping the church, and Jedediah Grant, counselor to Brigham Young, was rooting out evil wherever he saw it, or thought he saw it. Hannah King observed:

*Ibid., January 12, 1851.

* Ibid.
Brother Grant has done some strong preaching lately, and declared the Polysophical Society was "a stink in his nostrils." Brother Kimball called out, "and in mine!" Said there was an adulterous spirit in it!! Well, there may be, for he says there is, and probably he understands it. To me it all seemed good and nice, with of course a little vanity and folly, and that one sees in the tabernacle and everywhere.  

At any rate, the Polysophical Society, at least the charter group in Salt Lake City, was replaced less than two years after its inception by a more orthodox organization, a Deseret Theological Class under the direction of President Young, in which the original Polysophical organizers were reduced to doorkeepers and the whole, after a season of preachings, "perished in the arms of the reforming agency."  

But the life of the mind will not be stifled. Other groups had formed, and continued to form, some of intellectual bent. There were the Universal Scientific Society and the Literary and Musical Assembly. As settlements sprang up throughout the Great Basin, so did societies of the mind —lecture societies, recitation groups, and the like. Women formed a large part of the membership in such groups, as participants and as audience. Not all of the offerings of such groups were actuated by predominately intellectual thrust; often they represented attempts to teach and learn principles of practical use in taming a wilderness and nurturing a growing economy. Towards the academic mentality were the dramatic societies which fostered such enthusiasm for the stage that playmaking be-

11 King Journal, October 8, 1856.  
12 Henry W. Naisbitt, "'Polysophical' and 'Mutual,'" Improvement Era, 2 (1899), 746–47. Naisbitt had himself been one of the directors of the Polysophical, and his article reveals a tinge of bitterness at its forced demise.
came not only the most respectable but also the most popular cultural expression in the valley. But unashamedly intellectual were some of the recitations and lectures which encouraged creative participation and stimulated mental involvement. Occasionally speakers would challenge audiences even beyond their comprehension, as for example a lecture on the topic of “Light” delivered by Orson Pratt in 1857. Again Hannah King was there with her female companions.

It was a very long, scientific lecture, too much so for the audience. Sister Neslen said it was total darkness to a good many, and I felt we were not prepared for so much “light,” but that to all rightly constituted minds it was a spur to cultivate our thinking faculties more, and it showed us how little we knew. . . . We were not home ’till a quarter before midnight. The lecturer was so carried away he forgot all time . . . .

There was, then, an intellectual life in early pioneer Utah. Education per se had not caught up with the move west, but the life of the mind found root and grew, independent of formal cultivation. Schools for children had been established in all parts of the city, with plans underway to build a schoolhouse in each ward by 1850. The advertisements in the Millennial Star and Frontier Guardian prior to that time, claiming the availability of tutelage in Hebrew, Greek, Latin, French, German, Italian, and English in the valley, were most likely inflated propaganda designed to encourage the immigrants; certainly not much could have been going on in the city if Martha Spence Heywood’s hopes of a single class in French were dashed for want of a few books in that language. As for the University of Deseret, which announced the appointment of its Board of Regents in 1850, it offered no more than occasional lectures until 1866, and even then opened its doors as a sort of business school. In the interim there were Parent Schools, limited attempts at adult education and teacher training, and in 1860 a Union Academy opened its doors to men and boys with the promise that “so soon as we have a suitable building, we intend to open an academy for females.” In all, the educational landscape was rather barren, especially for women.

Not that Utah was any more prejudiced against education for women than was the East. Educational opportunities for both men and women here lagged far behind those east of the Mississippi, and schools for women trailed behind schools for men in both places. Women in the East had had their own seminaries since the turn of the century, and in 1836 Eliza Snow, had she the inclination, could have been admitted

---

King Journal, May 27, 1857.
with her brother Lorenzo to Oberlin College, the first school in the United States to open its doors as a coeducational college. But in fact there was in Utah during the early pioneer period little more stimulation for women than what these diarists have recorded: the private meetings of the mind and the occasional gatherings in groups.

In 1857 John Hyde, an apostate Mormon, described in his exposé *Mormonism: Its Leaders and Designs* his view of the intellectual life among the women of Mormon Utah. Taking into consideration his obvious bias, but also realizing that he was associated at least peripherally with the Polysophical Society, and, from its inception, with the Literary and Musical Assembly, we can draw from his description a suggestion of the female intelligentsia, complete with his view of the forces at work to restrict such mental activities among the women:

> Women who are taught to believe that the “husband’s power is absolute,” and that all “Their sins committed in obedience to their husband’s commands, are borne by their husbands,” care nothing for self-education, and as little for the instruction of their daughters. The few persons who go there, who are a little superior, are mocked. They are the “speckled sheep”; the hearts which still cling to “Gentile customs and notions of things.” “They look back to the fleshpots of Egypt.” “The leaven of the gospel has only partially worked in them.” Their apostacy is predicted, and any influence they might obtain, crushed out. Oases in a desert, a thousand hands heap sand upon them.\(^4\)

The picture is an extreme one, to be sure. Yet in the diaries of such women of intellect as Hannah Tapfield King and Martha Spence Heywood can be found the suggestions of just such attitudes on the part of their sisters. Hannah King seems proudly to disdain such antiintellectualism; her writing continued, and the *Woman’s Exponent*—from its inception in 1872 to her death—carried her poetry and prose. Of Martha Heywood’s intellectual pursuits there is little trace; she seems to sink into the common fabric of the Mormon society.

John Hyde continued with his description of Mormon women thinkers and the pressures imposed upon them.

The women who endeavor to make a reputation for mind are the most rabidly fanatical. Miss Eliza R. Snow, the Mormon poetess, a very talented woman, but outrageously bigoted, and one or two kindred souls, are the nuclei for all the female intellect at Salt Lake. Let any recant from their creed, or oppose it, she and her band of second Amazons crush the intrepid one down.\(^5\)

---


\(^5\) Ibid., 128.
Three Women

What of this Eliza? Was she, as Hyde suggests, a one-woman inquisition, snuffing out wicked intellectualizing among her sisters in Zion? Or was she, as Hannah suggests, a haven to whom they could turn for approval of their academic and creative interests? Perhaps she was the link which held them, and apparently much of the female intellectual life of the early church, together. What of her own mind? Of her spiritual abilities we are aware—accounts of her speaking in tongues, her blessing of the women, her prophesying are frequent. Of her organizational ability there is no question—every auxiliary organization of the Mormon church, with the exception of the Sunday School, bears the impress of her influence, and she may well be listed as a founder of Relief Society, Primary, and the Mutual Improvement Association of the church. Of her creative abilities two published volumes of poetry and another couple of books' worth of unpublished poems stand witness. But was she an intellectual? Did she explore ideas for their own sakes? Did she, like Martha, "enjoy her mind?" Or like Hannah, seek out the company of those with whom she could talk of matters on a level a cut above that of the common conversation?

That she was intelligent, there is no doubt; as a child she was probably even precocious. Her childhood, spent in the barely civilized Western Reserve area of Ohio, was enriched by the New England background of her parents, the schools in the community (established just in time for her attendance and taught occasionally by her father), and the presence in the settlement of other relatively cultured folk. She could hardly be said, as one early biographer implied, to have been "educated at the best schools," but the education which shows through her early writings was by no means skimpy, in either the absorption of knowledge or the refining of skills.

Early in her formal schooling Eliza began to verify. She has told of the confusion of a teacher attempting to grade her composition in geography written in rhymed stanzas. By young adulthood she was responding to news of world affairs by composing verses for the county newspaper, the Ravenna Western Courier, and later for the Ohio Star. Her early poetry bespeaks both an awareness of the larger world and an amazing wealth of vocabulary and rhetorical skill with which to respond to that world. She must have been a prolific reader to have been as versed in classical mythology and contemporary history as her poetry reveals her to have been. Her initial approach to religion reflects both her parents' liberality and her own inquiring mind. Although nominally of the
Campbellite Baptist congregation, the Snows welcomed to their parlor whatever religionists might present themselves. As early as 1829 Eliza heard from one of these of the discovery of the gold Book of Mormon plates and the reported accompanying visitations of angels. Convinced that it must be a hoax, "too good to be true," she nonetheless sat, a quiet if skeptical observer, when Joseph Smith himself was a visitor at her father's house the following winter. She later recalled: "As he sat warming himself I scrutinized his face as closely as I could without attracting his attention, and decided that his was an honest face." Her conversion to Joseph's "honest face" and her acceptance of his new gospel were separated by five years of continued study on Eliza's part. The recurring visits of the former Campbellite Sidney Rigdon, now a disciple of Smith, and the long discussions which doubtless took place in the Snow parlor, helped to keep Eliza's attention focused on the Mormon claim. At any rate, it was a process of study and comparison, of "proving all things," which brought Eliza to the point of baptism into the Mormon faith in 1835.

Eliza's way of proving the claims was not wholly intellectual. In an undated, unpublished poem she expressed the rejection of traditional patterns of proof and logic in favor of the subjective approaches of the romantics:

Fain would I leave tradition's dark abode—    
Unfetter'd, traverse Inspiration's road. . .    
A sure light, my faltering steps, shall guide    
To brighter realms, where nobler joys abide. 17

This seeming rejection of reason in favor of inspiration may be no more than just a response to the romanticism which was then moving towards its belated heyday in American letters. Eliza may have been reading Wordsworth and Shelley, the English prototypes of the romantic spirit. But at the same time, she was becoming deeply involved with prophetic religion that depends almost exclusively on subjective responses in its initial appeal for credibility.

Despite her acceptance of prophecy, Eliza continued to fall back on reason and logic to approach learning. Depending less on her own mental processes to find out truth, she accepted as truth that which came, however irrationally, from the lips of the prophet and then summoned rea-

Three Women

son and the rational disciplines in its support. Her intellectual gift seemed to be increasingly one of ordering disparate elements into a neat theology.

Soon after her conversion Eliza was caught in the persecutions of the Saints at Kirtland, then the Missouri settlement at Adam-ondi-Ahman, and finally Illinois. In Lima, Illinois, near the new settlement at Nauvoo, she supported herself and her sister with sewing, meanwhile writing lines which were published in the Quincy Whig. In these poems logic is brought to the defense of faith, and reason is brought to the defense of persecuted people, as in "Prejudice—What Is It?" with its subdued pleading to the Gentile Illinoisians for latitude towards the Mormons.

Once in Nauvoo, she found time for study, for reflection, for retirement "when there's nobody here but Eliza and I." There she wrote some of the still sung hymns of the Mormons: "Awake, Ye Saints of God, Awake!" and the perennial standard, "O My Father." Eliza's mind committed itself to the purposes of the prophet and the perfecting of the Saints. Games of the intellect were cast aside; her poetry must serve the purpose of the gathering, of the exodus, of the recouping, and of the building of the kingdom of God on earth.

Following her arrival in Utah in 1847, Eliza would seem to have had time again for her mind. Not until 1867 did she get caught up in the organizational whirlwind which filled the rest of her life with all-consuming responsibilities. How did she occupy herself during that long interim? One looks for her in all the likely places and some of the unlikely ones and finds her in such groups as the Polysophical Society and with such
associates as Martha Spence Heywood and Hannah Tapfield King. Was this her return to the life of the mind? Might she have felt the need for a reemphasis on the intellectual disciplines? Hardly, in the light of her contributions. First, the Polysophical was not her idea but her brother Lorenzo's. Second, a look at the pieces she wrote for the group reveals no intellectual speculation but rather a didactic lecturing to the Saints on such things as raising children, revering the priesthood, preaching the gospel, and the importance of being obedient. In fact, one of her contributions to the society contains what is almost a refutation of the intellectual pursuit:

'Tis not for you to pry
Into the secrets of the worlds on high—
to seek to know the first, the moving Cause,
The more immediate cause of all the woe
And degradation in your world below,
Is disobedience. . . .

Thus she put any budding Fausts in their places, leaving them there with the practical business of living and the spiritual business of obeying.

Years later, long after the demise of the Polysophical Society and the Deseret Theological Class which succeeded it, she said:

Literary Associations are good in their way, but it is spiritual culture, spiritual food the young want. . . . Does the education of the world prepare you. . . to associate in the holy order of the house of God? No! It only fits you to be ornaments in Babylon.

One of her most disconcerting comments, included in an 1877 article, projects an antiintellectual summary more representative of Brigham Young than of a woman of intellectual bent:

What is true greatness? In human character, usefulness constitutes greatness. . . . In the estimation of holy intelligences, the most useful character or person is the greatest. . . ."

Then, in what may be an unconscious substitution of the key word in a latter-day scripture, she concluded, “The glory of God is his works.”

Eliza’s disavowal of reason and the intellectual pursuit as a means of discovering hidden truths in no way represents a denial of the usefulness

---

19 Minutes, Tenth Ward Young Ladies Retrenchment Association, January 8, 1875, printed in Woman’s Exponent, February 1, 1875.
20 Eliza R. Snow, “Simplicity,” Woman’s Exponent, June 1, 1877. The scriptural passage she misquotes is from Doctrine and Covenants, 92:36, and reads “The glory of God is intelligence. . . .”
of thought and logical development to the practical ends of salvation and the building of the kingdom. Her skill in manipulating words in support of those concepts she had unquestioningly accepted from her priesthood mentors made her a brilliant defender of the faith. Seldom did she depart from orthodoxy, and on the rare occasion that she found herself or any of her followers at odds with church leaders, she would be quick to repent of the misunderstanding.

But not too quick. For example, the circumstances surrounding the publication of her very popular paper on the resurrection, which appeared in the *Woman's Exponent* in December 1873, suggest not only the use Eliza made of her perceptive and literary abilities in its composition but also the purpose for which she wrote such pieces and her conviction that ideas must be subject to authority. The article attempted to justify the ancient doctrine, as enunciated by Joseph Smith, of the literal resurrection of the body, called into question by the "scientific" fact of the decomposition of human remains and their subsequent recycling, possibly into other human bodies. Using patterns of logic applied in the academic disciplines, she reasoned her case convincingly, and the piece became a major focus for discussion around the settlements. Nearly two years later, in the issue of September 1, 1875, the *Exponent* reprinted the piece by popular request. This time Brigham Young reacted. Prominent in the very next issue appeared his reprimand. Identifying the piece "by Miss E.R. Snow," and making no reference to the fact that she was his wife, he bemoaned the reprinting. "I had hoped that after its first publication it would have slept and never been awakened." Closing with a cut that would be the more hurtful to Eliza because it quoted her first and lasting prophet, the church president noted: "As the prophet Joseph Smith once [said], 'It has just one fault and that fault is, it is not true.' " Two weeks later, in October conference, Brigham ordered read, and later published, his own discourse on the literal nature of the resurrection. One may speculate long over the ensuing evening conversations between Eliza and Brigham. Or were they cold silences? For some reason, we have no word about the issue until six months later, in April 1876. Then in the *Deseret Weekly News*, along with the conference announcements, appeared a tiny notice in a lower corner of the page. Identifying both her article and Young's by date and publisher, Eliza recanted: "Permit me to say that I fully concur in the views expressed by Pres. Young, and withdraw everything contained in my article at variance therewith. . . ."

---

21 *Deseret Weekly News*, April 5, 1876.
The incident represents well her habits of thought. First, that she accepted whole cloth the pronouncements of the hierarchy; second, that she would marshal all her skills in the propagation and defense of those dicta; third, that where the opinions of men (or women, her own included) were at variance with the word of the priesthood, the priesthood prevailed. This was, at least, her public stance. Into the private edges of her mind there is no entry but conjecture; no diary and few confessional poems of the Utah period exist. Of course it is possible that she thought or spoke quietly in other than orthodox directions, but intentional duplicity appears nowhere else in her behavior, so there is no basis for assuming it here. More in keeping with her nature seems to be the disciplined single-mindedness which set the word of the prophet as the immovable standard and the good of the kingdom as the ultimate purpose.

But to return to the earlier time, that first decade or so of pioneer Utah. There is little doubt that Eliza was an intellectual center around whom women clustered for mental stimulation. With her, or from her, they accepted the judgment that favored the practical exercise of the mind over the mental toying frequently accepted as characteristic of the intellectual. Frontier Utah had little respect for the ivory tower intellect, male or female. Novel reading was discouraged; antiprofessionalism, especially against lawyers and doctors, was a prevailing attitude. The arts, except for the easy diversion of the theatre, were not useful in kingdom building. The Polysophical Society was turned into a hierarchical adjunct. The church did not need bluestockings in Eliza’s generation.

Nevertheless, the active mind will have its life, often beyond or despite the requirements of practicality. Perhaps there was no pioneer intellectual subculture; that seems less a cause for wonder than that there was a strong intellectual thrust which remained alive despite an anti-intellectualism that resulted as much from the exigencies of pioneer necessity as from hierarchical dicta. Maybe Martha Heywood’s French class never got off the ground, but the Mount Nebo Literary Association did. The Polysophical Society was strangled by religious zeal, but its descendants in spirit sprang up in settlements further from official sanction. Early poetry was homey and sentimental, sometimes a mere exercise in indoctrination, but it did survive in the practice of Utah women until later years when civilization caught up with the Saints and there was time for such things. The demands of frontier life did not choke off the life of the intellect; Hannah King, Martha Heywood, and Eliza Snow reinforced each other and their sisters in thought and spirit, and, in a barren wilderness, found something for the mind.
Ada Dwyer Russell as shown in a Salt Lake Theatre program.

Ada Dwyer: Bright Lights and Lilacs

BY CHRIS RIGBY

The smell of lilacs drifted through the open window, and Ada thought she could hear tinkling laughter and booming bass voices coming.

Miss Rigby is a graduate student in writing at Columbia University.
from the dining room, even though she knew no one was there. Her mind was filled with the ghosts of people who had been entertained in that house: actors, elocutionists, scholars, musicians, dancers. It was the fall of 1937, and the house would be sold in just a few weeks. As Ada prepared for sleep, images of her father floated through the empty house, his Irish laugh, his book in hand, his constant encouragement.

James Dwyer, born in Tipperary, Ireland, was baptized into the Mormon church in 1860. That same year he traveled to Utah by ox team and put to work the unique talent he had developed as a bookman. Seeing the possibilities for a bookstore in Salt Lake City, young Dwyer set up a stand at the corner of West Temple and First South in the Townsend House. With only five dollars in hand, James started the store that served as bureau of information, dispensary of Mormon publications, and unofficial headquarters for the “intellectuals” of Salt Lake Valley. As patronage increased, Dwyer moved his store to the Constitution Building and then to the former home of the McCormick Bank. Among the more prominent publications sold in Dwyer’s Bookstore were the New York Ledger, the Fireside Companion, and the Atlantic Monthly.

Dwyer’s store became more to the people of Salt Lake City than just a place to buy good books and magazines; it was a center of education. Many of Utah’s advancements started with conversation in the back room of Dwyer’s. The shelves of the Dwyer store held the school books used in the territory. The teachers held institute and business meetings in the back room which was equipped with maps, charts, and other educational materials. Mr. Dwyer occasionally invited scholars to his home for a banquet.

In March 1866 a group of prominent men met in the Dwyer bookstore to set up the framework for a viable educational system in Utah. The resulting chain of church schools substantially upgraded the training received by Salt Lake City youngsters. The Dwyer bookstore also was used as a study hall by students from the University of Deseret. Many of these students were able to complete their schooling because of the credit extended to them by James Dwyer. Indeed, Dwyer’s reading room was referred to as the first library west of the Missouri River, and James

3 Ibid.
4 James Dwyer, signed statement of November 11, 1913, “The Establishment of the LDS Church Schools,” manuscript, Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo.
5 Deseret News, July 8, 1913.
Dwyer's Book Store on Main Street was an educational and cultural institution of note in early Salt Lake City. Advertisement is from S. W. Darke's Salt Lake City Illustrated, 1887.

himself was a walking compendium of knowledge on the contents of almost every book in his store. If he could not find time to read the book himself he would make a gift of the book to another person who would report to him on the contents in payment for the gift.

Befitting his role as community intellectual, Dwyer's home at 166 West North Temple was a gathering place for the educated society of Utah. Luxurious with its walkways, gardens, and hothouse, this home initially had one of only three lawns in Salt Lake City. Dwyer had married Sarah Ann Hammer in 1862; their seven children grew up in the company of notable people from every cultural profession. Personal friends of the family included the owners and managers of influential publishing houses such as D. A. Appleton, Houghton-Mifflin, Charles F. Scribner's, and Harper's. Representatives of the stage and music worlds were often guests at the Dwyer dinner table. In his early years in Utah, James converted Sara Alexander, popular actress, and her mother to Mormonism, thus making one of his earliest theatrical acquaintances.

The first child to enter the Dwyer household, Mary Ada Dwyer, was born on February 8, 1863. Just a few months before her birth the Salt

*Salt Lake Tribune, January 2, 1938.*
Lake Theatre, on whose stage Ada would become familiar to the people of Utah, had been dedicated. James Dwyer had assisted in hauling materials for the construction of the theatre. When Ada at a young age expressed an interest in acting her father obtained the best possible training for her. In later years Ada wrote:

In looking back over my varied career, always back of every success was father's watchful, guiding hand. There was never a teacher of elocution, or any foreign language, that came to Utah in pioneer days, that my father did not have me take lessons from. He encouraged me to further effort and chose books for me to read, and trained my trend of thought, that fitted me for what was to follow.

Ada spent a considerable amount of her young life in training for the stage. At age eight she was taken to Detroit by her father where she studied public recitation. Upon returning to Salt Lake City she studied at the school of Mary and Ida Ione Cook and later with a Mr. Rogers. When Prof. S. S. Hamill came to Salt Lake City, Ada studied "the science of elocution" under him, as well as Spanish and French. As a girl Ada participated in dramatic performances of many kinds all the way from neighborhood plays to productions in the Salt Lake Theatre. Between her fifth and fifteenth years she performed in numerous plays, continued her recitations, and studied under teachers in Boston and New York, as well as in Salt Lake City. At the age of twelve she appeared in amateur productions at the old Ellerbeck House in Salt Lake City under the direction of Mrs. William Pitt. After the Home Dramatic Club was formed in 1880, Ada took advantage of several chances to perform with them. She had parts in their two most notable productions, *The Two Orphans* and *Blow for Blow*.

The Salt Lake Theatre provided continuous inspiration for Ada's dream of acting. She would attend the theatre often, and when she was accompanied by a younger sister it was Ada's responsibility to hold the child's head in her lap or take her out whenever there was shooting or violence.

On February 1, 1881, the *Woman's Exponent* commended Ada for the work she had done in recitation and elocution throughout the valley. She had performed many times in the area and was regarded as a profes-

---

7 George D. Pyper, *Romance of an Old Playhouse* (Salt Lake City, 1928), 280.
10 *Salt Lake Tribune*, October 24, 1937.
On March 1, 1881, Ada made her official public debut along with Alice Hamill. On June 19, 1882, she gave an evening of readings and recitals on the stage of the Salt Lake Theatre, and in January 1883 she performed at a well-attended charity program sponsored by the Unity Club. In Victorian prose, the *Exponent* reported, “Miss Ada Dwyer, in her rendering of Lady Macbeth in the sleep walking scene, surpassed the expectations of her most ardent admirers and showed herself quite at home in the character.”

Ada's dream of acting on the New York stage was fulfilled when she earned a role in the play *One Error*. Ada later recalled being fifteen or sixteen at that time, but she was almost certainly older, at least nineteen. Following this first play, she had a three-year engagement as Roxie in *Puddin’ Head Wilson*. Ada wrote that her portrayal of Roxie was a role “which many considered my masterpiece, and which I liked best of all the numerous characterizations I have portrayed.” A series of tours then took her throughout England, the United States, and Australia. During these years her latest engagements in New York were noted in the newspapers, along with her frequent visits to Salt Lake City.

At the height of her career, Ada was dazzled by Harold Russell, leading actor in the John Drew Company of New York. The two acted together in *One Error*, which ran from August 25 to September 20, 1890. George C. Odell, author of *Annals of the New York Stage*, described the actors in the play as “a good cast of the second rank.” After a lengthy courtship, Ada and Harold were married on February 26, 1893, just a few days after Ada's thirtieth birthday. After a week-long honeymoon, the newlyweds returned to their separate careers and were not reunited until early summer.

A year and a half later Mrs. Russell gave birth to a baby girl, her first and only child. The baby, born on September 5, 1894, was named Lorna. For unknown reasons, Ada and Harold separated when Lorna was just a baby. The couple never sought a divorce. Lorna was raised principally in Salt Lake City by her grandparents, the Dwyers.
Ada herself returned to the Dwyer home in Salt Lake City for the funeral of her mother in July 1897. She was very close to her parents and deeply affected by her mother’s death. Despite her ties to Utah, as Ada’s acting experience expanded, her contact with the Mormon church dwindled. Although she was never hostile to the church, her work in New York and other cities slowly weaned her of Mormonism.

On March 12, 1912, having just returned from a London engagement, Ada attended a party of distinguished Boston society women. Here she was introduced to Amy Lowell, the famous American imagist poet, who would be Ada’s companion for many years until Miss Lowell’s death in 1925. Ada and Amy were impressed with each other and quickly developed a friendship bound by many common interests, such as poetry, acting, and the arts in general. The lilac bushes that later bloomed around the Dwyer home in Salt Lake City were a gift sent from Amy Lowell as a sign of her friendship with Ada. The two women shared each other’s company in Boston until the end of March, when Ada was called away by professional duties. This separation established a pattern in which the two friends parted periodically because of their work. Miss Lowell was irritated when Ada’s career sometimes forced them to be separated.

In the early summer of 1912 Miss Lowell invited Ada to go with her as a guest to Dublin where the two women could spend the summer together. Ada accepted the invitation, and the first of many trips was planned and enjoyed by the two friends. It is probable that a great deal of time that summer was spent preparing Miss Lowell’s book, *A Dome of Many Colored Glass*, for its October publication. As time went on, Ada became more and more instrumental in helping to bring about the publication of Miss Lowell’s poetry. The Utah-born actress served as secretary, nurse, and critic to Miss Lowell. One of Miss Lowell’s biographers, S. Foster Damon, wrote that the world would never “appreciate how much it owes to Mrs. Russell for making the path smooth for Amy Lowell.” He detailed Ada’s many duties:

... Mrs. Russell made it possible for Miss Lowell to devote her entire time to writing. It was Mrs. Russell who preserved the morning silence, quelled the kitchen quarrels, got books from libraries, did bits of research, read proofs, and even informed guests they must leave when they were intruding on a creative period. In the evenings she criticized the latest

20 *Deseret News*, July 29, 1897.
poems; she listened to every composition before it was pronounced finished, standing proxy for the public; and so well did she act as comrade in art that Miss Lowell once suggested they put out a sign: "Lowell & Russell, Makers of Fine Poems." 

In appreciation for her assistance, Miss Lowell eventually dedicated all her books to Mrs. Russell.

A longstanding point of conflict between the poet and the actress reemerged in February 1914 when the two women were in Chicago. Amy wanted Ada to give up her career and move in with her to serve as a companion and help with the publication of her poetry. After some discussion, the proposition was temporarily set aside. Later in the year, Miss Lowell again pled with the fifty-one-year-old Ada to abandon the stage, this time in order to take a trip to Europe. Ada adamantly insisted that she must wait for a playwright to finish *A Plain Woman* in which she was to be the lead. Continued discussion followed. Eventually, when Ada learned that her playwright friend, no longer in touch with the muse, would not complete his play, she immediately bowed to Amy's wishes, and the two women left for Europe on June 23, 1914.

Despite Miss Lowell's plea that Mrs. Russell give up her career on the stage, Ada kept on acting. She was not quite ready to terminate her career; she was enjoying her success. A popular musical called *The Girl from Utah* starred a Utah actress and brought to light the fact that Ada Dwyer Russell was not the only Utahn popular on the New York stage:

> The interesting fact . . . was that during the year in which this play was produced at least seven girls from Utah were either starring or playing leading parts on Broadway. Heading the list, of course, was Maude Adams. The others were Margaret Romaine, Hazel Dawn, Viola Gilette, Ada Dwyer, Sallie Fisher, and Julia Dean.

Several family matters required Ada's attention in 1914 and 1915. Her daughter, Lorna, became Mrs. Theodore Amussen in August 1914. Then in January 1915 James Dwyer died from "general debility." Aware of the weakening condition of her beloved eighty-three-year-old father, Mrs. Russell spent more than a month at his bedside prior to his death.

As the Dwyer home in Salt Lake City had been a center for refined people, Amy Lowell's estate in Boston was the gathering place for talented
artists. The work the two women did on Amy’s poetry was punctuated by parties and socials. Ada and Amy became the center of a group of friends who called themselves the “Devils.” In the tradition of salons as informal centers of cultural interchange, Heinrich Gebhard, Herman Adler, and Carl Engel would meet with the two women at Miss Lowell’s home for piano concerts, readings, and other genteel activities.27

Boston society was fond of dwelling on the peculiar aspects of Amy Lowell’s life, her dislike of bright objects in a room where she was writing, her habit of writing all night and then sleeping until late in the afternoon, her penchant for taut sheets on the bed. Ada was sometimes included in these tales of the odd life at Miss Lowell’s estate. The private lives of both women were periodically scrutinized by the Boston newspapers, and Miss Lowell’s poetry was severely criticized. Nevertheless, the two women continued to work hard to publish Amy’s work, and the breakthrough came with the success of *Sword Blades and Poppy Seeds*. The criticism leveled at the women’s personal lives did not seem important after the incredible reception of this book.28

Sometime in mid-1915 Miss Lowell wrote “Patterns,” one of her most successful poems. When she and Ada both agreed that it was too risqué to be published in a prominent magazine, it was sent to the *Little Review*. The poem was printed in the August edition of the magazine and became Miss Lowell’s most famous work.29

When Miss Lowell invited Mrs. Russell to Dublin again in 1915, it was not Ada’s stage career that interfered but her contraction of a disease resembling typhoid fever. Miss Lowell postponed her trip so she could attend Mrs. Russell in her illness. After a speedy recovery, Ada left for a rest in Salt Lake City and Amy went to Dublin. The enjoyable time Amy had planned for herself was complicated by a leaky house, timid servants, and the absence of her friend and secretary. In a letter to Eleanor Belmont dated August 7, 1915, Miss Lowell wrote,

> Surely Ada’s vacation is not proving exactly a joyride for me. Not that she could have stopped the leaks, or staunched the brook in the cellar, had she been here, but all these things are worse when our only human propinquity is a group of startled and unhappy servants.30

28 Ibid., 263.
29 Ibid., 313.
30 Ibid., 315.
As her work became known, doubtless helped by her reputation as an eccentric, Amy Lowell became a popular lecturer. For the speaking tours that followed, Ada was responsible for seeing that everything ran smoothly on the trip, at the accommodations, and during the lecture. Ada and Amy developed a routine to lessen the strain of these exhausting tours. The traveling group consisted of Amy, Ada, and Elizabeth Henry, who had been a maid to Miss Lowell for more than twenty years. They always occupied certain seats when traveling, so that Miss Lowell, who suffered from high blood pressure, could sit next to an open window. When the group arrived at the hotel chosen by Miss Lowell, they invariably ordered a suite of five rooms. Miss Lowell’s room would have a vacant room on either side, and it was part of Ada’s job to prepare these three central rooms for the poet. This included unplugging all electric clocks and covering all mirrors and other shining objects with black. Any telephone messages were routed through Mrs. Russell’s room, since it was she that entertained reporters, friends, or other poets that came to see the blue blood Miss Lowell. Caring for the poet was further complicated by her need for meals sent up to her rooms, often at unlikely hours to conform with her periods of creativity.31

World War I brought new responses in poetry from Amy Lowell and from other poets. War conditions also affected Ada and Amy in another way. Both women were fond of the expensive dogs kept in Miss Lowell’s kennel. Increased rationing in 1918 made it impossible to get the meat the dogs required, and finally Miss Lowell asked Mrs. Russell to have all but one of the dogs chloroformed. The dog that was spared, Prue, died in December of the same year.32

In May 1918 Amy Lowell, trying to move a bed to ease her insomnia, contracted a hernia. Four operations left her increasingly weak and dispirited. Then, in the middle of Amy’s illness, Ada’s daughter was caught up in the wave of influenza that swept the world in the autumn of 1918. Lorna had one child, Sonny, and was expecting another. When the influenza turned into pneumonia, her doctor feared that even if she lived she would lose her unborn child. Ada left Miss Lowell and stayed with Lorna in Washington until the danger point was passed. After a fourth operation, Miss Lowell’s health continued to deteriorate, and on May 12, 1925, she suffered a massive stroke. Amy asked “Pete,” a pet name for

31 Ibid., 391–92.
32 Ibid., 442.
Mrs. Russell, to summon her doctor, which had already been done. Unconsciousness followed immediately, and by 5:30 P.M. she was dead. Amy Lowell was cremated on May 15 and buried in the family plot. There was no funeral, and in accordance with her wishes only Mrs. Russell, Mrs. Belmont, and Elizabeth Henry were present at her burial. The will instructed that her home and a generous trust fund go to Mrs. Russell.

Following Amy Lowell’s death, Ada Russell was burdened with the huge responsibility of finishing Miss Lowell’s correspondence, including replies to sympathy notes. In accordance with the poet’s written instructions all unfinished literary material was burned. Although Amy had hoped that Ada would stay on at her estate for a while, Ada chose a nearby house as her living quarters until she finished taking care of details. There Ada took care of materials that were in the process of being published. Under her direction and editorship, some of the most famous of Miss Lowell’s literary works were published, including the two-volume biography, *John Keats* (1925); *What’s O’Clock* (1925); *East Wind* (1926); and *Ballads for Sale* (1927).

Two years following Miss Lowell’s death, Ada’s husband, Harold Russell, died in New York City at the Lamb’s Club. Although Ada and Harold had been separated for many years, Ada retained the Russell name throughout her life.

On the evening of October 20, 1928, the renowned Salt Lake Theatre opened its doors for the final performance. Ada Russell, as an honored guest, read Amy Lowell’s poem, “Lilacs,” which was followed by the second act of *Robin Hood* and the third act of *La Traviata*. Ada was hailed upon her return to Utah as a great actress and an influential woman. When the theatre was razed to make way for a telephone building, Ada was instrumental in having a plaque placed on the new building in remembrance of the famous theatre.

During the remaining years of Ada’s life, she retired from the stage except for a few guest performances. Her brother George continued to sell books in the tradition of his father in a corner of Auerbach’s in Salt Lake City. In December 1938 she reluctantly sold the Dwyer homestead. Ada then apparently went to live with Lorna in Chevy Chase, Maryland. There after a long illness she fell and broke her hip, and these circumstances led to her death on July 4, 1952. Mrs. Russell’s funeral was con-

^33 Ibid., 713.
ducted in Maryland by an Episcopal minister, indicative of the shift in Ada's religious beliefs away from her childhood training.35

Ada's youthful contacts with cultured and educated people in Utah shaped her life and instilled in her a desire to achieve excellence in drama. As an actress, she obtained considerable fame after developing her talents in Utah and then exposing them to the eastern theatre. Her most lasting gift to the world of the arts, however, was the great contribution she made to Amy Lowell's life.

THE POETRY OF PIONEER Utah lies for the most part forgotten in the periodicals of the day and a few slim volumes of verse preserved in local libraries. While a surprising number of early Utahns wrote poetry, only a handful of their poems survive—most notably in hymns such as the

Ms. Murphy is assistant editor of *Utah Historical Quarterly*. 
familiar “Come, Come Ye Saints” by William Clayton. Of the poets themselves, Eliza R. Snow is the only one whose name is mentioned with any frequency today. The neglect of pioneer verse is readily explained by reading the poems. Many of them reflect the sentimentality and didacticism that sometimes marred nineteenth-century poetry; additionally, these Mormon poets tended to explore religious themes with a dogmatic zeal that no longer appeals to most readers. Sarah Elizabeth Carmichael—Lizzie, as she was called—overcame these faults to produce poems of genuine literary merit. Regrettably, her work has been obscured in the general eclipse of pioneer poetry.

Two facts about Lizzie Carmichael emerge: she displayed a poetic brilliance that was admired by her peers both in Utah and elsewhere, and she lived with a tragic heritage that darkened her life during what should have been its crowning years. While brief sketches of her life have appeared from time to time in local publications, research has uncovered additional material on both the poet and her husband, Jonathan M. Williamson, that will flesh out her story and correct some misconceptions.¹

Lizzie was born in 1838 at Setauket, Long Island, New York, a daughter of William and Mary Ann Carmichael. Her destiny was shaped in large measure by the family’s flawed heredity. Her parents were double cousins, and of a reported seven children born to them only Lizzie with her superior mind and a sister of below-normal intelligence survived infancy. Just when and where the Carmichaels were converted to Mormonism is not certain. However, in October 1842 the family joined the Latter-day Saints at Nauvoo where father Carmichael worked as a carpenter on the Nauvoo Temple. By the spring of 1847 the family was living at Winter Quarters, Nebraska; and in 1850 they made their final move to Salt Lake Valley, settling in the city’s Eighth Ward. Lizzie was then twelve years old.²


² Jakeman, “Sarah,” 478–79, 489; Deseret News, November 21, 1866, and November 11, 1901; Salt Lake Herald, November 11, 1901; Brigham H. Roberts, ed., History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 7 vols. (Salt Lake City, 1902–32), 6:175, 7:326, 463; Kate B. Carter, comp., Heart Throbs of the West, 12 vols. (Salt Lake City, 1939–51), 11:404; Francis W. Kirkham and Harold Lundstrom, eds., Tales of a Triumphant People: A History of Salt Lake County, Utah, 1847–1900 (Salt Lake City, 1947), 24. See also U.S., National Archives, 1850 Census Schedules, Utah, microfilm of holograph, #A143, Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City. The Census shows the Carmichaels as Eighth Ward residents and lists the four family members: William, joiner, 46; Mary Ann, 42; Mary, 13; Sarah, 13.
The earliest plat of Salt Lake City shows William Carmichael as owner of a lot on the northwest corner of State Street and Fifth South. This location opposite the Eighth Ward Square gave Lizzie an ever-changing view of incoming settlers who camped there prior to establishing permanent residence elsewhere. In 1851 an adobe school where Lizzie may have attended classes was built on the north side of Fourth South near State Street. She may also have used the facilities of the fledgling territorial library housed in Council Hall. Despite the limited educational and cultural resources of Zion, the "pretty, big-eyed retiring girl" began her solitary, self-taught career as a writer.

That the tender bud flowered, given its environment, indicates a personal persistence and a commitment that ran very deep. Edward W. Tullidge called Lizzie's birth "in the severest sense untimely; she was reared in these valleys of Rocky Mountain isolation, when the poet, the musician and the painter were told to go to the canyons with ox teams for wood to earn their daily bread." On the Mormon frontier the struggle for survival made the arts expendable. If, as some have suggested, her home life was characterized by misunderstanding or even resentment, the fact would not be difficult to understand. Artistic genius and domestic order are fitful companions at best. Nevertheless, some communion—fostered perhaps by parental pride—did exist. A charming picture of Lizzie's father describes him with his dinner pail in one hand and the manuscript of a poem written by his gifted daughter in the other, he might have been seen almost any day going to work and stopping at the newspaper office to leave the manuscript.

Beginning in 1858 more than fifty poems by Miss Carmichael were published in the Deseret News over a period of eight years. Her first offering was apparently so well done as to cast doubt upon her authorship. The poet sought the help of "a high church official" who assured the editor of the girl's genuineness and Lizzie became a frequent contributor. The first poem to carry her name was "Truth" which appeared in the March 10, 1858, issue. Then a young woman of twenty, Lizzie found her

---

* Kirkham and Lundstrom, Tales, 25; Andrew Jenson, Encyclopedic History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (Salt Lake City, 1941), 746; Kate B. Carter, comp., Our Pioneer Heritage, 14 vols. (Salt Lake City, 1958–71), 2:18.
* Tullidge, "Carmichael," 335.
* Jakeman, "Sarah," 489; Root, "Pioneer Poet."
* Salt Lake Herald, November 11, 1901.
work readily acknowledged by the pioneer intelligentsia, and in 1859 the powerful Eliza R. Snow made her approval public:

Make room for the rising minstrel—
List, list to her minstrelsy;
Its numbers are rich and truthful,
And pure is its melody.  

As Lizzie's genius continued to unfold it brought her a measure of fame but at the same time exposed areas of tension between the artist and her family and church.

The early published poems of Miss Carmichael are remarkable for their lack of distinctly Mormon subject matter. Often homiletic in character, the verses treat friendship, love, personal integrity, writing, Indian pride, and similar topics from a humanistic, nonsectarian point of view. Even in the poem "Pharaoh," where man's contending with God is explored, she avoided heavy-handed parallels between the exodus of the Israelites and that of the Mormons. And in a rare poem on a Mormon subject—Brigham Young—Lizzie retained control over her topic, refusing to be overawed by his power. The result is a poem that praises but does not cloy:

We do not call thee chieftain,
We do not name thee king,
We wreath no brilliants for thy brow,
No ermine round thee fling.

The verse continues, expanding the theme of the Mormon leader as a beloved man who belongs to the people: he is "ours." By contrast, there is a remoteness to Brigham Young in these lines by Eliza R. Snow:

Servant of God, most honor'd—most belov'd:
By Him appointed and of Him approv'd.

---

8 "To Miss Carmichael, G.S.L. City—," Deseret News, April 13, 1859. Eliza R. Snow copied the poem on some unused pages in her Journal and Notebook (1842–44) now in the Archives Division, Historical Department, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City.


10 "Brigham Young," Deseret News, October 17, 1860.
Prophet and Seer—You stand as Moses stood,
Between the people and the living God.11

A recently uncovered document asserts that Lizzie “often sought the society and literary counsel of Sister Eliza.” Sometime after the 1856 publication of Eliza’s first volume of poetry, the two visited Brigham Young, seeking help for “a similar recognition of the youthful aspirant for literary honors.” The church president advised the girl to “‘use your gifts to build up truth and righteousness in the earth and your gift will be preserved as long as you shall live. If you prostitute your powers to gain fame or gold, your light will go out in darkness.’” This should not be construed as indicating antagonism on Brigham Young’s part toward Lizzie and her work.12 The practical man of affairs probably knew far better than the two women that the world honors poets with laurel wreaths and love but seldom money. Then, too, he may have recognized that despite a close bond of sympathy, the young poet would never emulate the older woman’s perfervid zeal. One cannot imagine Lizzie penning lines such as these:

O God, bless Brigham Young;
Bless him, and all that bless him;
Waste them away, O God, we pray,
Who, rising to oppose him,
Contend with Thee.13

The times generally favored zeal over art.

From her earliest years, Lizzie must have longed for the benefits of a broader education. Her facile mind absorbed what it could from the limited resources available in Salt Lake City, but it craved more. John R. Young remembered meeting Lizzie, probably sometime in 1858, when he attended a school taught by Sister Pratt, and here became acquainted with Miss Carmichael, “one of Utah’s most gifted daughters.”14 Far
PROGRAMME
FOR THE
CELEBRATION OF THE 86th ANNIVERSARY
OF OUR
NATIONAL INDEPENDENCE.

At sunrise, a Salute will be fired by Major Ladd's Artillery Battalion at the mound on the Temple Block. The first gun will be the signal for unfurling and displaying flags in all parts of the city, and for national airs by the several Bands. The Nauvoo Brass Band will be stationed upon the cupola of the State House; Ballo's Band on the promenade deck of the Theatre, and the Military Band at the Court House.

At nine o'clock a Salute of three guns will be fired, which will be the signal for forming the Procession at the Court House. All persons, whether citizens or strangers, expecting to join in the Procession, are respectfully requested to be on the ground at the Court House, at a quarter before nine o'clock, to avoid unnecessary delay.

The Procession will be formed at nine o'clock precisely, under the direction of Col. R. T. Barlow, assisted by Majors Cunningham and Sharp, marshals of the day, in the following order, viz.:

FIRST. Nauvoo Brass Band. Captain W. Pitt.
SECOND. Detachment of Cavalry. Captain H. P. Kimball.
FOURTH. Ballo's Band. Captain C. J. Thomas.
FIFTH. Carriages containing Public Officers and Distinguished Guests in the following order, viz.:

1. Committee of Arrangements.
2. State and Federal Officers.
3. Territorial Officers.
4. Distinguished Guests.
5. Orator, Chaplain and Reader of Declaration of Independence.
7. County Officers.
8. City Officers.

SIXTH. Martial Band. Captain Huntington.
SEVENTH. Detachment of Infantry. Colonel D. J. Ross.
EIGHTH. Citizens and Strangers.

The Procession will move along Second South Street to First East Street, thence up said street to South Temple Street, and along South Temple Street to the Bowery.

PROCEDINGS IN THE BOWERY.

Prayer: By the Chaplain of the day. Elder John Taylor.
Oration: By Col. Geo. A. Smith, Orator of the day.
Music: "Yankee Doodle." By the Martial Band.
Song: Composed for the occasion. By Miss E. R. Snow.
Address: By Mr. Joseph Romney.
Music: By Ballo's Band.
"Life and Liberty." Composed for the occasion. By Miss S. E. Carmichael.
Address: By Mr. H. W. Nisbett.
Music: By Nauvoo Brass Band.

There will then be presented and read a variety of toasts and sentiments, with other literary varieties as occasion may present; after which,
National Anthem: By Ballo's Band.
Benediction: By the Chaplain.

During the services brief addresses may be expected from several prominent gentlemen present.

At the close of the proceedings in the Bowery, a national salute will be fired by Major Ladd's Artillery, which will conclude the ceremonies of the day.

Independence Day 1862 in Salt Lake City featured music, speeches, and a poem by Miss S. E. Carmichael. Utah State Historical Society collections.
from desiring merely “fame or gold,” Lizzie may have wanted, even at this early date, to earn money from her poetry to pay for further education in the East.

While little is known of Lizzie’s personal life in the early 1860s, the “rising minstrel” mixed with prominent members of local society, winning their admiration and acceptance. An elaborate program of speeches and music celebrating Independence Day 1862 included her poem “Life and Liberty,” read by John T. Caine. A few weeks later, similar activities commemorating Pioneer Day brought from her pen not a poem but a brief address to the pioneers read by William Clayton. She had entered the most productive, challenging, and ultimately tragic decade of her life. National recognition, marriage, and travel lay ahead of her, but by the end of the 1860s her life—the life of the mind—was essentially over.

Edward W. Tullidge may have been the most perceptive of Lizzie’s contemporaries. He saw her as a genius whose powers of improvisation carried her to the heights, but the patient shaping and reworking of a master such as Keats “cannot, we fear, be justly accredited among her higher poetic gifts and graces.” While she appears to have “lisped in numbers” as naturally as Pope, many have lamented along with Tullidge that “the poet was born out of due season.” Had her intellectual environment been more challenging and critical, her powers might have matured more fully despite the brevity of her creative years. Nevertheless, the poet did grow. She began to see her subjects in dramatic terms, using conflict, contrast, and irony in an increasingly sophisticated way. “The Daughter of Herodias,” “Esau’s Petition,” “The Stolen Sunbeam,” and the “Feast of Lucrezia Borgia” reveal a growing command of her art. A few lines from the latter poem will illustrate how the muse was maturing:

Wine! wine! it flowed in a crimson stream
Through the crystal cups, till its ruby gleam
Shadowed a blush on the soft white hand
That raised the glass from the marble stand.

As the bacchanal progresses and the wine takes effect, the guests become fearful:

—

15 “Programme for the Celebration of the 86th Anniversary of Our National Independence.” Utah State Historical Society; Deseret News, July 9 and July 30, 1862. The poem and the address are printed in full in the News.
17 Ibid., 335.
They spurn the wine with a frenzied ire,—
Their hands are ice, and their lips are fire.
There’s a mantle of blackness above them spread
They hear a chant for the dying and dead;
They see priests moving; wan tapers gleam;
But each life-pulse stands like a torpid stream;
And they gaze with a stupor of brain and heart
As the gorgeous curtains are torn apart,
And a form in velvet of sable dye,
With the forehead bound by a jeweled tie,
Stood looking upon them with eyes severe,
And they shuddering whisper: “Lucrezia’s here.”

But the poisoner’s triumph over the nobles is brief; Lucrezia’s son is one of the victims.¹⁸

Miss Carmichael’s advancing skill eventually brought her recognition outside of Zion. William Cullen Bryant published “The Stolen Sunbeam” in his two-volume collection, A Family Library of Poetry and Song. Retitled by Bryant “The Origin of Gold,” the poem has been justly acclaimed for its fine conceit depicting heaven’s fallen one tearing a plume from the setting sun and burying it in the earth where it becomes gold. Another anthologist, May Wentworth, selected two Carmichael poems, “A Christmas Rhyme” and “Sorrow,” for her volume Poetry of the Pacific in 1867. In addition to the anthologies, some have claimed that Lizzie’s poems were often reprinted without credit by the eastern press. In any event, ample evidence exists that the Utah poet was recognized and respected in the literary circles of mid-nineteenth-century America.¹⁹

Like many other writers of the period, Lizzie was profoundly moved by the Civil War. The conflict that set brother against brother captured her imagination and brought from her pen vivid, dramatic poems such as “Ashes to Ashes.” The war indirectly affected her personal life as well. Miles from Zion the call to arms led Jonathan M. Williamson, a surgeon, to enlist with the California Volunteers in San Francisco on September 27, 1861. A year later the doctor entered Salt Lake City with troops under the command of Col. Patrick E. Connor. Lizzie may have caught a first


glimpse of her future husband at that time, as the soldiers marched up State Street past her home.\textsuperscript{20}

Williamson surfaced in the local news early in 1863, following the Battle of Bear River, when he traveled fifty miles north with another physician to meet the wounded. One can only speculate on the doctor’s activities during the following year and a half. In the summer of 1864 the post newspaper reported his return from California where he had been “for some time past.” A few months later the surgeon was mustered out of the service, his three-year enlistment having expired. Wanting to take a more active part in the Civil War, Williamson signed on as a surgeon with the artillery brigade, 16th Army Corps, under Gen. A.J. Smith and saw action in the “great campaign of 1864–65.” In August 1866 he returned to Zion “in his own conveyance,” reportedly making one of the quickest trips on record.\textsuperscript{21}

One uncertainty remains: when and where did the bright poet and the army surgeon meet? Evidence suggests the couple became acquainted during the doctor’s stay at Camp Douglas, in the year and a half between the Battle of Bear River and Williamson’s trip to California in 1864. This assumption better explains references—many of which are highly overdrawn—to Lizzie’s conflict with church and parental authority.

Beyond question feelings ran high when Connor and his men marched into Salt Lake City. The Mormons felt harassed and viewed the troops with suspicion. Many of the soldiers saw the Saints as traitorous lawbreakers and enjoyed poking fun at their beliefs and their leaders. Despite the atmosphere of mutual distrust, social contacts must have been made. Williamson evidently read the poems Lizzie was then writing with some frequency for the \textit{Deseret News}. Perhaps the dazzling “Feast of Lucrezia Borgia” charmed him as it did so many others.\textsuperscript{22} If he actively sought her acquaintance at this time, he probably found his status as a physician rather than an ordinary soldier an asset. While he was both a Gentile and an army man, Williamson posed no personal threat to the populace. Indeed, his interest in the poet may have been welcomed by some of the city’s social leaders as a sign that bridges between the two hostile camps could be built.

\textsuperscript{20} Carmichael, Poems, 37–41; Richard H. Orton, comp., \textit{Records of California Men in the War of the Rebellion, 1861 to 1867} (Sacramento, 1890), 196; Edward W. Tullidge, \textit{History of Salt Lake City} (Salt Lake City, 1886), 281. Orton lists the doctor as “Jonathan M.” —not the “Josiah” used by some local writers. Contemporary newspapers used only his initials.

\textsuperscript{21} Fred B. Rogers, \textit{Soldiers of the Overland} (San Francisco, 1938), 75; \textit{Daily Union Vedette}, July 4, 1864, and August 12, 1866.

\textsuperscript{22} One writer says the doctor read Lizzie’s story of the “Lily of the Valley” and sought her acquaintance. \textit{Salt Lake Herald}, November 11, 1901.
In 1863–64 Lizzie was in her middle twenties and unmarried in a society that had little place for that kind of nonconformity. Her wide acquaintance with the city’s influential families makes it difficult to believe that no one had proposed marriage to her. As a plural wife Lizzie would have added distinction to a family, and any artistic temperament she displayed could have been easily accommodated by a husband who need not share her company except when he wished. A refusal to marry into a local family and her subsequent alliance with a Gentile probably would have exasperated her family. Reports by Beadle and others that it nettled Brigham Young sufficiently to ban her works or moved Mormons generally to dissociate themselves from her are questionable. Evidence abounds that Lizzie remained a loved and admired figure locally despite her feelings about polygamy—feelings shared by at least one other notable woman poet of the period.23

While Lizzie may have encountered some closed doors and cold shoulders, her poetry never fell out of favor. Indeed, Utahns were eager to claim her as their own. For example, Mormon historian Brigham H. Roberts heaped praise on Miss Carmichael’s “President Lincoln’s Funeral,” asserting that it “is not anywhere surpassed in the literature—prose or poetry—that the sad event produced; no, not even Walt Whitman’s ‘O Captain! My Captain.’ ” The poem did attract national recognition following its publication in the San Francisco Golden Era. The famous actress Julia Dean Hayne, who frequently appeared at the Salt Lake Theatre, came on stage during one performance “in appropriate mourning dress, and read the poem with a pure pathos and perfect elocution, considering the immense capacity and imperfect acoustics of the room. It requires genius to read as well as write good poetry.” The elegy merits acclaim. Its expression of grief achieves a solemn dignity in lines such as these:

Bands of mourning draped the homestead,
And the sacred house of prayer;
Mourning folds lay black and heavy
On true bosoms everywhere:
Yet there were no tear-drops streaming
From the deep and solemn eye
Of the hour that mutely waited
Till the funeral train went by.

Oh! there is a woe that crushes
    All expression with its weight!
There is pain that numbs and hushes
    Feeling's sense, it is so great.

If Lizzie were out of favor with Mormon leaders over polygamy or, as some have suggested, her espousal of the Union cause, they were strangely unsuccessful at keeping her poems from the public. During only one extended period of time, from late 1864 to early 1866, did the poet fail to publish with some frequency in the Deseret News. Most likely the anti-Mormon press seized upon Lizzie's distaste for polygamy and her failure to interest Brigham Young in publishing her poetry to blow the incident out of all reasonable proportion. J.H. Beadle, for example, had Lizzie leaving Utah under the safety of a military escort to marry Dr. Williamson. And as recently as 1969 Stanley P. Hirshson uncritically asserted that Brigham Young banned her works until they were so well recognized that he “finally offered to help her, but the proud girl refused.” From many sources it appears that Lizzie's home life was marred by a lack of understanding. Evidence also supports the notion that she rebelled against her parents and the establishment. Far from being a sign of yet another malevolent Mormon plot, Lizzie's conflict with authority seems de rigueur for a poet of any intellectual pretension.

The publication of Lizzie's only book of poetry sometime in mid-1866 ushered in a series of events that greatly altered her life. The slender volume, entitled simply Poems, was published with the consent—somewhat reluctantly given—of the authoress, by a devoted circle of her friends and admirers, who design thus to preserve an early memento of her talents and genius as a writer; and by its circulation among kindred spirits, who as yet are strangers to her muse, secure for her poems a more extended acquaintance and recognition.

24 Brigham H. Roberts, A Comprehensive History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Century 1, 6 vols. (Salt Lake City, 1930), 5:72-75; Daily Union Vedette, October 14, 1865; Deseret News, October 19, 1865. The complete poem is reprinted by Roberts and may also be found in Tullidge, "Carmichael," 337-38, and Carmichael, Poems, 21-24.

25 J. H. Beadle, Polygamy; Or, The Mysteries and Crimes of Mormonism... (Philadelphia, 1882), 320-21; Stanley P. Hirshson, The Lion of the Lord: A Biography of Brigham Young (New York, 1969), 293. Hirshson's reference is the New York World, October 2, 1870. See also Albert D. Richardson, Beyond the Mississippi... (Hartford, Conn., 1867), 470-72. Richardson accompanied Schuyler Colfax on his visit to Salt Lake City and the West in 1865.

The study of Mormon attitudes toward the Civil War goes far beyond the scope of this paper. No doubt opinions on the subject were as widely varied locally as in the East. The Deseret News published several of Lizzie's poems which touch on the subject: "Slavery," February 20, 1861; and "Our Country," March 25, 1863. Her poem "Life and Liberty," read at July 4, 1862, ceremonies also speaks to the issue. On the other hand, Eliza R. Snow was critical of the use of poetry to urge support for the war. She asserted that war and famine were inevitable to "avenge the blood/That stains the wall of Carthage Jail." See her poem "Response to 'Our Country's Call,'" by Wm. C. Bryant" in Deseret News, December 25, 1861.
 Included among the twenty-six poems selected for publication were the frequently praised “April Flowers,” “President Lincoln’s Funeral,” “The Stolen Sunbeam,” and “Moonrise on the Wasatch” which is among her best descriptive poems, as its opening section illustrates:

The stars seemed far, yet darkness was not deep;
Like baby-eyes, the rays yet strove with sleep;
The giant hills stood in the distance proud—
On each white brow a dusky fold of cloud;
Some coldly gray, some of an amber hue,
Some with dark purple fading into blue;
And one that blushed with a faint crimson jet—
A sunset memory, tinged with cloud-regret.
Close to my feet the soft leaf shadows stirred;
I listened vainly, for they moved unheard—
Trembled unconsciously; the languid air
Crept to the rose’s lip, and perished there.
It was an hour of such repose as steals
Into the heart when it most deeply feels;
When feeling covers every shred of speech
With one emotion language cannot reach.
And Nature held her breath and waited there,
An awed enthusiast at the shrine of prayer;
Like a pale devotee, whose reverent lips
Stifle the breath that burns her finger-tips.26

Much of the book’s story can be traced in the columns of the *Daily Union Vedette*. On August 6, 1866, the Camp Douglas newspaper carried a review of *Poems* by Carrie Carlton, originally published in the San Francisco *New Age*. Praising both book and poet, the reviewer noted that “true to a refined and heavenly instinct she stands up bravely to resist all example, all entreaty, all parental authority.” According to the reviewer, Miss Carmichael hoped to be able to enter Vassar College. The following day the *Vedette* reported that Aaron Stein, who evidently handled the book’s sale, had sent Lizzie $581.15, proceeds from subscriptions to her volume of poetry. Stein said that he and another “gentleman” who had been responsible for promoting the book felt rewarded for their efforts and pleased by the “flattering reception given it by a critical press.”27

The *Vedette* continued to take an interest in Miss Carmichael’s poetry, publishing several of her poems during September and October.

---

27 *Daily Union Vedette*, August 6, 7, and 12, 1866. Stein was cashier for Wells, Fargo & Co.’s Overland Express and lived near the Salt Lake Theatre on First South. E. L. Sloan, comp., *The Salt Lake City Directory and Business Guide for 1869* (Salt Lake City, 1869), 140.
On November 20 the newspaper was pleased to report that *Poems* had been well received in Boston by a "high authority in matters of letters" who believed the poet was destined to achieve greater prominence in the field of literature.\(^{28}\) The future must have looked bright to the poet who had every reason to believe at age twenty-eight that she had many years left to develop her art to its full potential. The doctor must have felt pleased with Lizzie's modest success and hopeful that as her husband he might help her sustain it. The dream was not to be.

Not long after his return from the East, Williamson became embroiled in a controversial claim-jumping case. Albert Brown, a former cavalry captain, and the doctor had claimed an unoccupied piece of land west of the Jordan River. Late one night they were surrounded by forty men and forced down the bank of the river. When Brown was recognized by one of the men as having treated him kindly while on provost guard in the city, the would-be settlers were helped from the water on their promise to immediately leave the country. This potentially tragic event must have discouraged any plans Williamson had for settling in the area at that time.\(^{29}\)

In late October a probable obstacle to the doctor's marriage with Lizzie was removed. Mary Ann Carmichael, mother of "our distinguished poetess," died of a heart attack at age fifty-eight.\(^{30}\) On November 4 Williamson and Lizzie were married at Fort Bridger by the well-known Judge W.A. Carter. The *Vedette* gave its blessing to the occasion:

> The happy couple are both well and favorably known in this community, the gay Benedict as the late Surgeon of the Second Cavalry C.V., and the worthy bride as the sweet poetess of Utah. May their path through life be strewn with flowers, and every step a fountain of friendship gush forth to water them.\(^{31}\)

Nearly a year later, the *Vedette* reported that the Williamsons were living in Ohio, the doctor's native state. The newspaper reprinted a letter, "evidently from the pen of the accomplished Mrs. J. M. Williamson," originally published in the Cincinnati *Commercial*, denouncing polygamy and claiming that Lizzie had bearded the Lion of the Lord in his den:

\(^{28}\) *Daily Union Vedette*, November 20, 1866.
\(^{29}\) Accounts of the incident are found in Roberts, *Comprehensive History*, 5:201–2; T.B.H. Stenhouse, *The Rocky Mountain Saints* . . . (Salt Lake City, 1904), 618; R. N. Baskin, *Reminiscences of Early Utah* (Salt Lake City, 1914), 166–67; and *Daily Union Vedette*, September 26, 1866.
\(^{30}\) *Daily Union Vedette*, October 26, 1866.
\(^{31}\) *Ibid.*, November 6, 1866.
Poetic Genius of Pioneer Utah

I am no Hagar wandering desolate from the tent of a Mormon Abraham, but one of the few women who have grown up in the shadow of Brigham Young's despotism, and dared to defy him in the presence chamber of his power....

Reportedly, Williamson wanted his wife to write a history of the Mormons, a project that never got beyond the planning stage, as most sources agree that Lizzie went into a severe mental decline about a year after her marriage. The Williamsons showed up next in Pioche, Nevada, a booming mining town, the naming of which has been credited by several authorities to Lizzie. Then, some time after 1870, the couple returned to Salt Lake City where they lived out the remainder of their lives. Dr. Williamson continued his medical practice and cared for his wife and sister-in-law, Mary Carmichael.

Whatever the nature of her mental debility, Lizzie apparently enjoyed periods of lucidity. In 1874 Mary Jane Mount Tanner, a childhood friend, visited the invalid and described her manner:

She is better now but not well enough to take her place in Society. Poor Lizzie! It made my heart ache to see her. She was so changed. The light of intelligence had gone from her eyes, and her voice had a strange sound like some one speaking in the distance, but she talked intelligently and wanted me to come again. She has a beautiful home nicely furnished. Her husband's mother and sister lives [sic] there to take care of her. It made me feel very nervous to see her, and my health is so poor I do not think I can go again.

In 1880 the doctor's mother, Abigail Williamson, died, and two years later death came to him. J.R. Walker and Boyd Park were executors of his "considerable property." When home care for Lizzie became too difficult, she was sent to the state mental hospital at Provo where she had...
“special privileges and attendants.” Ellen L. Jakeman saw her there in the 1890s, “a slender figure in a close fitting black dress, with a white crepe shawl over her shoulders, at Sabbath services—with them, but not of them.” Finally, after more than thirty years of mental instability, Lizzie died at her Salt Lake City home on November 10, 1901.36

With no family to mourn her, the city’s newspapers provided generous eulogies and recalled for their readers the achievements of her youth. The Deseret News praised “the once brilliant poetess whose literary gifts placed her name among those of the best writers of the nation.” The Salt Lake Herald called her “a literary genius and born poetess, who at one time was ranked the peer of American writers, and whose work has been characterized as the spontaneous outbursts of a poetry-filled soul.” The Tribune opined that “had she retained the brilliant mind of her youth she would have found a place in the foremost ranks of American literature.” 37

The headstone on her forgotten grave in Salt Lake City Cemetery has disappeared, and the poetry that brought a heightened sensitivity to the crude frontier eludes all but the persistent seeker. Lizzie penned her own best epitaph in these haunting lines that foreshadow her mental collapse and the obscuring hand of time:

Pale, blighted flowers, the summer time
Will smile on brighter leaves;
They will not wither in their prime,
Like a young heart that grieves;
But the impulsive buds that dare
The chill of April showers,
Breathe woman-love’s low martyr prayer—
I kiss your leaves, pale flowers.38

Despite changing literary fashion, Lizzie’s best poems break the bonds of time and place to speak with a voice readers of today can appreciate. Certainly the genius of nineteenth-century Utah literature merits a permanent place in the state’s pantheon.

37 Deseret News, November 11, 1901; Salt Lake Herald, November 11, 1901; Salt Lake Tribune, November 11, 1901.
Impressive scene from Message of the Ages.

The Ritualization of Mormon History

BY DAVIS BITTON

It is easy for historians to assume that people maintain their links with the past primarily through reading histories. Without denying that written histories have enormous influence, especially those used in the schools, it should be recognized that a pervasive, ultimately more important, influence in fostering a sense of the past is ritual. Ritual is used here

Dr. Bitton is assistant historian, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, and professor of history, University of Utah.
in a broad sense to refer to the forms and symbols whose function is not primarily the communication of knowledge but rather the simplification of the past into forms that can be memorialized, celebrated, and emotionally appropriated.\(^1\) In this sense a ritualized approach to the historic past has of course been promoted, consciously or unconsciously, by churches, political parties, labor unions, and other groups. Most dramatically, nations have stimulated national consciousness by developing a pantheon of heroes, monuments, ceremonies, and standardized narratives reminiscent of morality plays in their insistent simplification.\(^2\) Although not yet studied from this point of view, Mormonism provides an instructive case-study of the ritualizing of the past by a modern group with an unusually acute self-consciousness.\(^3\)

Emile Durkheim has said, "There can be no society which does not feel the need of upholding and reaffirming at regular intervals the collective sentiments and the collective ideas which make its unity and its personality. Now this moral remaking cannot be achieved except by the means of reunions, assemblies and meetings where the individuals, being closely united to one another, reaffirm in common their common sentiments. . . ."\(^4\) It is not surprising, therefore, that the Mormons, who shared with other Christians such anniversaries and festivals as Christmas and Easter, formed their own calendar of annual celebrations. Harvey Cox described such celebrations as "a human form of play through which man appropriates an extended area of life, including the past, into his own experience."\(^5\)

\(^1\) The term is, of course, used in different ways. "The broader sense of ritual tends to prevail in my field, that is to say ritual as formalized, rule-bound behavior usually with symbolic import. Thus a political convention involves vast amounts of ritualized behavior." John L. Sorenson to Davis Bitton, January 14, 1974. Cf. Robert Middlekauff, "The Ritualization of the American Revolution," in Stanley Cohen and Lorman Ratner, eds., The Development of an American Culture (Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1970). As applied to history the concept is closely related to myth, but the emphasis of ritual is not on beliefs about the past but on behavior commemorating it.

\(^2\) Some random examples of the use of simplified history in creating a sense of group consciousness are C.E. Black, Rewriting Russian History: Soviet Interpretation of Russia's Past, 2d ed. rev. (New York, 1962); David D. Van Tassell, Recording America's Past: An Interpretation of the Development of Historical Studies in America, 1607-1884 (Chicago, 1960); Wesley Frank Craven, The Legend of the Founding Fathers (New York, 1956).

\(^3\) Richard D. Poll has said, "Apart from the veneration of certain idealized episodes from the past—the first visions, the martyrdom of the Prophet, the crossing of the plains—we have forgotten our past. And as far as such features of that past as plural marriage are concerned, some of us would appreciate not being reminded of them." Poll, "God and Man in History," Dialogue, 7 (1972), 102. In the present frame of reference I would prefer to say that Mormons, like other groups, have simplified and ritualized their past.


Almost immediately the date of April 6, the day in 1830 when the church was officially organized, was given special recognition. Apparently no particular notice was given to the date in 1831 or 1832, but in 1833 a meeting of about eighty persons took place on the Big Blue River near the western limits of Jackson County, Missouri. According to Joseph Smith's history,

> It was an early spring, and the leaves and blossoms enlivened and gratified the soul of man like a glimpse of Paradise. The day was spent in a very agreeable manner, in giving and receiving knowledge which appertained to this last kingdom—it being just 1800 years since the Savior laid down His life that man might have everlasting life, and only three since the Church had come out of the wilderness, preparatory for the last dispensation. . . . This was the first attempt made by the Church to celebrate the anniversary of her birthday, and those who professed not our faith talked about it as a strange thing.\(^6\)

There was no such “birthday” celebration in 1834, 1835, or 1836, apparently, but in 1837 a solemn assembly was held in the Kirtland Temple over several days, including April 6, when special instructions were given. In 1838, April 6 saw the beginning of a “general conference” at Far West, Missouri, to transact church business and “to celebrate the anniversary” of the church.

The following year the prophet was in jail, but in 1840 at Nauvoo, Illinois, another General Conference was held. The pattern was now established, and from then until the present the annual conference has almost always been scheduled so as to include April 6 as one of its days. Thus a need for a regular annual conference was met while at the same time commemorating the founding day.\(^7\)

Another day with some potential, it would seem, is December 23, the birthday of the Prophet Joseph Smith. Some attention has been given to it from time to time; in fact, usually some special mention of the prophet’s contribution is made on or about that day. However, the date falls so close to Christmas that more elaborate celebration is difficult. After the prophet’s death those who wanted to give him a day of special remembrance sometimes chose June 27, the date of his martyrdom in 1844.\(^8\)

---


\(^7\) A survey of the April General Conferences finds frequent references to the anniversary of the organization of the church. There were rare occasions when regular conferences were not held. See Jay R. Lowe, “A Study of the General Conferences of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1830–1901” (Ph.D. diss., Brigham Young University, 1972).

\(^8\) Charles L. Walker Diary, June 27, 1859, and *passim*, Archives Division, Historical Department, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City.
Small town celebrations of Pioneer Day generate as much enthusiasm and community participation as their big city counterparts. Above, a handcart parade assembled at Eureka in 1914. Utah State Historical Society photograph, courtesy R. R. Runnel.

This, however, occurs only about a week before July 4. Furthermore, martyrdom is not really a time of rejoicing; only, as at Easter, when it is accompanied by something unique and glorious like the Resurrection can it be celebrated happily.

For festive purposes the day that came to be the annual Mormon celebration par excellence was July 24, the official day of entry into the Salt Lake Valley in 1847. Long enough after July 4, Pioneer Day was still in the summer and seemed to be a time after sowing and before harvest when a day of celebration could be afforded. The day was not celebrated in 1848 due to the harsh conditions, but in 1849 an elaborate celebration was held. Included in the procession, for example, were:

Twelve bishops, bearing banners of their wards.
Twenty-four young ladies, dressed in white, with white scarfs on their right shoulders, and a wreath of white roses on their heads, each carrying the Bible and Book of Mormon; and one bearing a banner, "Hail to our Chieftain."
Twelve more bishops, carrying flags of their wards.
Twenty-four silver greys [older men], each having a staff, painted red on the upper part, and a branch of white ribbons fastened at the top, one of them carrying the flag.
After parading to the tune of band music, the people settled down to a round of addresses, poems, toasts, and more speeches. It was quite an extravaganza for a young, precariously established frontier community.

Besides the annual celebration, longer intervals seem to have lent themselves to commemorative purposes. On July 24, 1874, for example, a jubilee was held celebrating the twenty-seventh anniversary of the arrival of the Saints in the valley. The Sunday School prepared a program held in the Tabernacle, featuring bands, a special hymn entitled "O Lord Accept Our Jubilee," prayers, and sermons. Participating in the "grand Sunday School jubilee" were some eight or ten thousand children.

Celebrations were also held in the individual settlements throughout Mormon country. In 1874, for example, there was a celebration in Bloomington, Idaho:

At sunrise this morning silence was broken by a volley of twenty-four guns.

The people assembled at the schoolhouse at nine o'clock a.m., formed a procession and marched to martial music through the principal streets then back to the schoolhouse in the following manner—twelve fathers of Israel, twelve mothers of Israel, twelve daughters of Zion dressed in white, and twelve sons of Zion, the citizens and Sunday School children following in line.

The services consisted of an oration by James H. Hart, George Osmond read an address in behalf of the daughters of Zion, John Walker spoke in behalf of the fathers of Israel, Christian Madsen in behalf of the sons of Zion, Sister Jarvis in behalf of the mothers of Israel. A number of toasts were given.

At two o'clock all were seated at table, spread with viands, including strawberries, sugar, and cream.

At four o'clock the dance opened for the small children, and in the evening for larger children and parents.

All was joy, peace, and unity. The whole was gotten up under the auspices of the Relief Society.

Even more than the usual annual celebration or that of the twenty-fifth anniversary, the fiftieth anniversary was emphasized. There was

---

*Deseret News, July 24, 1849; B.H. Roberts, Comprehensive History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 6 vols. (Salt Lake City, 1930), 3:493-97; Frontier Guardian, September 19, 1849. See also Philip A.M. Taylor, "Pioneer Day," Millennial Star, 120 (1958), 164ff., 193ff.; and Dale Beecher, "Pioneer Day in Salt Lake City: The First Fifty Years," unpublished paper. Richard Burton, traveler to Utah in 1860, observed that the Mormons treated July 4 "with silent contempt; its honors are transferred to the 24th of July, the local Independence Day of their annus mirabilis 1847, . . ." The City of the Saints (New York, 1862), 251. He exaggerates but his basic point, the importance of July 24, is sound.

\[\text{Deseret News, July 21, 1874.} \]

\[\text{Ibid., August 5, 1874.} \]
then a sense of historical distance. While a few of the original members and leaders remained, a new generation had come to the fore. Besides, the celebration of fifty years had Old Testament precedent as a time of jubilee. Such an opportunity presented itself in 1880, fifty years from the organization of the church. Coinciding with General Conference, this date was mentioned by many of the speakers, including especially church historian Franklin D. Richards, who reviewed the history of the church during the preceding decades. He mentioned Stephen A. Douglas, Sen. Thomas Hart Benton and the Mormon Battalion, the coming of Johnston’s Army, and the fate of government officials. “In all these things we recognized the hand of the Lord,” he said, “and we should reflect on His providences and be stirred up to individual righteousness, and to battle against the drunkenness and whoredoms and various forms of evil now being introduced by our enemies for our overthrow.” Other sermons followed the same theme, as did the great prayer of Apostle Orson Pratt.  

In July 1880 the jubilee was continued in a mammoth celebration. In the parade or procession were the following:

- The surviving Pioneers of 1847 in five wagons. Portrait of Brigham Young on both sides of the first wagon with the inscriptions “Gone Before Us” and “Absent But Not Forgotten.” Above them was the “old pioneer banner,” on which were the names of all the pioneers and a picture of Joseph Smith blowing a trumpet. Also the U.S. flag.
- Surviving members of Zion’s Camp.
- Surviving members of the Mormon Battalion and wagon with “Women of the Mormon Battalion.”
- The “minute Men.”
- Wagon with representatives of the various countries of the earth. On the side were various mottoes.
- 24 couples. “The ladies looked lovely in cream-colored riding habits, with white silk caps and white feathers, and the young men presented a fine appearance in black dress suits, white neckties, and white gloves.”
- Education was represented by a car containing five ladies personifying Religion, History, Geography, Science, and Art.

The parade continued with representation of different church auxiliaries, school children, and industry of Utah. The whole procession extended over three miles. During part of this 1880 celebration Wilford Woodruff told of Brigham Young’s “this-is-the-place” statement that has since become a standard feature of pioneer celebrations.  

12 Ibid., April 14, 1880.
13 A detailed description of the procession and program is in the Deseret News, July 28, 1880. See also The Utah Pioneers: Celebration of the Entrance of the Pioneers into Great Salt Lake Valley (Salt Lake City, 1880).
American culture during the nineteenth century was characterized by a poverty of visual images or man-made artifices. This was before television, before movies, before the rise of technology that enabled magazines and newspapers to reproduce photographs in quantity. In such a context the Mormon celebration, with its slogans, its symbols, its groups of young ladies dressed in white, created a one-shot living mural in its own way dressed with *son et lumière*.

Often the celebrations paid tribute to special groups, especially the surviving members of Zion's Camp, the Mormon Battalion, and the pioneers of 1847. They were given places of honor in the processions and seated together on the stand during programs. Wilford Woodruff's keynote address in 1880 recounted the stories of these three groups who were becoming something like canonized saints in the Mormon hagiography. Reunions of such groups, like meetings of high school graduating classes, served social purposes, but they also included speeches, orations, songs, and prayers that celebrated the past. Needless to say, the past events seen through the eyes of nostalgia were simplified, romanticized, and in the broad sense of the term ritualized.

In 1855 occurred an especially important celebration, the proceedings of which were reported by stenographer J.V. Long and published in a rare pamphlet, *The First General Festival of the Renowned Mormon Battalion*. In addition to refreshment, music, and dancing, a general setting was decorated with banners, one of which showed an eagle with the word "order" on one side and "justice" on the other and "Great Salt Lake City" across the bottom. Another showed the all-seeing eye, the united hands, a representation of pioneers at the crossing of the Platte, and the motto "blessings follow sacrifice."

After toasts honoring such men as battalion leader Col. Philip St. George Cooke and Brigham Young, there were speeches by David Pettigrew, Dimick B. Huntington, Thomas S. Williams, Jedediah M. Grant, Heber C. Kimball, Brigham Young, William Hyde, James Brown, and others. Despite the differences, a common interpretation ran through their remarks: the courage and dedication of the battalion members, the conspiracy theory of the circumstances behind the muster, the providential overruling power of God, and rededication to their leaders. In a ritualized setting a sense of group consciousness was being formed by the reenactment of their history.

---

\[14\] For calling my attention to the poverty of visual images I am grateful to Robert Flanders of Southwest Missouri State University.
The Mormon Battalion Monument on the Utah State Capitol grounds was unveiled in 1927. Utah State Historical Society collections, Utah Writers Project photograph.

The Mormon Battalion story provides a good example of what typically happens as the historical event is ritualized. Without going into the complex history of the battalion, one can safely say that the decision to call it was made at least in part at the instigation of the Saints, who saw it as a means of obtaining government help for the journey west. Some of the battalion's pay did find its way back to the main body of the Saints where it doubtless was of help. As for the journey itself, there were few noteworthy events in the grand military tradition. Remarkably soon, however, this whole experience was transformed into a symbol of federal oppression, Mormon heroism, and the overruling omnipotence of God. It was told and retold in these terms; participants even started remembering it in these terms. The men of the battalion—and later their descendants—were lionized as representatives of truth in a heroic struggle. Finally, historic markers were placed and monuments were erected.

It should be emphasized that the ritualization did not require invention out of whole cloth. From the beginning some Mormons saw the venture as an onerous obligation; some did not know about the previous requests and negotiations; others who did know resented the timing of
the call and the number demanded. The ritualization was not invention; it was a selecting out of certain aspects, dramatizing them, memorializing them, and giving the whole the simplicity of a morality play.

It was but a short step from meetings of groups of survivors, like those of the Mormon Battalion, to the organization of descendants. This occurred, as might be expected, about the time the actual survivors were disappearing in the 1890s and the first two decades of the twentieth century. There were meetings of Sons and Daughters of the Pioneers in 1894 and 1898. In 1901 the Daughters of Utah Pioneers was incorporated and has continued as an active group of women ever since. Later the Sons of Utah Pioneers, especially in the 1930s, performed some of the same functions. In addition to these two important societies, there have been at different times Daughters of the Mormon Battalion (1909), Daughters of Utah Handcart Pioneers (1915), and Sons and Daughters of Indian War Veterans (1916). With the enlargement of membership in the DUP to include all female descendants of pioneers who came to Utah before the railroad in 1869, the other organizations were readily dissolved into the larger group. Such societies, analogous to the Daughters of the American Revolution, perform many functions, social and even political. But their raison d'etre is to celebrate and to honor the past not primarily on the level of scholarship but on the level of ritual commemoration and rededication.

Besides meetings and organizations celebrating past events and those who participated in them, another occasion whose ritualistic possibilities have not been overlooked is the funeral. At least for the first century of the church's existence every funeral must have included sermons eulogizing the dead and attempting to place the sacrifices of the departed one—the persecution, the trek across the plains, responses to other calls to colonize—into a meaningful historical context. This was especially true of leaders, whose funerals offered the entire Mormon community occasion for review of the past and rededication for the future. Conrad Cherry has

---

15 On Zion's Camp and Mormon Battalion reunions see Journal History of the Church, April 9, 1907, LDS Archives. On Daughters of the Mormon Battalion, July 24, 1909; on Sons and Daughters of the Blackhawk and Walker Indian War Veterans, August 17, 1916, February 10, 1922, January 16, 1923, August 13, 1924; on Daughters of Utah Handcart Pioneers, November 2, 1913, October 3, 1916; on Sons and Daughters of the Pioneers, October 29, 1898, October 31, 1898, March 24, 1894, March 30, 1933; on Daughters of Utah Pioneers, April 11, 1901, May 21, 1901, October 24, 1901, April 11, 1903. See also James T. Jakeman, Daughters of the Utah Pioneers and their Mothers (n.p., n.d.).

16 A partial impression of the interests of the Daughters of Utah Pioneers can be gained by examining the lesson materials compiled in three multi-volume sets: Heart Throbs of the West, 12 vols.; Treasures of Pioneer History, 6 vols.; and Our Pioneer Heritage, 14 vols. Un- critically compiled and inadequately documented, these works still have some value to scholars, especially for leads that can be verified elsewhere.
remarked that both Memorial Day and the funeral “are cults of the dead in which the living are united with one another, the living are united with the dead, and all are united with God and what are believed to be his purposes in history.” He sees the funerals of leaders as sacred ceremonies emphasizing America’s destiny under God, with the dead leaders portrayed as martyrs for the American cause. Funerals of Mormon leaders served the same purpose for group consciousness and frequently included allusions to the past.

A physical example of the ritualizing impulse is the historic site or shrine, instances of which can be found almost from the beginning of Mormon history. The Hill Cumorah and the Sacred Grove, sites of historic, even cosmic, events, were visited with interest by Mormon missionaries and converts who doubtless gained inspiration as they contemplated the surroundings. The Kirtland Temple, completed in 1836, also early became a kind of shrine that could be visited by Mormon pilgrims. The temple was significant on two counts: it was the scene of heavenly manifestations, and persecution forced its builders to abandon it after a short use. Enhanced by the aura of the past it became an appropriate symbol of the sacrifice of those who erected it, of the divine power manifested in it, and of the persecution that had forced the Mormons to move away. The Nauvoo Temple, an edifice with similar monumental potentialities, was destroyed by arson within two years after the Mormon exodus from Nauvoo, and hence lost most of its value as a site. In a sense the entire city of Nauvoo might be thought of as a monument, and Mormons going through the area often visited the city and reflected on the events associated with it. But there were no monuments, properly so called, during the first generation of Mormonism’s history, unless tombstones and grave markers might in some instances have been something of the kind.

The work of erecting historical monuments and markers coincided with the generation following the death of the original Mormon leaders, the rise of organizations mentioned earlier, increased prosperity, and the

Cherry, God’s New Israel, 6-7.


Two of the earliest examples of visits to Palmyra by Mormons who viewed the place, including the Hill Cumorah, with some awe are described in John S. Carter Diary, September 1833, and Jonathan H. Hale Diary, May 30, 1835, LDS Archives.
increase of leisure time and travel in the twentieth century. Even before the turn of the century signs of such memorialization could be seen. A monument was erected at Mount Pisgah in 1888, and the Brigham Young Monument was unveiled in 1897 as part of the jubilee celebration of that year. In 1905 a granite shaft was dedicated at Sharon, Vermont, Joseph Smith’s birthplace. The Sea Gull Monument, the work of Mahonri M. Young, was dedicated in 1913, the original “This Is The Place” monument in 1921, and the Mormon Battalion Monument on the Utah Capitol grounds in 1927. The 1930s and 1940s were a time of almost feverish activity in the erection of monuments and historical markers. The Daughters of Utah Pioneers placed more than three hundred of these, while at least one hundred twenty were the work of the Utah Pioneer Trails and Landmarks Association led by George Albert Smith and John D. Giles. The culmination of this monument building was reached in 1947, the centennial year, with the dedication of the new “This Is The
Place” Monument. The work did not cease, however, and attention to such recognition of historical sites has continued.20

One activity in the making of historical sites that deserves mention is the work of restoration—the attempt to return homes and buildings to their original appearance. The groundwork for such restorations was laid by the acquisition of important pieces of property and some early efforts in Manchester, Liberty Jail, and Utah. Perhaps because of the rise of historical preservation as a discipline—connected with the success of Colonial Williamsburg—and perhaps because of the need of fairly large expenditures, it was not until after midcentury and mainly in the 1960s that the restoration of the Beehive House and the Lion House in Salt Lake City and, even more impressive, the work of Nauvoo Restoration, Inc., at Nauvoo showed what could be done in restoring the physical surroundings of the past.

Another powerful means of capturing and monumentalizing the historic past was through visual representation—in monuments, bas-reliefs, stained-glass windows, paintings, and even photographs. One aspect of the ritualizing process involved commissioning portraits of the leaders of the past: Joseph Smith, Brigham Young, Heber C. Kimball, and the other leaders of the first generation. D. Rogers, W.W. Major, Dan Weggeland, George M. Ottinger, and others created heroic portraits, the equivalents of equestrian statues on canvas. Daguerreotypes and engravings became important parts of the idealization: for example, the great engravings by Frederick Piercy of the Mormon leaders in the 1850s. Beautiful metal engravings are found later in the century of many of the leaders.21 In 1885 Charles W. Carter copied a daguerreotype of a painting of Joseph Smith, made prints which were heavily retouched by the artist Dan Weggeland—and then rephotographed, copyrighted, and distributed the “portrait.” Quite unlike the profile portrait community leaders of the 1850s considered authentic, the Carter portrait was preferred by most

20 Larry C. Porter, “Twentieth Century Monuments to Mormonism,” unpublished paper, LDS Archives. Marilyn Seifert and Albert Zobell, LDS Historical Department, helped supply information on monuments and organizations.


people. It was "aesthetically superior," closer to a recognizable standard of male attractiveness. The Carter portrait enjoyed a wide distribution and was often framed and hung in homes and ward houses. Each of these works had its own tradition, of course, and a subject matter by no means confined to history, but each contributed to the ritualization by transforming events and personalities of the past into something fixed, heightened, and to a greater or lesser degree standardized.

The most powerful contribution of art to the ritualization process came when events were frozen into graphic scenes, often conveying tremendous emotion, that could be visualized by successive generations. Quite early visual representations of the assassination of Joseph Smith and other dramatic episodes were made. The Charles Mackay history was full of such drawings, as, for example, was Fanny Stenhouses's *Tell It All*, which went through several editions in the 1870s and 1880s. For the Mormon audience, however, the two great creators of the image were Philo Dibble and C.C.A. Christensen. As early as 1847 Dibble, an amateur, self-taught painter, had produced scenes of the events that he showed on many occasions through the second half of the nineteenth century. These enjoyed a kind of official endorsement. Other speakers used pictures to supplement their lectures about Mormon history. The most skilled of these early artists was Christensen who by 1878 had completed eight huge canvases of past scenes and later added to them. Their impact is suggested by the following:

... in 1878, he had sewn the first group of eight together, rolled them on a long wooden pole and placed the whole package in his wagon. Then, using the pictures as illustrations for a lecture on Mormon history, he drove through the Utah country advertising his appearance as a lecturer on the Mormon story. In 1888 it was reported that nineteen paintings were being exhibited in Sanpete County and other areas in Utah. For Christen-

---

22 Information supplied by Catherine Gilmore, LDS Archives.
24 "I spent a part of the day in council with the Presidency and others upon the subject of the Paintings got up by Philo Dibble, the work was finally sanctioned by the Presidency & Twelve who signed their names to it." Wilford Woodruff Diary, March 1847, LDS Archives. See also *Millennial Star*, 11 (1848), 11–12. Dibble also had casts of Joseph and Hyrum Smith's death masks which he exhibited. In the 1880s he contracted with an artist to make copies for sale. Information supplied by Catherine Gilmore.
25 Others giving "panoramic" lectures were a Brother Kirkham on the Book of Mormon and a Brother Smith on the seven wonders of the world. George Goddard Diary, March 4, 1884 and February 9, 1885, LDS Archives. Dealing specifically with Mormon history were the lectures of Edward Stevenson. Edward Stevenson Diary, *passim*, microfilm, LDS Archives. Three pictures used by Edward Stevenson in his illustrated lectures are reproduced in Joseph Grant Stevenson, "The Life of Edward Stevenson" (M.A. thesis, Brigham Young University, 1955), 185.
sen's lectures, the roll of paintings was hung over loops of rope suspended from portable tripods, and the individual scenes were rolled out as he spoke.26

In later generations, the process culminated in panoramic works created for the monuments—Mahonri Young's "This Is The Place" Monument in 1947; Torleif Knaphus's work, The Handcart Pioneers, etc.—or in murals, such as those by Lynn Fausett. Branching out, the church presented standardized, "prettified" versions of history through movies produced by the BYU Motion Picture Studio. Working powerfully in the same direction were graphic arts as mediated by manuals, official periodicals, and brochures prepared by public relations firms. By midcentury the visual representations of Mormon history numbered in the thousands—all contributing to the process of ritualization by establishing a sense of the past that was emotional, appropriatable, and not primarily concerned with accuracy. Accurate or inaccurate, it was certainly

selective. There are, for example, no marble monuments to polygamy. If not literally excised from all church publications, polygamy was not among the past achievements deemed worth memorializing.

Valuable as they were, pictures and monuments were not enough. Words, too, were required to tell the mighty deeds of God's prophets and missionaries "in the early days" of the church. In sermons, in songs, in poems such mighty men were celebrated. Then, extending over several decades, came the publication of autobiographical and biographical—actually hagiographical—literature of the Mormons. This process began fairly early, at least with the publication in *Times and Seasons* of Joseph Smith's history, and the process has continued to the present. But the greatest single publication effort in this direction was originated by George Q. Cannon and Sons in the 1880s and 1890s with the publication of the Faith Promoting Series, volumes which had in common their celebration of personal adventure and faith-promoting experiences. The younger generation growing up in Mormondom had heroes aplenty in the Wilford Woodruff watched over by providence, in the Jacob Hamblin, missionary to the Indians, and in others whose lives were being written for posterity. One can detect something of the same impulse in the effort to publish reference works listing pioneers and prominent men. These were the founding fathers.

In addition to published biographies of this kind there were stories in the oral tradition, especially faith-promoting incidents or apocryphal stories somehow connected with the early prophets; sermons; orations, the Mormon equivalent of Independence Day orations; and plaques on monuments. All referred verbally to the past for the basic purpose of commemoration and are part of the ritualization of Mormon history.

**Notes:**


28 There were seventeen volumes in the Faith Promoting Series, 1879–1915. Recent equivalents abound. See especially Leon R. Hartshorn, *Classic Stories from the Lives of Our Prophets* (Salt Lake City, 1971) and his other compilations. The "monumentalizing" of leading men and women by means of dignified biographical compilations is seen, for example, in Frank Eshom, *Pioneers and Prominent Men of Utah* (Salt Lake City, 1913); Andrew Jenson, *LDS Biographical Encyclopedia*, 4 vols. (Salt Lake City, 1901–36); Orson F. Whitney, *History of Utah*, 4 vols. (Salt Lake City, 1892–1904); and Edward W. Tullidge, *History of Salt Lake City* (Salt Lake City, 1886). Some of these works, like similar compilations for other areas even down to the present, were publishers' enterprises based partially on advance subscription of those whose names were included. See *Portrait, Genealogical and Biographical Record of the State of Utah* (Chicago, 1902); and *Men of Affairs in the State of Utah* (Salt Lake City, 1914).


30 An amusing anecdote about the invention of a quotation to go on a monument is recounted by Eugene E. Campbell, "Brigham Young's Outer Cordon: A Reappraisal," *Utah Historical Quarterly*, 41 (Summer 1973), 226–27.
Combining the verbal and the visual were pageants: for example, the 1930 production of *The Message of the Ages* with a "poetical text" by Bertha A. Kleinman. Perhaps "historical" is the wrong word to describe such a work, but it unquestionably set forth simplified images about the past. After reviewing the different biblical dispensations the pageant reached its great culmination in a series of episodes on the restoration. Kirtland, Nauvoo, the martyrdom, the exodus to the Great Basin—the key scenes were all sharply etched. After the death of Joseph Smith an important scene was given in the following words:

So fell Elijah’s mantle from the skies,
So Priesthood girded Israel’s newer Seer,
A Moses to emblaze the sunset trail,
A Joshua to lead his people there:
Of such as this the olden Exodus,
That routed teeming legions in a night,
Of such as this the migratory surge
That swept the Pilgrims over unknown seas;
Of such the consummations of the past—
The message of the ages to inscribe.

The organ played a brief interlude on the theme from "Come, Come Ye Saints," after which the reader proclaimed:

List! the Marseillaise of the Latter Days
At the battle line of toil,
Where sang they litany of praise
From the heart of the stubborn soil . . .

After getting the Saints established in the tops of the mountains the pageant continued with tableaus depicting home, church, education, work, play, and the coming of the nations. The work concluded with a ringing "praise for the centennary of truth."

A similar pageant was presented in 1947, another centennial year. Pageant-like in some ways, too, are Grace Johnson’s *The Mormon Miracle*, presented annually at Manti, and Roland Parry’s *All Faces West*, frequently presented in Ogden. The westward trek is the subject of Crawford Gates’s and Arnold Sundgaard’s *Promised Valley*, which combines words and music in the manner of Rogers and Hammerstein. Presented first at the 1947 centennial, *Promised Valley* has been repeated every year and most recently has been shown, in shortened form, free to tourists. These productions are all vehicles for perpetuating a romanticized, ritualized version of the Mormon past.31

31 Historical pageants include *The Message of the Ages: A Sacred Pageant Commemorating the One Hundredth Anniversary of the Organization of the Church of Jesus Christ of
Ritualization of Mormon History

A dramatic episode found in *Promised Valley*, and most of the other pageants and plays, is that of the crickets and the seagulls. This famous miracle, which every Mormon child learns at Primary or Sunday School if not at his mother’s knee, is a classic example of how ritualization of history works. Although William G. Hartley has demonstrated that some contemporaries did not view the incident as particularly providential, at least if we are to judge from their diaries, it would be idle to deny the historicity of the event—that is, there were crickets, and seagulls did devour them.\(^{32}\) Of course crickets came on many other occasions, and at other times seagulls or other birds must have helped to fight the invading hordes. The point here is not the event itself but what the people did with it in later years. Seized upon as a useful symbol of the struggle of darkness against light, of the triumph of the latter, and of God’s providential care over his Saints, the incident was simplified, dramatized, and commemorated. It was told and retold to successive generations of Mormon children. It was reenacted in pageant and drama. It was pictured in paintings, engravings, journalistic art, and finally in the famous monument to the seagull on Temple Square. All of this constitutes the process of ritualization.

Whether the Mormons developed their ritualized past more quickly than similar groups is unknown, but clearly the whole process was carried out with a cumulative intensity. One reason was doubtless the need for group cohesion in the face of ridicule and persecution. New converts, as part of their assimilation into the body of the faithful, could easily master the simplified history and accept it as their own.\(^{33}\) If one of the reasons for the creation of a “mythic history” by early Americans was, as Major Wilson believes, their sense of being “orphans in time and space,” the


\(^{33}\) Jan Shipps’s observation is relevant. A friend, she writes, “told me of having heard a new convert describe, at meeting the evening before, the mobbings and persecutions at Kirtland, Far West, Nauvoo, and of how this convert’s account failed to make any reference to the possibility that the Saints might have been in some measure responsible for the way they were treated. . . . The convert’s rehearsal of this highly ritualized version of Mormon history is an integral part of the process of his becoming a Mormon, acquiring an identity as a Latter-day Saint—of taking the Mormon heritage as his own. It seems to me that what an experience like this does for the individual convert, the ritualization of Mormon history has done for the entire Mormon community—it has helped them acquire an identity and pride in that identity.” Jan Shipps to Davis Bitton, January 25, 1974.
Mormons had the same need in their own new communities. "Any people in a new land," wrote Wallace Stegner, "may be pardoned for being solicitous about their history: they create it, in a sense, by remembering it." More importantly, perhaps, the Mormons had their own special problems of orphanage. Cut adrift from the moorings of orthodox Christianity and even, at times, from a sense of belonging to the American nation, they needed ritualistic supports for their legitimacy. Robert Flanders has observed that the ritual incantations of restoration, priesthood authority, unity of the faith, patriotism, etc. may be, in part, cases of protesting too much. In any event, the value of a standardized, moralized sense of the past in helping the Mormons to survive their long identity crisis is unmistakable.

Significantly the rituals have tended to focus on the "centrist nucleus" by giving attention to people and events near the center. In this way cohesion of the group is enhanced, the lines of traditional identity maintained. Selecting only those events clearly related to the doings of the hierarchy, however elitist it appears, may be unavoidable, just as national heroes are usually figures high in the government or national military circles. Naturally some regional and local deemphasis, some distortion, some loss of richness and variety result. As Mormonism entered its period of outward expansion after World War II there was bound to be some tension between the need to establish a sense of Mormon identity and the desire to respect local traditions or at least to avoid imposing Wasatch Front mores—the covered wagons of the July 24 parades, for example—in places like Japan and Bolivia. Perhaps ritualization of the religiously significant as opposed to the events of Mormon history in America will accomplish the purpose.

Ritualized history is not satisfactory for all purposes. By definition it is simplified. It celebrates that which is celebratable, ignoring much of the past. Those who probe more deeply are bound to discover that men of the past were not one dimensional and, more essentially, that the past was not that simple. Historians have a duty to criticize and correct inaccurate, inadequate, or oversimplified versions of the past. Part of


36 A handbook of potentially celebratable events is Andrew Jenson, Church Chronology: A Record of Important Events, 2d ed. (Salt Lake City, 1899).
their social role consists of going over the record more thoroughly than the average person can do, subjecting each other's scholarship to scrutiny and criticism, and producing works of richness and complexity. Students in history classes, especially as they advance in years and experience, will hopefully learn a history that rings true. In this spirit, as the state approaches the great bicentennial of our national history and, soon after, the sesquicentennial of the Mormon church, historians can help to discourage celebration of the patently false or absurdly puerile. But it would be pedantic of historians to ridicule all ritualization of the past. The sense of perspective which the study of history enhances should enable them to take the ritualistic references in stride, recognizing their inevitability and functional value. For most of us will possess our history ritualistically or not possess it at all.

---

**Street Minstrels.**—The first band of professional wandering minstrels ever seen in this Territory made its appearance in our streets on Monday last. It consists of four boys, said to be recently from Italy,—two playing harps and two, violins. This is one of the earliest instalments of genuine "civilization" imported since the completion of the railway. We may, after a while, be troubled with the hand organ and monkey nuisance, but we sincerely hope not. We have, hitherto, enjoyed complete immunity from professional beggars, ballad singers, organ and hurdy-gurdy grinders, and all specimens of the vagrant professions, and we hope that Utah may never become at all a promising field for these parasitical excrecescences of modern, mis-named civilization." (Deseret News, June 2, 1869.)
Charles C. Rich, Mormon apostle, general, and colonizer, was a very private man, even taciturn, revealing precious little in his journal and letters about his personal concerns. His simple obedience to his faith and to his religious superiors took him from Nauvoo, where he was chief military officer, to Utah, where he resumed that role in the Utah War. But it did not stop there. He was asked by Brigham Young to lead a colonizing effort to San Bernardino, California, where he spent seven years. Next he was called to preside over the European mission, where he spent two years, managing some sight-seeing on the side. Approaching rebellion only once, he told Young he would rather not colonize the cold Bear Lake valley in northern Utah and southern Idaho. Yet it was there that he died at age seventy-five after a debilitating stroke.

Leonard J. Arrington is perhaps Utah's most prolific and competent historian. In this fascinating biography, the initial volume in a series called "Studies in Mormon History," he has drawn mostly from original source materials available in the LDS church archives and from the Rich family. Arrington once stressed the need for Mormon historians to tell the truth about their past. "This includes the failures as well as the achievements, the weaknesses as well as the strengths, the individual derelictions, as well as the heroism and self-sacrifice."

In treating Mormon history itself, he has achieved remarkable success, presenting more revealing material about the pioneers, including their warts, than about Rich. For instance, few readers may realize that the municipal council in early Salt Lake Valley ordered people stripped and whipped for such offenses as stealing a lariat. Moreover, the pioneers' imperfections were striking. When the apostles urged them to sacrifice "for the general good" by giving money and provisions for the advance company going west, they resisted. When the bishop attempted to care for the needy in the Salt Lake Valley by requesting that persons with surplus donate it, the well-to-do Saints balked and tried to use the plan for their own gain. These stories need telling, and Arrington does so with admirable objectivity.

Polygamy appears as a necessity of the frontier, with evidence of devotion but not of love in a life that constantly took Rich away from his six wives and fifty-one children. That does not mean there were not normal concerns and feelings. For instance, in a letter scolding Eliza for failure to write, Rich sarcastically commented, "I think if I had only one or two more wives, I would never hear from home at all." Arrington's concise conclusion is well supported by his evidence—that polygamy endured because women were concerned first with physical survival and only secondarily with a close examination of their marital status.

Unfortunately, Rich is not revealed in great depth, partly because of his laconic...
nature and perhaps partly because the book's research and publication were financed by his grandson, Roland Rich Woolley. This is much more than a typical "authorized biography," but there is a missing critical edge where Rich is concerned, and he appears as a man with essentially no weaknesses. The work suffers some from misinterpretation, when Arrington talks of "well known anti-slavery sentiments of the Mormons," and when he incorrectly labels the Mormon article, "Free People of Color," in the *Evening and the Morning Star* (1883) as "anti-slavery." Actually, the evidence suggests that Mormons were initially pro-slavery and that slavery was compatible with their attitudes toward Negro potential. By accepting the basic assumptions of Missourians who were worried that Mormons were tampering with their slaves, Arrington falls into error. As a minor irritant to the scholar, he occasionally footnotes his own *Great Basin Kingdom* instead of giving the original citation; and several times he cites as his source the previous (1936) biography of Rich by John Henry Evans. Yet, taken in perspective, this is an impressive scholarly achievement and a refreshing contribution to Mormon and western history.

DENNIS L. LYTHGOE

*Associate Professor of History*

*Massachusetts State College at Bridgewater*


This is an excellent little volume. Clearly written, interpretive, easy to understand, and realistic in its approach, it is also relevant to the economic problems Utah faces today. It should be widely read.

Arrington and Alexander, a pairing well known to readers of this journal, divide the era from 1896 to 1929 into three periods. The first, from statehood to 1910, is evaluated by Arrington and focuses on the commercialization of Utah's economy in its course of "Americanization." In this period economic leadership passed from the LDS church to outside entrepreneurs and emerging technocrats. It is the beginning of the end of Mormonism as a distinctive economic institution as the focus shifts to mining, stock raising, and railroads. The second period, 1910–18, is evaluated by Alexander and emphasizes prosperity. Although agriculture was still the mainstay of Utah's economy and farm acreage increased from 3.4 to 5.0 million acres—largely owing to the war-generated demand of the beet sugar industry—manufacturing grew even faster, paced by consolidation in the copper sector. These were good times, but as Alexander shows in his following essay, the prosperity of Utahns during the 1910–20 decade was as precarious as national prosperity was a decade later. The main point of the final essay is that Utah experienced depression a decade earlier than the rest of the nation because the unnatural and brief demands of World War I encouraged the shifting of resources into marginal enterprises which could not be sustained after the 1920–21 depression. Hardest hit was agriculture. The key lesson is that isolated areas ought to resist war-stimulated booms for more gradual and orderly development. It is a lesson needing reiteration today.

JAMES L. CLAYTON

*Professor of History*

*University of Utah*
Daniel Tyler has selected for publication ten papers from among those presented at Colorado State University's First Western History Conference in August 1972. They are representative of the broad spectrum of interests and some of the new views which western history has begun to encompass in recent years. The presentations fall into several categories, including preservation, conservation, the American Indian, archival sources, Europeans view the West, and women in the West.

In the lead article Robert M. Utley traces the genesis of the national park idea back to the 1872 reservation of Yellowstone and the subsequent verbalization of that concept by an army engineer turned fur-trade historian, Hiram M. Chittenden. The reservation of natural, historical, recreational, and cultural parks and their inclusion within the national park system is seen as a form of historic preservation.

Two articles of particular interest to historians of Colorado are the offerings of John Porter Bloom and Myra Ellen Jenkins. Dr. Bloom examines the records housed in the National Archives and the regional records centers applicable to the territorial period of Colorado's history, while Dr. Jenkins demands that historians do not ignore the substantial amount of Spanish and Mexican records pertinent to the southeastern portion of that state.

Clyde W. Dollar and Joseph R. Cash agree that American Indian history needs to be written from a more balanced perspective than it has been in the past but disagree somewhat as to the use of oral testimony as a means of presenting the Indian point of view. Noting that history has a peculiar meaning among the Indians, Dollar points out that the Brule Sioux use oral testimony primarily as a means of personal entertainment and cultural edification. Accordingly, he fears that the acceptance of this concept of history will erode professional standards of historical accuracy and that racially oriented histories will continue to be written. Cash, while admitting oral history will never replace the traditional forms of historical research, suggests that historians use this technique to supplement and add new dimensions to their presentation of Indian history. He argues that many of the standard sources used in the past can be just as ethnocentric as Dollar fears the Indian view to be.

In another article Philip D. Thomas sees the disappearance of the bison from the American landscape as one aspect of the country's Manifest Destiny. It is his contention that a lethargic legislature and an apathetic public are to blame for the near extinction of that great animal.

David H. Miller discusses the reflections of two German tourists, Duke Paul von Württemberg and Balduin Möllhausen, as they traveled the Oregon Trail together in 1851. Von Württemberg was a serious scientist who remains a rather enigmatic figure to this day, while Möllhausen was a romantic adventurer who is best remembered in his country as author of nearly a hundred novels based upon his personal experiences in the West. Miller finds Möllhausen's diaries and art work to be important contributions to Americana, helping us to better understand the origins of a romanticized view of the American West.

T. A. Larson analyzes some of the half-truths and myths that have grown up in answer to why it was the West that led in the granting of suffrage to women. While several of the half-truths have some merit, Larson concludes that much of the credit for the West's leadership is due to individuals such as Abigail
Scott Duniway of Oregon and Helen Reynolds of Colorado.

No single contribution makes this small volume an indispensable addition to one's library, but readers will find some lively prose and a good look at some of the many directions historians are moving in their quest to present a more complete and accurate history of the American West.

JOHN D. SYLVESTER
Phoenix, Arizona


Historians need to be reminded of the importance of continued study of secondary figures in American political history. Too often scholars concentrate their attention on presidents or party leaders and overlook the significance of persons who play lesser roles on the national stage. Men of second-rank status frequently give one a better perspective on the mood of an era than politicians who stand above and dominate all others. We still need good books on many persons who have not been—and will not be—admitted to the pantheon reserved for our most well-known leaders.

F. Ross Peterson's study of Glen Taylor fills this kind of need. His volume, a revision of his doctoral dissertation at Washington State University, deals primarily with Taylor's single term (1945-51) as U.S. senator from Idaho. Though Peterson adds useful chapters on Taylor's life before and after his stint in Washington, his monograph centers on Taylor's role as a political maverick during the administration of President Truman. The author's major contention is that Taylor was a man of courage, idealism, and foresight who confronted controversial issues at least ten years and sometimes twenty years before many other politicians. In addition, Taylor asked questions, particularly about American foreign policy during the Cold War years, that were not raised again until by revisionist historians during the last ten years.

Peterson gives Taylor high marks for his championing of civil rights, the Columbia Valley Authority, his fight against the draft, and his willingness to hold to his ideas even when such actions might lead to his defeat at the polls. The author's discussion of Taylor's decision to join Henry A. Wallace on the Progressive ticket in 1948 is full and objective. Throughout the book, in fact, Peterson's point of view is balanced and surprisingly calm considering the controversial man and ideas he deals with.

Some readers will wish, however, that this helpful book were even stronger. A more exacting editorial pen would have eliminated loose syntax, faulty diction, repetitious phrasing, and too many typographical errors. Although the author makes extensive use of newspapers and government documents, he could have interviewed more persons acquainted with Taylor's political career, and he might have utilized more of the available manuscript collections of Taylor's colleagues. Several items listed in the bibliography as helpful or useful are not cited in the footnotes. Peterson was hamstrung in not having a major Taylor manuscript collection available to him (Taylor is writing his autobiography and reluctant to open his papers); but, on the other hand, he places too much emphasis on one interview with Taylor, which he cites more than twenty-five times. In addition, little oral history work seems to have been done after 1967-68.
Prophet without Honor is a significant book. It makes important contributions toward an understanding of western politics and politicians. And it is now the best published work available on post-1940 Idaho history. In addition, the book traces the rise of a colorful politician, who for a short period of time, seemed on the verge of influencing national politics. With twenty-five years of hindsight we can see that Taylor was indeed a man of remarkable vision. Had he been a more astute politician and keener student of American political practices, he might have made a larger impact on his era and subsequent decades.

RICHARD W. ETULAIN
Associate Professor of History
Idaho State University
Pocatello

Peter Skene Ogden and the Hudson’s Bay Company. By GLORIA GRIFFEN CLINE.
(Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1974. xvi + 279 pp. $8.95.)

The Ogdens, an American colonial family of several generations and some distinction, were split by the American Revolution. Peter Skene Ogden’s father and grandfather were Loyalists who removed to Canada, and he was born in Quebec in 1790. Attracted to the fur trade rather than the law, he worked for Northwest Company, 1810-21, arriving on the Columbia River in 1817. When his company was absorbed by the Hudson’s Bay Company in 1821, Ogden was excluded from employment; but, by a trip to England, he was able to reverse this decision.

From 1823 to 1829 he competed successfully with American trappers in the Snake River country, visiting the Great Salt Lake, discovering the Humboldt River, and trapping the great interior valleys of California. He was highly regarded by Dr. John McLoughlin and was able to overcome an early adverse judgment by Sir George Simpson.

From 1830 to 1835 Ogden was engaged in countering the Russian American Fur Company’s advance from Alaska. He twice visited von Wrangel at Sitka and succeeded in transferring the Russian problem to the British government for diplomatic settlement. The years 1835–44 were spent in charge of the company’s operations in New Caledonia, as British Columbia was then called. He made an annual trip to Fort Vancouver during these years.

Ogden visited relatives in Montreal in 1844 and took a favorite niece with him on a trip to England. He became saddled with the task of cooperating with Warre and Vavasour in their mission to save some portion of the Oregon coast for Britain, a task he could have tackled alone with more chance of success. Unlike McLoughlin, he did not become an American citizen after the Oregon Treaty of 1846. He was in charge of the company’s affairs in American territory and played the part of “a good Samaritan” after the Whitman Massacre. His last years were spent in working with James Douglas to improve the company’s position on the Pacific Coast. He died rather suddenly, after his return from an exhausting trip to Montreal, New York, and Washington in 1854.

Ogden is fortunate in his biographer, who lived to complete her work but not to see it published. After many years of patient investigation of Ogden’s life in the records of the Hudson’s Bay Company and many scattered primary sources, the author was able to put together a well written and well organized account depicting Ogden sympathetically but fairly. The details chosen from his diaries and letters illuminate the work. His financial and family affairs are
Book Reviews and Notices

91

treated in detail, adding much interest to the book. There are some fine illustrations and several maps although one is lacking for the Russian period where it is badly needed. The question of Ogden's authorship of Traits of American Indian Life and Character (London, 1853) is not investigated, although some use is made of the work. The bibliography is impressively complete, including the standard Russian source in translation. The work is a fine tribute to a remarkable mountain man and a fitting memorial to an industrious researcher and talented historian.

HARVEY L. CARTER
Professor Emeritus of History
Colorado College
Colorado Springs


The story of "man's inhumanity to man" and the various forms that it takes has been the subject of a considerable amount of literature. Some authors attempt to rationalize human behavior while others have had a tendency to pontificate on the subject in lofty and detached terms. Still others make serious attempts to try and explain man's propensity for doing harm to others. Mr. Hollon has attempted to trace the violence on the American frontier from earliest colonial settlements to the twentieth century. It is obvious that such a time span allows only a general treatment.

There are both opportunities and hazards to such a treatment. One of the latter involves making generalizations that are, at times, very questionable. A couple of examples may serve as a point. Mr. Hollon, in discussing the Proclamation of 1763, states that "the policy guaranteed wholesale defiance of authority." Such a statement is simply not justified by the historical data available. At another point the statement is made that "... after a century and a half of lawbreaking following the establishment of Jamestown and Plymouth, disrespect for law as law was fully developed in the colonies." The statement is a serious oversimplification and is much too broad a generalization. There are numerous other examples throughout the work that are, intended or not, too sweeping in their scope and much too broad in their implications.

Other hazards of generalized treatments lie in the area of factual data. Perhaps it is in the nit-picking category but there are a few examples in the work where a little closer attention to details would have helped the general tone of historical credibility. One such involves the statement regarding the death of Butch Cassidy. Mr. Hollon has the same version as the movie—but in a recent publication the desperado's sister (who is still living) says that he returned to the United States and lived many years and died a nonviolent death. She says the place of his burial is a family secret.

Another minor example (perhaps an inadvertent error) involves the name of the Mormon church. It is not the Church of the Latter Day Saints. The most important part of the title is missing and should read the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints.

Mr. Hollon quotes Thomas J. Dimsdale as an authority on the vigilantes of Montana, since Mr. Dimsdale was living in Virginia City at the time of much of the violence there. There is at least one work which suggests that Mr. Dimsdale was somewhat less than an objective observer of the scene. (See Banditti of the Rocky Mountains and Vigilance Committee in Idaho, Minneapolis: Ross & Haines, Inc., 1964.)
Nevertheless, Mr. Hollon has made an important and commendable contribution to the literature in this particular field. His concluding chapter, "The Other Side of the Coin," is excellent. He draws back from some of the moderate excesses of his earlier narrative and puts the entire picture of violence in frontier America into a proper and accurate perspective. He cites important examples to show how certain historical figures and events have become stereotyped but that such simplistic approaches do not represent a balanced, or indeed true, picture. I especially like one sentence he uses: "Most frontier people were friendly, hard working, and fairminded. But these simple virtues, along with hardships, and general boredom, do not make good materials for exciting narrative."

I think that in that one sentence he has captured a very honest and correct generalization. To continue the theme he states, "Everything considered, it is miraculous that the last and largest frontier region in the United States was settled in as orderly a fashion as it was." I agree.

BARTON C. OLSEN
Associate Professor of History
California Polytechnic State University
San Luis Obispo


Workers organize into labor unions when they feel a loss of contact with those who control their economic lives. The men employed on the western mining frontier found this happening to them when the industry shifted from individualized placer mining to corporate control of the vein or quartz mining. Thus as the mining industry of the Far West became more and more like the industries of the settled East, the workers reacted in the same way as did their eastern comrades—they organized labor unions. Due to the fact that in the vast area of the West between the Great Plains and the Great Valley of California metal mining was the primary economic activity (and the first western industry to fall to corporate capitalism), it was only natural that the metal miners organized first and that their organizations were the most important of all frontier labor unions.

The book is a survey of these unions from their first appearance on the Comstock in 1863 to the organization of the Western Federation of Miners in Butte in 1893. While not overlooking the confrontation and violence of the metal miners' unions, Mr. Lingenfelter's goal is to "explore the relationship between the movement and the industrialization of the mines which sparked it, to follow the development of its organization, its activities and its goals, and . . . to glimpse a bit of the hardrock miner's life and aspirations," those aspects of unions which were the most important for the miner himself.

The author is obviously sympathetic to the plight of the miners who toiled in the heat and darkness of the mine while they faced the constant, almost inevitable, threat of incapacitation or death. He condemns the racism of the miners that was manifested in their anti-Chinese activities. Mr. Lingenfelter's explanation of the violence associated with miners' unions is that violence was the exception, and when it did occur it followed the pattern found in eastern labor troubles, that is, it was provoked by management; it did not follow the pattern of classical frontier violence. He,
therefore, gives additional support to Dubofsky's work on the origins of western working-class radicalism.

The geographical mobility of the men working in the mines explains the spread of miners' unions throughout the West. The patterns of operation and constitutions of the unions established on the Comstock at Gold Hill and Virginia City were copied almost verbatim by later organizations including the Western Federation of Miners. Unfortunately the reasonableness of the Comstock miners and owners was not transferred as easily.

The collapse of silver prices in the 1880s and early 1890s was the primary reason for the disruption of the miners' labor movement that led to the organization of the Western Federation of Miners. The problem of silver prices severely affected the miners' unions because this was the metal most of the miners were involved in digging from the earth; at this time gold had declined to a relatively minor position and the base metals had not achieved prominence. The decline in silver and the fact that Utah's Mormons gave an outside source of labor are the causes given for the general lack of successful organization in Utah.

Mr. Lingenfelter has given us a valuable contribution to western labor history—a field that has been generally overlooked—in addition to enlarging our understanding of the mining frontier as a whole. The *Hardrock Miners* also serves as an important and satisfying introduction to the ideas and actions that came to fruition in the Western Federation of Miners.

JOHN E. BRINLEY, JR.
Assistant Professor of Social Science
Boston University
Boston, Massachusetts


The purpose of this book is to bring together into one place a brief history of U.S. policy toward Indians for the use of students, government employees, and the general reader. Dr. Tyler, a scholar who has done extensive research on Indian history and federal policy, has produced an authoritative and timely account to fill a gap in Native American studies particularly, and U.S. history in general.

The book is a study of policy in and of itself, spanning the period from the time of the so-called discovery to the early 1970s. A few objectives of Indian policy run throughout the whole experience of the U.S.; other objectives were short-range and short-lived. Some readers may carp at the fact that more space is devoted to the period after 1930 than to the previous years but one of Professor Tyler's objectives was to show the effect of policy on existing Indians of the U.S.—Indians who live and breathe and who have become people and societies, instead of statistics, to many historians in the past few years. Beginning with a good definition of Indian policy, the author gives a brief but useful historical interpretation of the experience with Indians of the Spanish, French, Dutch, and English. He then details the U.S. policies regarding treaties, Indian trade, the factory system, removal reservations, and allotments before explaining the Indian Reorganization Act and its effects up to "termination" and the new ideals which are guiding principles today.

All three branches of government have had a hand in determining Indian policy, although the constitutional power is vested in Congress, the branch most susceptible to pressure. U.S. history is partly
a history of westward expansion, and the Indian had to be considered almost every step of the way—as people on the frontier wanted for their personal use the land and natural resources possessed by Indians. Conflict of cultures constituted a large portion of the history of this country throughout the nineteenth century, and the dominant culture succeeded in extinguishing both the “external” and, to a large extent, the “internal” sovereignty of Indian tribes. Tyler details how these sovereignties were lost and how the policy of attempted assimilation has failed and given way to new goals and self-determination in the 1970s.

In addition to containing a history of Indian policy, this book has a very useful chronology of dates significant in the development of Indian policy and a table of administrators of U.S. policy from 1789 to the present. The bibliography is extensive and useful. The maps are generally too simple for the expert but useful for the general reader. Many photographs add to the attractiveness of the volume.

All in all, this reviewer finds little to criticize about the work, unless one wants to carp at innumerable split infinitives. The objectives as set forth have been met more than adequately and the book should be useful to people in many different disciplines who deal with Indians of the United States.

The B.I.A. has done a valuable service in commissioning this work as well as the previously published volume by Theodore W. Taylor, The States and Their Indian Citizens (1972).

ROBERT W. DELANEY
Director
Center of Southwest Studies
Fort Lewis College
Durango, Colorado


Thomas H. Leforge, born in Ohio in 1850, moved to what is now Montana when he was nineteen. There he attached himself to a local band of Crow Indians and finally converted fully to Indian life with his marriage to a young Crow woman. Over the next twenty years he lived for the most part as a Crow, frequently employed by the local Indian agency as an interpreter, guide, or scout. Then he tried living as a white man until 1907, when he returned to the reservation. In his later years he liked to recount the events of his life. The reservation physician, Dr. Thomas B. Marquis, listened to Leforge’s stories and believed that they should be recorded. Memoirs of a White Crow Indian, originally issued in 1928, is the chronological, pieced-together result of what he heard.

This book is a duplicate reprinting of the original, except for the addition of an informative fifteen-page introduction by Joseph Medicine Crow and Herman J. Viola. Despite the flat-footed writing style of Marquis and his frequent assumption that much of what he implies, but does not explain, is common knowledge, the personalized account of Leforge’s life makes interesting reading. The introduction rightly claims that the narrative provides “remarkable insights” into Crow history and culture. Of particular anthropological value are Leforge’s observations on Crow tribal government, the sun dance, and other elements of the tribe’s culture. Although the historical value of the work is occasionally compromised by the inexactitude of Leforge’s memory (or Marquis’s writing) concerning places and times, it does
make a significant contribution to the scanty literature about a tribe that was traditionally friendly to nineteenth-century Americans. Also, Custer buffs should delight in the chapters devoted to events and circumstances surrounding their subject.

When the book was first published, it sold only 847 copies. Perhaps now, with the ever increasing interest in Native American history and anthropology, it will fare better. Regardless of its liabilities of style, assumptions, and occasional inexactitude, Memoirs of a White Crow Indian should be read by anyone with a serious interest in Plains Indians.

RICHARD H. FAUST
Department of History
University of Oklahoma
Norman


This second volume of Spence's and Jackson's The Expeditions of John Charles Fremont is part of a trilogy covering Fremont's stormy career as an explorer and soldier from 1838 to 1854. It continues the high canons of editing that characterized volume one, and will undoubtedly prove the most useful and valuable of the set to historians of the Mexican War and of California. The letters reprinted here date from the famous explorer's third California expedition, in 1845, and end with a number of heated and angry epistles penned in early 1848 following Fremont's bitter resignation from the army over his conviction on eleven charges of mutiny. A supplementary volume, Proceedings of the Court-Martial, deals with this unfortunate affair.

The compilation of letters in volume two is prefaced by an excellent historical sketch capable of standing by itself as a worthy summary of the major events in the era of westward expansion as they pertain to California. It consists of fifty pages of background history and amounts essentially to a bibliographical essay on the Fremont literature as well as a concise summary of the man's influence on events in California during the brief period under examination. The editors have summarized and evaluated the histories of Josiah Royce, Hubert Howe Bancroft, and Bernard DeVoto and then addressed themselves to more recent monographs by several luminaries in the field, including those by George Tays, Ernest Wiltse, and Richard R. Stenberg.

The introductory essay examines the policies and motives of President Polk in the whole California episode, the role of Thomas O. Larkin, the effectiveness of Mexican rule—what there was of it—under Governor Manuel Micheltoreno, the circumstances surrounding the Bear Flag revolt, and the internecine squabbles of Stockton, Kearny, and Fremont. Considerable attention is paid this unfortunate matter, particularly as it relates to Fremont's political aspirations and court-martial.

The nearly five hundred pages of documents gathered together in this volume include one hundred four epistles from Fremont's busy pen and another one hundred five addressed to him. The writers and recipients of these, along with those of sixty-nine additional letters, make a list of correspondents reading like a roll call of the notables of the early American period in the history of the Golden State. Selections include passages from Fremont's memoirs, letters to and from his intrepid wife, Jessie, a number of military orders and documents, as well as scores of notes and let-
letters from and to Thomas Larkin, Jose Castro, John D. Sloat, John B. Montgomery, Robert F. Stockton, James K. Polk, Stephen W. Kearny, Richard B. Mason, and Archibald Gillespie, to mention only a few.

Spence and Jackson have organized this book in a way to optimize its usefulness to the historian. The introduction is copiously annotated with materials drawn from over fifty archival and library sources, in addition to the secondary materials already mentioned. The section divisions, which outline the contents of the whole volume, are “The 1845 Expedition and the Clash with the Californias,” “The Bear Flag Revolt and the Conquest of California,” “The Quarrel with Stephen Watts Kearny,” and “The Arrest and Court-Martial of Fremont.”

The correspondence itself is arranged chronologically and is listed in the table of contents by author, recipient, and date. There is appended a roster of the 1845–47 expedition, including names of voyageurs, guides, and even mule drivers. The bibliography embraces over one hundred sixty entries. It, as well as the detailed and functional index, will prove helpful to the scholar. What otherwise might have come off as a monotonous catalog of letters is brightened by over twenty colorful illustrations of major characters, photographs, engravings, lithographs, and maps.

All libraries as well as historians specializing in California history, the West, or the Mexican War will want to add this attractive, well-written, and well-organized volume to their holdings.

NORMAN E. TUTOROW
Foothill College,
Los Altos,
West Valley College,
Saratoga, California

---


Shoot Me a Biscuit adds some hilarious chapters to the folklore of the cowboy and his camp life. Cooks and other engaging characters people its pages: Old Pud who made a great suet pudding but refused to budge when he was in his cups; LeClair, a former dining car chef, who served working cowboys one poached egg on toast wedges for breakfast and French potato soup for lunch; Chicken Henry, a Black man who loved to tease dudes; Trapper Jack, a Mormon from one of the Mexican colonies, who baited his traps with a most unusual substance.

Dan Moore’s collection of personal anecdotes will be appreciated by anyone who loves the authentic lore and language of the West of thirty and forty years ago.

---
Martin Murphy, Jr., California Pioneer, 1844–1884. By SISTER GABRIELLE SULLIVAN. (Stockton, Calif.: Pacific Center for Western Historical Studies, 1974. xiii + 76 pp. $4.50.)

This little monograph is well worth examining for the light it sheds on the challenges of historical research. Murphy, a native of Ireland, went overland to California in 1844 and made his fortune as a rancher and businessman. Bancroft included him in his Chronicles of the Builders of the Commonwealth as one of the key figures in the development of California. Nevertheless, contemporary research on the man was stymied by a dearth of primary source material. Sister Gabrielle’s persistence finally led to the discovery of a “trunk of Murphy papers” in the storeroom of a San Francisco auction house. These primary materials filled in many details of Murphy’s life and justified his inclusion by Bancroft as a pioneer settler of the first rank. The author’s research also helped to explain the lack of readily available data on a man of such importance; he was evidently illiterate.

Many figures of great significance to Utah’s development lie similarly buried in forgotten storerooms or attics awaiting their due exposure in the state’s histories.


Somos Chicanos is a powerful personal statement of one man’s search for self. David Gomez, a Chicano activist, Catholic priest, and writer relates his own experiences in the white world, looks to the historical past for the roots of the Chicano people, and examines important events in the contemporary Chicano movement.

Of special interest to Utahns will be the author’s brief account of his assignment to minister to a migrant community in northern Utah.


Contains more than five thousand annotated entries for reference by the researcher in American history.

Gold Fever. By HELEN E. WILSON. (Jarbidge, Nev.: Author, 4830 Harbinson, La Mesa, Calif. 92041, 1974. viii + 129 pp.)

A family chronicle of prospector J.D. Goodwin, the author’s father, Gold Fever is also full of fact and folklore about turn-of-the-century mining and life in Jarbidge near the Nevada-Idaho border. The text is accompanied by several excellent historic photographs.


This profound and provocative study of church organization, originally published by Michigan State University Press in 1967, has been reprinted as a Bison paperback. In a new preface the author explains why he considers a revision inappropriate.
ANTIQUITIES


ETHNICS


Smith, Duane A. “We Are Equal”—Racial Attitudes in the West,” *The Westerners Brand Book* [Chicago], 30 (January 1974). Examines the treatment of Blacks in western mining camps, including Park City.

HISTORIOGRAPHY AND HISTORICAL METHOD


Articles and Notes

"Philosophical and Literary Implications in the Historiography of the Fur Trade," Western American Literature, 9 (August 1974), 79–104.

LITERATURE


Lee, Fred L. "John G. Neihardt: The Man and His Western Writings; the Bancroft Years, 1900–1921," The Trail Guide [Kansas City Westerners], 17 (September–December 1973), 3–35.


MILITARY AND LEGAL


POLITICS AND RELIGION

Collins, E.H. "Why the Idaho Panhandle?" The Pacific Northwesterner, 18 (Summer 1974), 41–46. The author concludes that Idaho's unusual shape resulted from nothing other than "the routine process . . . of government" in the territorial period.


**HISTORICAL NOTES**

*Utah Historical Quarterly*, volumes 1 through 40, is now available on microfiche cards. The complete set, covering the years 1928 to 1972, may be purchased from the Society for $100. Institutions or individuals may place orders for the Quarterly on microfiche cards by writing to Jay M. Haymond, Utah State Historical Society, 603 East South Temple, Salt Lake City, Utah 84102.

Recent accessions to the Society's library holdings include records of the Parley Redd Mercantile in Blanding during the early 1900s and papers of L. H. Redd, Jr., prominent Blanding businessman, donated by his son, A. J. Redd. Historic photographs of Moab have been copied for the library files through the cooperative efforts of the town's citizens and John Hoffman who is researching land use patterns in the area. The oral history collection has been augmented by taped interviews with Sherman P. Lloyd, a former Utah congressman; Lucille Blanchard, an eighty-two-year-old former resident of Duchesne; and Keith Smith, age ninety-six, of Daggett County. Ongoing oral history projects at Grouse Creek, Roosevelt, Fillmore, and Milford and a cooperative study with Brigham Young University on Utah labor continue to add resource material to the Society's collections.

*America: History and Life* has selected *Utah Historical Quarterly* as one of 115 periodicals to be regularly covered in its Index to Book Reviews. The quarterly abstracts publication is issued by American Bibliographical Center, Santa Barbara, California.

The Utah State Historical Society has announced the 1975 competition for the Golden Spike Award (railroading) and the J. F. Winchester Award (trucking). Each award carries a monetary prize of $300. Manuscripts should be unpublished and show evidence of research in primary source materials. Deadline for submission is July 1, 1975. Detailed specifications on the two awards may be obtained from Stanford J. Layton, Utah State Historical Society, 603 East South Temple, Salt Lake City, Utah 84102.
THE UTAH STATE HISTORICAL SOCIETY
Department of Development Services
Division of State History

BOARD OF STATE HISTORY
MILTON C. ABRAMS, Smithfield, 1977
President
DELLY G. DAYTON, Ogden, 1975
Vice President
MELVIN T. SMITH, Salt Lake City
Secretary
MRS. JUANITA BROOKS, St. George, 1977
MRS. A. C. JENSEN, Sandy, 1975
THERON LUKE, Provo, 1975
CLYDE L. MILLER, Secretary of State
Ex officio
MRS. HELEN Z. PAPANIKOLAS, Salt Lake City, 1977
HOWARD C. PRICE, Jr., Price, 1975
MRS. ELIZABETH SKANCHY, Midvale, 1977
RICHARD O. ULIBARRI, Roy, 1977
MRS. NAOMI WOOLLEY, Salt Lake City, 1975

ADMINISTRATION
MELVIN T. SMITH, Director
STANFORD J. LAYTON, Publications Coordinator
JAY M. HAYMOND, Librarian
DAVID B. MADSEN, Antiquities Director

The Utah State Historical Society was organized in 1897 by public-spirited Utahns to collect, preserve, and publish Utah and related history. Today, under state sponsorship, the Society fulfills its obligations by publishing the Utah Historical Quarterly and other historical materials; locating, documenting, and preserving historic and prehistoric buildings and sites; and maintaining a specialized research library. Donations and gifts to the Society's programs or its library are encouraged, for only through such means can it live up to its responsibility of preserving the record of Utah's past.

MEMBERSHIP
Membership in the Utah State Historical Society is open to all individuals and institutions interested in Utah history. Membership applications and change of address notices should be sent to the membership secretary. Annual dues are: Institutions, $7.00; individuals, $5.00; students, $3.00. Life memberships, $100.00. Tax-deductible donations for special projects of the Society may be made on the following membership basis: sustaining, $250.00; patron, $500.00; benefactor, $1,000.00. Your interest and support are most welcome.
Immigrants and Mines
UTAH HISTORICAL QUARTERLY

EDITORIAL STAFF
Melvin T. Smith, Editor
Stanford J. Layton, Managing Editor
Miriam B. Murphy, Assistant Editor

ADVISORY BOARD OF EDITORS
Thomas G. Alexander, Provo, 1977
Mrs. Inez S. Cooper, Cedar City, 1975
S. George Ellsworth, Logan, 1975
Glen M. Leonard, Bountiful, 1976
David E. Miller, Salt Lake City, 1976
LaMar Petersen, Salt Lake City, 1977
Richard W. Sadler, Ogden, 1976
Harold Schindler, Salt Lake City, 1975
Jerome Stoffel, Logan, 1977

Utah Historical Quarterly was established in 1928 to publish articles, documents, and reviews contributing to knowledge of Utah's history. The Quarterly is published by the Utah State Historical Society, 603 East South Temple, Salt Lake City, Utah 84102. Phone (801) 328-5755.

Members of the Society receive the Quarterly and the bimonthly Newsletter upon payment of the annual dues; for details see inside back cover. Single copies, $2.00.

Materials for publication should be submitted in duplicate accompanied by return postage and should be typed double-spaced with footnotes at the end. Additional information on requirements is available from the managing editor. The Society assumes no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion by contributors.

The Quarterly is indexed in Book Review Index to Social Science Periodicals, America: History and Life, and on Biblio Cards.

Second class postage is paid at Salt Lake City, Utah.

ISSN 0042-143X
Contents

SPRING 1975 / VOLUME 43 / NUMBER 2

IN THIS ISSUE ................................................................. 103

UTAH'S COAL LANDS: A VITAL EXAMPLE OF HOW AMERICA BECAME A GREAT NATION .... Helen Z. Papanikolas 104

THE "FOREIGN ELEMENT" AND THE 1903-4 CARBON COUNTY COAL MINERS' STRIKE .... Allan Kent Powell 125

SOUTH SLAV SETTLEMENTS IN UTAH, 1890-1935 ........................................ Joseph Stipanovich 155

ITALIAN FRATERNAL ORGANIZATIONS IN UTAH, 1897-1934 .................... Philip F. Notarianni 172

IN MEMORIAM: JOEL EDWARD RICKS, 1889-1974 ........................................... A. Russell Mortensen 188

BOOK REVIEWS ............................................................... 190

BOOK NOTICES ............................................................... 198

RECENT ARTICLES ........................................................... 200

HISTORICAL NOTES ......................................................... 204

THE COVER Always eager to show visitors the scenic and natural resources of the state, Utahns proudly displayed a ten-ton block of coal from Carbon County in the State Capitol for many years. In this photograph, a team of horses and men set out to haul the heavy object up steep Capitol Hill. Utah State Historical Society collections, courtesy of Clarence Bamberger.

© Copyright 1975
Utah State Historical Society
Books reviewed


Harry C. James. Pages from Hopi History . . . . S. Lyman Tyler 195


Remi A. Nadeau. The Water Seekers . . . . F. Alan Coombs 197
As America entered the last quarter of the nineteenth century, its great industrial development was just beginning. Though many factors were involved in that extraordinary success story, the ready availability of fossil fuel was one of the most important. Now, a century later, the great American industrial complex—indeed, our very way of life—stands challenged by rapidly dwindling energy reserves. Regardless of the direction this crisis ultimately takes us, Utah's high quality coal, mined for a hundred years and still available in enormous tonnage, seems destined to play an increasingly prominent role in national energy policy and state economics.

But in the past, coal has meant much more to Utah than industrial and economic growth. It has meant people—exciting, colorful, flesh-and-blood people—many of whom, like the John Dunoskovich family pictured above, came from distant lands and helped enrich the Utah melting pot with their distinctive customs, traditions, and other cultural baggage. The pot percolated for a long generation, and the dynamics of assimilation produced violence, bitterness, and despair. But triumph was there too, as the John Dunoskoviches persevered with their dreams in the face of a generally hostile community. Triumph and excitement. The old world aromas and sounds of Slavic boardinghouses and biltiyas, the intrigue of smuggling a labor organizer past company guards in a wagonload of hay, the humorous spectacle of Italians naively parading the American flag upside down in a well-intentioned display of patriotism, the incredible furore raised by the arrival in the coal fields of a certain grey-haired woman—such color will probably never again touch the Utah labor scene. Gone, too, are the immigrants themselves, in a sense victims of the very assimilation they sought. Neither writers of letters nor keepers of diaries, they generally left as their only by-line a name and two dates on a silent headstone. To them and their remarkable achievements this issue is dedicated.
Utah's Coal Lands: A Vital Example of How America Became a Great Nation

By Helen Z. Papanikolas
In the year 1776, while searching for an alternate route to Monterey, California, the Dominguez-Escalante party camped near the shores of the lake Indians called Timpanogos (Utah Lake). There, tepees dotted a green plain that would become known as Spanish Fork. Of this region, Miera, the mapmaker for the expedition, wrote on the back of his chart:

This is the most pleasing, beautiful, and fertile site in all New Spain. . . . The lake and the rivers that flow into it abound in many varieties of savory fish, very large white geese, many kinds of ducks, and other exquisite birds never seen elsewhere, besides beavers, otters, seals. . . . The meadows of these rivers produce abundant hemp and flax without cultivation. . . . The veins that are seen in the sierra [mountains] appear at a distance to have minerals. . . .

The minerals that the Spanish fathers had seen were the outcroppings of coal, a twig off a southeasterly arc holding immense deposits of bituminous coal, ready for discovery. The treasure remained untouched for almost another century, a mere particle of time compared with the millions of years it had taken to transform primeval forests of oaks, walnuts, poplars, and willows into the rich black mineral that would someday fire locomotives, become coke to smelt ore, heat houses, and change the quality of life.

Mormon pioneers began the search for coal as soon as they entered the Salt Lake Valley. Added to the privations of settlement hundreds of miles from the nearest outpost was the anxiety to find wood to heat houses in the stark western winters. First the willows of the valley were cut down, then the trees on the hills around Salt Lake City, denuding them. Each winter the “coal famine” brought suffering and deaths. Although coal was discovered in Sanpete County two years after the arrival of the pioneers, there were difficulties besides the long haul to Salt Lake City. In a letter printed in the Latter-day Saints’ Millennial Star, a young man wrote:

Dear Father. . . . The coal found in San Pete Kanyon is said to be very good; they have already brought several loads to the city. The bishop sent to get three loads for the office, and as they started to return with the coal, the chief, San Pete . . . with his Indians, stopped them and ordered the men to take it back, and said it was theirs, and we should not have anymore without we paid for it; and said if the Governor would give him twenty fat oxen, twenty horses, and some other things, they might have it.

Mrs. Papanikolas, a member of the Board of State History, is well known for her studies of immigrant life. This article was originally prepared as the Statehood Day address, given on January 4, 1973, at Price, Utah.

Source materials for this article include: Ernest S. Horsley, *Fifty Years Ago This Week at and around Price* (Price, 1928), which also was published in the Sun (Price), January 24, 1929; C. H. Madsen, *Carbon County: A History* (Price, 1947); Utah Historical Records Survey Project (WPA), *Inventory of the Archives of Utah, No 4, Carbon County* (Ogden, 1940); and No. 8, *Emery County* (Ogden, 1941); Thursev Jessen Reynolds et al., eds., *Centennial Echoes from Carbon County* (Carbon County, 1948); Lucile Richens, “A Social History of Sunnyside,” typescript, WPA Collection, Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City; Floyd A. O’Neil, “History of the Carbon County Industry,” typescript in Dr. O’Neil’s possession.

1 Herbert E. Bolton, *Pageant in the Wilderness: The Story of the Escalante Expedition to the Interior Basin, 1776* (Salt Lake City, 1950), 72.

He with his band have camped here, and will allow no one to get the coal.  

The dread of coal famine continued with each approach of winter. In 1854 the territorial legislature offered a thousand dollars to the discoverer of a good vein of coal, not less than eighteen inches thick, within forty miles of Salt Lake City, that could be worked profitably. This led to the discovery of coal on the Weber river near Coalville, but the reward was not paid as the distance was somewhat more than forty miles.  

It was another nine years, however, before the first mine that could be called productive was opened in Coalville. The coal was hauled by wagon over a rough terrain of forty miles, seven of them a grueling uphill climb from Kimball's Junction to Parley's Canyon Summit. Spring rains and winter snows made the road impassable, and the pioneers endured the winter cold another four years.  

The celebration at the joining of the rails in 1869 was ecstatic. Mormon church official John Taylor envisioned thousands of converts coming by rail “to their homes without the slow process of traveling with ox teams.” Ordinary people anticipated “no more prohibitive tariffs on the necessaries of life, with the use of luxuries restricted to the very few…”  

The Union Pacific now transported coal, among the most important of the “necessaries of life,” to Utah. Months of ox-pulling of freighters and weeks of stagecoach travel were cut to days. This would have been the extent of the munificence of railroads had it not been for mining. Many years after the coming of the railroad, the founder of the *Mining and Contracting Review* said: “Were it not for mining, Salt Lake City would still be a whistle and water-tank stop on a transcontinental railroad.”  

The destiny of Utah mines and railroads interlocked. They were each other’s best customers. To speak of one requires speaking of the other. Minerals and coal brought the railroads; mines needed railroads to transport their products; and coal fired the locomotives.  

Branch rail lines spurred the mining industry into heightened activity. On January 13, 1870, the Union Pacific shipped the first coal
to Salt Lake City from the Wasatch Coal Company in Coalville. The jubilation of the people was short-lived. Union Pacific destroyed competition to their Wyoming mines by charging high freight rates to transport Wasatch coal while selling their Wyoming coal, mined at two dollars a ton, for eight dollars in Salt Lake City. Although ninety-three million pounds of coal, almost all from the Union Pacific mines in Wyoming, were delivered to Salt Lake City in 1873, it was insufficient. The Union Pacific was accused of not only imposing exorbitant rates on Utah coal but of limiting the supply sent from Wyoming to keep the prices high. The once-heralded Union Pacific became the symbol to the struggling Mormons of arrogant, powerful eastern capitalists. To break its monopoly in the Weber district and in the thirty-two mining areas opened up since the coming of the railroad, new rail lines were hastily built and as hastily bought out by the Union Pacific when inevitable financial troubles occurred.

The hunt for coal went on. While searching for timber and grazing land, settlers discovered coal in eastern Utah. No proficiency or divination was necessary; the coal was sticking out of the ground. In 1875 coal operations began in Huntington Canyon; four years later the Pleasant Valley mine was opened in Winter Quarters, in country that would later be called Carbon County; and three years afterwards the nearby Mud Creek (Clear Creek) mine began producing. The coal was taken out by wagon—in Winter Quarters it was first packed on mules—and this restricted its use to local needs.
The news of the discovery reached across the continent to the eastern railroad barons. Surveyors, engineers, and financiers rushed to Utah and confirmed the vastness of the coal fields. The frustrations of the Sanpete and Wasatch coal experience were over. These new coal veins were not eighteen inches wide but as much as twenty-two feet thick; the reserves were estimated not in thousands of tons but at eighty-eight billion tons of bituminous coal, high in carbon, low in sulphur, and of excellent coking qualities. Coal and eastern Utah became synonymous.⁷

With one thousand of its thirty-three thousand laborers and one hundred seventy-five teams of horses, the Denver and Rio Grande of Colorado began a monumental drive to lay track from Gunnison over the mountains to Montrose, Delta, and Grand Junction. Before Christmas of 1882 they reached the sagebrush plains of the Utah line.⁸

It was a coincidence that had brought the Denver and Rio Grande west rather than south to El Paso, Texas. Rich silver strikes in western Colorado and a quarrel between Denver and Rio Grande’s president, young Gen. William Jackson Palmer, and the Santa Fe railroad decided the westward push. Railroad wars continued with the coming to Utah of the narrow-gauge Denver and Rio Grande. General Palmer had written his wife during their courtship: “... amidst all the hot competition of this American business life there is a great temptation to be a little unscrupulous.”⁹

As the steel gangs made their way across the alkaline desert toward Price, new mines attracted the Utah Central Railroad, a subsidiary of Union Pacific. Immediately Denver and Rio Grande transferred its surveyors and graders from other construction to thwart its rival. Towns spurted up in the wake of the track laying. Overcrowding, transient women, and gamblers made of them what Brigham Young had earlier described the off-scourings of the Union Pacific, “sinks of pollution.”¹⁰

Only a few pioneers had settled on the Price River banks when the railroad went through the prairie-dog plain leaving a railroad car for a

---

⁷ Paul Averitt, *Coal Resources of the United States*, U. S. Geological Survey Pamphlet no. 1275 (Washington, D.C., 1967), estimates reserves at 80,250 million tons, 35,000 million of this overburdened (3,000 to 6,000 feet deep), estimated total remaining reserves in the ground (0–6,000 feet overburden), 115,250 million tons; J. B. Forrester, “Carbon County Coal Properties,” *New West Magazine*, 11 (February 1920), 28.


⁹ *Ibid.*, 27. Athearn describes Palmer (p. 64) as a “man of unbounded enthusiasm and never-ending optimism who continued to feel that his organization could do battle successfully with any and all of the major roads who crossed swords with it.”

depot; in Helper (Ewell), Teancum Pratt and his two wives lived in a dugout. Then, in the narrow canyons and draws of the juniper-dotted mountains, mining camps of tents and rustic frame structures went up.

A number of those responsible for the "sinks" stayed; the rest went on following the railroad gangs over Soldier Summit, through Spanish Fork Canyon, and into Salt Lake City. While cutting through Price Canyon, the steel gangs uncovered the rich coal deposits of Castle Gate.

Incoming laborers deluged the camps and were turned into miners by immigrant Welsh supervisors. Mainly American-born and British Isles immigrants, these new miners were looking not for the Big Rock Candy Mountain of western lore but for steady work to give roots to their meager existence. To them and to the pioneers, the Denver and Rio Grande Western brought produce and goods from Colorado and returned with coal-filled cars. Manufacturing companies from the East sent their salesmen into the coal camps and the eastern land of the state began to lose its homespun quality.

The coal fields and all of Utah looked upon the Denver and Rio Grande Western as their savior. To the people swarming into the makeshift camps, the "D&RGW" could do no wrong. Twenty years later the Denver and Rio Grande was indicted with others for fraudulently acquiring coal lands in Carbon and Emery counties. The names of wealthy Utahns, as well as those of America's money barons, Rockefeller, Gould, and Harriman, were brought into the state courts. For years, also, a Denver and Rio Grande subsidiary, the Utah Fuel Company,

Coal lands cases were reported in the Eastern Utah Advocate, 1904-10.

The railroad was vital to the operation of Utah's coal mines and to those who lived in Carbon County's small towns. The Rio Grande Western's depot at Helper can be seen in the distance in this 1905 photograph. Utah State Historical Society Collections, gift of Robert W. Edwards.
ruled its mining towns as a paternalistic kingdom. It was not, though, the railroad barons and mine management that people thought of as the D&RGW, but the flashing steel rails and the massive steam engines clipping over them.

To these people in the isolated coal camps, the Denver and Rio Grande Western was evidence of worlds beyond the arid, narrow valleys. Miners and railway men scorned each other, yet the D&RGW was untouched by such pettiness. The great locomotives had a life of their own and it was easy to forget that the whistles at the Castle Gate rocks were not those of the locomotives themselves calling out long farewells or eager greetings but those of engineers and firemen signaling their wives goodbye or alerting them to get dinner on the table.

The Denver and Rio Grande Western stood for the courage the frontier prized. It had been built over wild terrain; an entire year had been taken up with getting through the last mile of the Black Canyon of the Gunnison. The four percent grade at Soldier Summit required three helper engines from the town of Helper to pull trains over the mountains. Snow slides disrupted service for days; washouts were common.

The trains were more often late than on time, but Carbon County people would never admit to serious problems. "Only twenty minutes late," they would say when trains were delayed, even when several days had passed. A story from those days tells of salesmen, or drummers as they were then called, who regularly came to Helper and Price with suit-
cases filled with samples. Near the yellow and brown depots, the drummers rented horses and buggies and drove south into the farm settlements of Emery County or north into the Uintah reservation. On their return they almost always found the trains were late, but “only twenty minutes” they were assured. One day a drummer drove back from the reservation and saw a number of his acquaintances pacing the wooden platform of the Helper depot. The train was late again. “You know,” the drummer said, “I had a dream last night. I dreamed that all the trains in the world were racing here as fast as they could. They collided and shot up in the air. Then they floated down. All except the D&RGW. It was twenty minutes late.”

Mines opened, one after the other. Far more men than women came to them; more immigrants than native-born. The immigrants had left ancient cultures where there were too many people, too little land that could be cultivated, where manual labor was despised and the lowliest of clerks let the fingernails of their little fingers grow to show they did not

---

12 Interview with Lynn Fausett and Rolla West. To comply with Utah territorial laws that required two-thirds of the incorporators of private railroads within the state to be residents, the Denver and Rio Grande “induced some friends” in Salt Lake City to organize the D&RGW. See Athearn, Rebel, 116.
work with their hands. There were no frontiers in their countries for escape; no homestead laws to give them a foothold. America's industrialization cut them loose from immemorial poverty and gave them hope for a new life.

There was loneliness, nostalgia for the homelands, prejudice, and cruelties in the new land, but there was also a growing acknowledgement of each person's worth. The American labor movement had given work with the hands dignity, had, even more, idealized it. In a short time, immigrant workers stopped removing their caps for the "bosses."

Pioneer life was fading when the new immigrants began coming, but there were still men and women alive who had crossed the plains and who had made epic journeys to colonize the territory for Mormonism. They resented the nearly illiterate immigrants from the lowest society of their countries' feudal systems, but they did not want to man the mines themselves. They were committed to farming and went into the mines in large numbers only temporarily as strikebreakers. It was left to the immigrants to bring their unskilled power to America's great natural resources. Like the symbiotic relationship of mines and railroads, industry needed immigrants and immigrants needed industry.

The quiet of pioneer territory resounded now with the shrill of mine and freight whistles, boardinghouse commotion, and shootings over payday gambling. Men like Butch Cassidy, living on the boundaries of Mormon society, could not resist the large payrolls and further enlivened the towns. Reminiscent of the first rush into them, when men slept on the ground or lived in tents until housing was built, the towns were called "camps."

*Following the April 1897 payroll robbery at Castle Gate by Butch Cassidy’s gang, armed guards and miners watched for the arrival of their money. Utah State Historical Society photograph, Salt Lake Tribune Collection, courtesy of Welber Hardee.*
Dorthea Lange captured the look of one of Carbon County's small coal towns in March 1936. Library of Congress photograph.

Explosions, labor troubles, old-country ceremonies, and tentative Fourth of July celebrations that became more elaborate as the immigrants' children grew, are evoked with the names of the camps: Winter Quarters, Scofield, Clear Creek, Castle Gate, Sunnyside, Kenilworth, Hiawatha, Mohrland, Sego, Panther, Standardville, Storrs, Black Hawk, Spring Canyon, Cameron (Rolapp, Royal), Rains, Latuda, Peerless, Wattis, Morton, Consumers, National, Sweet, and Columbia. Over these towns were the companies that decided hours, wages, living conditions, in short, their workers' lives. The most important of these were the Pleasant Valley, Utah Fuel, and Independent Coal and Coke companies. Throughout the narrow canyons and into the mountain slopes were also small mines, each worked by a man alone, with his family, or with a few miners—in the old tradition of American individualism.

The first workers brought to the Pleasant Valley mines were Chinese. The mine entry driven by them was "as beautiful a piece of work as one could wish to see." They used no powder, only pick work; the sides of the coal were straight and the roof arched. For their trouble, incoming white labor herded them into a boxcar, locked them in, and started the car downgrade. The car sped dangerously for miles, miraculously keeping to the rails until a reverse grade stopped it. When it was found, the Chinese had broken out and disappeared.13

13 A. C. Watts, "Opening First Commercial Coal Mine Described," in Reynolds et al., Centennial Echoes, 37.
The American-born and the English-speaking immigrants had barely controlled the labor supply when many different alien peoples arrived and superseded them in numbers. With carbide lamps attached to their caps, sending yellow shafts in the blackness, men worked, often with their feet in a foot of coal dust, often in ice-encrusted water. After boring holes in the base of the walls of coal, they tamped black powder into them, lighted the wads, and ran. They returned in a shower of coal dust to shovel the broken coal into carts hitched to mules. Legend says the mules were born, lived, and died in underground stables, and in the perpetual darkness had become blind. Yet as soon as they were harnessed and hitched up, they went forward without a command, came to a standstill, and waited until the car was filled. Again, without a human signal, they moved out of the black tunnels. At the Clear Creek mine, surrounded by rolling hills of sagebrush and junipers, thirty-nine giant Percheron horses, the pride of the mining camps, pulled wagons filled with coal and with logs for timbering. Men, animals, coal, and railroads were the symbols of America's early industrial days.

Following closely after the English-speaking workers into the mining towns were the Finns. Their odyssey in search of American opportunity was cut short for sixty-two of them in the Winter Quarters explosion of May 1, 1900. One hundred forty-nine of the 200 dead were buried in the Scofield graveyard. Not enough plain pine caskets were available in Salt Lake City and the Denver and Rio Grande Western brought a carload from Denver.14

Four members of Carbon County's rapidly increasing Italian population were also killed. The stonework of early Italian artisans can still be seen in rock houses, crumbling walls around mine and railroad properties, and in the historic Pleasant Valley mine office in Castle Gate. Italian bands played opera and marching tunes, met Greek and Italian picture brides at the depots, and gave a touch of beauty to immigrant life.

Often Italians journeyed from Italy to the coal fields in large groups, giving suspicion that they were contract laborers. This illegal procurement of immigrants to work in American industries had been begun several decades earlier by management who sent to Ireland for shiploads of famine-blighted Irish. Under the pay of mines and railroads, immigrant labor agents transplanted to Utah the padrone tyranny of Europe's poorest countries. It was refined by the "Czar of the Greeks,"

14 For two accounts of the explosion see James W. Dilley, History of the Scofield Mine Disaster (Provo, 1900), and Allan Kent Powell, "Tragedy at Scofield," Utah Historical Quarterly, 41 (Spring 1973), 182-94.
Leonidas G. Skliris, who, by 1910, had brought the highest number of Greeks in America to the Mountain States. On his orders the first Greeks to establish themselves in the mines were brought directly from Greece to break the Carbon County coal strike of 1903.¹⁵

It was by strikes that each major immigrant people gained entrance into the mines. At the close of the nineteenth century when English-speaking miners agitated for better working conditions and for higher wages, Italians were sent in. When the Italians and South Slavs went on strike a few years later, Greeks came. Nineteen years afterwards, Greeks joined the national coal strike and Mexicans were hired.

Strikes forced the many immigrant groups to unite.¹⁶ They had carried intact to America their nationalism, their animosities among themselves and toward other countries, and their folk cultures. Lodges, mutual-aid societies, churches, and old-country customs helped them preserve their ethnicity in the first years until they were secure enough to accommodate to American life. With accommodation, vendettas, Black Hand threats, and disputes over politics in their native countries waned.

All miners, however, shared the contempt of the native-born for them and the ever-present anxiety of death in mine accidents, explosions, and afterdamp. Obvious safety features were ignored, and mine management was never blamed in print. Each mine inspector and industrial commission report recorded the number of killed and maimed. In a few fleet sentences men's fates were noted:

¹⁶ An exception was the Carbon County coal strike of 1933 when the Italians divided into two factions. See Helen Z. Papanikolas, "Unionism, Communism, and the Great Depression: The Carbon County Coal Strike of 1933," Utah Historical Quarterly, 41 (Summer, 1973), 254–300.
M. Imanaka, a Japanese, age 29 years . . . Castle Gate mine . . . this man came to his death by rock falling from the roof in the mine; cause of accident his own neglect.\textsuperscript{17}

Frank Mivec came to his death by a fall of coal, at Winter Quarters, entirely due to carelessness on his own part . . . we exonerate Utah Fuel Company from any blame whatever.\textsuperscript{18}

Emil Rizzi, Italian, age 22, Mohrland mine . . . deceased came to his death . . . through his own carelessness and negligence, by being crushed by top coal which he knew to be dangerous and unsafe.\textsuperscript{19}

George Georgopoulos [Georgopoulos], a Greek, single, aged twenty-four years . . . walking with dinner pail in one hand, shovel in the other . . . had he taken ordinary precautions could have seen the trip [of cars] coming.\textsuperscript{20}

There was never an immigrant on the coroners’ juries, and from the time a mine inspector was first appointed in 1892, when keeping records of fatalities and injuries was begun, to 1929, Utah had one of the worst records in the nation. For the years 1914 to 1929, Utah’s number of fatalities in relation to hours worked and tons mined was almost twice the national average.\textsuperscript{21}

\textsuperscript{17} State of Utah, \textit{Report of the State Coal Mine Inspector for 1906} (Salt Lake City, 1907), 93.

\textsuperscript{18} \textit{Report . . . 1909}, 16.

\textsuperscript{19} \textit{Report . . . 1915-16}, 22.

\textsuperscript{20} \textit{Ibid.}, 11.

Before portal-to-portal pay, there were injuries and deaths caused by the miners themselves. A native Greek who spent a lifetime in the mines says: “We timbered the roofs too quick to get at the digging. Many of our patriots were killed that way.”  

Management insisted that the workers’ unfamiliarity with English was the reason for accidents, and they printed safety handbooks in several languages. This had little impact. It took a while for the immigrants to understand the potency of machines and electricity. Many had never heard of, or seen, an electric light globe until coming to America. The mine inspector’s report for 1915–16 tells of the death of a Greek rope rider who was warned not to touch a fallen tension wire, went to his house for gloves, returned, touched the exposed wire, and was electrocuted.  

The many accidents from falls of coal together with the mass deaths at Winter Quarters, at Castle Gate in 1924 with 172 killed, at Standardville in 1930 with 23 dead, and in the Carbon Fuel mine in 1963 with 9 fatalities taught tragic lessons. Innovations continued with each year and lessened the hazards of mining. Carbon County mines were the first in the nation to blast before men arrived to begin their shifts. Electrification began in the early 1900s. Blowers for proper ventilation, improvements in roof timbering, and gas detectors promoted better safety records. Battery-run headlights on steel helmets and heavy, metal-tipped safety shoes gave miners valuable protection.

Residents began receiving ample medical services when young medical school graduates came into Carbon and Emery counties, either on the payrolls of the companies or to establish private practice. They intended their sojourns to be short, a means of accumulating enough money to move away and up in their professional careers, but many remained in Utah until their deaths. The young doctors had good medical training. Within a short time of their arrival, medicinal use of herbs,

22 Interview with Nick Kalikas, June 17, 1970; a similar statement was made by Mike Dragos in an interview August 16, 1972. Both interviews were made for the American West Center, University of Utah, Salt Lake City.

23 Report . . . 1915–16, 25. A rope rider’s duty was to see that rail cars were coupled properly and to inspect ropes, chains, and links.

24 The Castle Gate mine was the first to dynamite while empty. On March 22, 1900, forty days before the Winter Quarters explosion, a blast at Castle Gate caused great damage, but because of management’s policy of evacuating the mine before dynamiting, there were no fatalities.

25 Sutton, Utah, 1:28 and 29, relates Dr. Ralph T. Richards, in a commencement address to the June 1946 University of Utah School of Medicine graduates, giving credit to the building of the “railroad to Los Angeles and the opening of the Utah Copper Mine on a large scale [with bringing] new immigrants to Salt Lake and among them were physicians of character and better educations and more post graduate training than most of their local predecessors.”
folk medicine, and doctors’ certificates awarded after a year of study were vestiges of the past.

The doctors were often autocratic, and some of them became eccentric with age. Through canyons and draws of the mountains, they traveled in buggies and later in open-windowed Model T Fords, Studebakers, Buicks, and Packards. The immigrants looked up to them with respect for their education and for their magical knowledge. Many of them developed a lifelong affection for the imperious young doctors and quickly recall their names: Slopanskey, Fiske, McDermott, Neher, Elliot, Kendall, Whoeler, Dowd, Reilly, Long, and Merrill.

Miners bided their time with superintendents and straw bosses who deducted from their wages to pay padrones and to buy cars and other luxuries for themselves. At every opportunity, management expounded high-minded interest in their workers. In 1920 the chief engineer for Utah Fuel Company said:

These companies are headed by wide-awake business men, all of a kindly nature. They are doing everything possible for their employees that is “businessly” possible. . . . They pay splendid wages, study the sociological side of their men and try to anticipate their wants. . . . Mine workers are well cared for . . . the employees are well satisfied.26

Other Carbon County doctors treated briefly in published sources include: Dr. Frank R. Slopanskey, Alter, Storied Domain, 2:132; Dr. William P. Elliott, ibid., 3:126; Dr. William R. Merrill, ibid., 3:526; Dr. Anthony R. Demman, Sutton, Utah, 3:428-29.


Italians did the rock work for the company store and office at Castle Gate. Utah State Historical Society collections.
Charcoal was made in kilns at M & M, a small Carbon County settlement. Utah State Historical Society collections, gift of Robert W. Edwards.

Two years later the bitter strike of 1922 paralyzed the coal fields.\(^27\) Eleven years later in the lowest depth of the Great Depression, miners struck and failed again. It was not until several years after New Deal legislation legalized unions that management began to alter its antiquated paternalistic role.

Throughout the years of growth in productivity and in workers' rights, mines mirrored the nation's periods of prosperity and recession.\(^28\) The most important development since the beginning of coal mining was the portentous coal and steel merger affected by L.T. Rains, the "Father of Utah steel industry." This early 1920s transaction provided that coke from the Utah Coal and Coke Company in Sunnyside be used to smelt ore from Iron County at Columbia Steel's Geneva plant near Provo. The entire economy of the state continues to be influenced by this fusion of coal and steel.\(^29\)

The Depression years of the 1930s began a long period of change in coal mining. These stagnant years of low production forced people to


\(^{29}\) "Western Steel Industry: Salute to Columbia Steel," *Mining and Contracting Review*, 43 (December 1941), 12–15, 28, 29, 30; L. T. Rains Album, Utah State Historical Society.
abandon the towns. Company houses were boarded up, and fewer coal trains whistled their departures and arrivals. Freight trains passing through carried boys, old men, and later even families with small children west to California.

Mining put the stamp of industrialization on Utah, but its essence lay in the mixture and clash of Mormons, "Americans," and "foreigners," of employers and workers, and of the many religious leaders. Besides the three largest immigrant groups, the Greeks, Italians, and South Slavs, there were French, Spanish-speaking people, Finns, Germans, Basques, Swedes, Blacks, Lebanese, Japanese, Armenians, Syrians, and a sprinkling of other peoples living in the coal towns and producing a dramatic folklore. Mormon midwives whipped horses and rattled by in buckboards. Outlaws rode leisurely in and out. Long-haired, bearded, black-robed priests contemplated their exile from eastern Greek Towns. A Catholic priest of great force, Father (later Monsignor) Alfredo F. Giovannoni, overrode south Italian, north Italian, and Irish dissensions to form a cohesive church body. Julius Shepherd, the ascetic director of the Railroad YMCA, remained for twenty-eight years, his Sunday schools a mingling of many nationalities and races. But Mormon bishops cautioned their wards (congregations) against apostates and "the foreigners."

This combination of many cultures led to Carbon County's being set apart from the rest of Utah. For years on a mountain slope south of Helper, the giant numbers 57 were painted in white. The numbers advertised the fifty-seven varieties of Heinz pickles, but residents said they referred to the varieties of immigrants. And so Greek coffeehouses, Basque hotels for former miners turned to sheepherding, Japanese fish markets and noodle houses, Chinese restaurants, the Helper YMCA where railroad men stayed between runs and where immigrant men went for Saturday-night showers, incongruous "sheep ranches" in isolated canyons with a few motley ewes grazing among the sagebrush while inside nearby shacks, whiskey stills worked at full speed, all were part of the ordinary life of the coal towns.

Now passed into folklore are the individualists, the native-born formed by the frontier, the immigrants responding to the freedoms of this same new land. "Ornery" they were called then; "fearless" they would be called now. One of these was Tom Fitch, the bantam justice of the peace of Helper. He and his wife lived on Main Street in a small frame house next to the first log cabin built in the town. Mrs. Fitch wore her
grey hair in long ringlets under a faded lace bonnet. School children peered through lilac hedges at the clothesline for a glimpse of her panta­loons made from flour sacks. Tom Fitch was the Judge Roy Bean of Helper and gave in to the Robbers Roost Gang only once. Fitch had jailed an attorney for contempt of court. Butch Cassidy came to get his release. “Where’s the bail?” the judge demanded. “Here’s the bail,” Cassidy said, took out his “six guns,” and laid them on the judge’s desk. The judge relented.

Of the company doctors, Andrew W. Dowd ruled regally. When the immigrants first arrived in Sunnyside, they continued the old-country custom of keeping domestic animals under the house or next to the kitchen for their warmth. Doctor Dowd’s castigation forced “American” standards on them. He made certain that the immigrants did not scald pigs in recently installed bathtubs as had been done in the new company houses in Standardville, ruining the plumbing. Yet during the strike of 1922 when guards forced miners’ families out of the company houses, he straddled the porch of one with a shotgun in his hands and defied the guards (and the company that hired him) to approach: for a Greek woman in a late stage of pregnancy lay dangerously ill inside. Doctor Dowd made many rules that he expected to be followed rigidly. For rescue teams he had a list of “don’ts,” one of which charged the men not to chew tobacco while wearing their helmets.30

There were men among the immigrants whose names are not found in documents and newsprint. They helped their compatriots with the courts, with getting their citizenship, and as intermediaries in bridging the transition into American life. And there were the miners who worked the morning, afternoon, and “graveyard” shifts under the constant threat of death but who were willing to be blacklisted and to suffer cold and hunger for unionization.

There were also magnificent women in the coal fields. When the intrepid Mother Jones came to Carbon County during the strike of 1903 to give the miners encouragement, she was hounded by local authorities. Lena Litizzette, one of the first Italian women to come to Utah, hid her from them. In that strike, young Italian women startled the native residents by marching down muddy streets to support their husbands.31

In the 1922 strike, the wife and children of labor organizer Frank Bonacci were put out of their company house. Strikers moved them to a

31 Interviews with Stanley Litizzetti and Philip F. Notarianni.
shack without water or lights on the outskirts of Kenilworth. Each time Bonacci tried to reach his family, guards stationed on the mountain slope with machine guns turned him back. Women begged unrelenting guards to be allowed to take food to the family. Several days later Ann Dolinski came down the road with a basket of food. Ignoring the calls and commands of the guards, she went on to the house. There she scrambled eggs for the children that their hunger would not keep down.32

In the 1933 strike, the South Slav women were as important as their men. When word went out that the strike was called, machinists working the afternoon shift in Spring Canyon were unaware of it. Rival miners and guards with pick handles from the company store waited for the men to get off shift. A three-hundred-pound Slavic woman led wives of the machinists to the portal where they “brought their men out.” A Serbian woman, Milka Dragos, commanding and impressive in stature, saved Sheriff Marion Bliss from a gathering of angry strikers in the Helper park. Margaret Nemanich is a true mining-town folk heroine for the extreme and audacious methods she used to subdue mine officials.33

There were women, too, whose names are not found in print: railroaders’ wives who ran to the mines at the scream of whistles with canaries in their hands for the rescue teams. If the canaries died, there was still gas inside and bodies had to remain longer in the rubble. The women brought food and help to the wives and children waiting in the debris.

There were thousands of immigrant women, repressed by the restrictions of their cultures, who raised large families and took in bachelor boarders, who were caught between their children’s Americanization and the old-country life of their neighborhoods, the Greek Towns, Wop Towns, Bohunk Towns, and Jap Towns.

We have begun to forget the phenomenon of America, the promise fulfilled to millions of immigrants for whom life had been a daily struggle for bread and who in this new country were able to educate sons and daughters. Immigrants working on the railroads and in the mines of the Utah coal fields have raised children to be miners like themselves, as well as attorneys, engineers, educators, dentists, and doctors. Returning to practice in the coal country where they were born were Doctors Ruggeri, Gianotti, Demman, Colombo, and Gorishek; the first was Dr. Charles

32Interview with Marian Bonacci Lupo, May 22, 1972, American West Center.
Immigrant groups, such as this one at Standard in the 1920s, proudly displayed the Stars and Stripes of their adopted country. Utah State Historical Society photograph, Salt Lake Tribune Collection, courtesy of Caroline E. Skerl.

Ruggeri who knew the psychology of immigrants as no "American" doctor could.\textsuperscript{34}

We children of immigrants who have visited our parents' villages are profoundly grateful that America's industrialization, and more specifically Utah's, drew them. Otherwise our lives would have been poor indeed.

Here in Utah's coal fields, then, on what was once Indian land, there came together pioneer hardiness, American individualism, immigrant brawn, and bountiful resources to form an amalgamation, a vital example of how America became a great nation. Much of the great expanse of primeval forests that became coal, the energy of ancient suns locked within, still lies under this rocky, arid land, beautiful to the people who know it. But what Miera saw, the "many varieties of savory fish, very large white geese, many kinds of ducks, and other exquisite birds never seen elsewhere," have long since disappeared. The game, at least, nourished the pioneers. Now that the coal country is coming to life again, its increased industrialization requires intense concern to keep this stark terrain that has sustained a unique blend of cultures clean for future generations.

\textsuperscript{34} Helen Z. Papanikolas, "Greek Folklore of Carbon County," in Thomas E. Cheney \textit{et al.}, eds., \textit{Lore of Faith and Folly} (Salt Lake City, 1971), 71.
The "Foreign Element" and the 1903-4 Carbon County Coal Miners' Strike

BY ALLAN KENT POWELL

The first years of the twentieth century were a time of tremendous growth for the labor movement in the United States. In 1900 nationwide union membership was 868,500, and by 1904 it had more than
doubled to 2,072,700. Unionism moved forward on two fronts: increased membership in already established unions and increased numbers of new unions. Among the important elements in the burgeoning labor movement were the new immigrants from southern and eastern Europe. In the coal fields of Carbon County, Finnish, Slavic, and Italian miners provided the strength behind the new state's most serious labor confrontation to that time, a confrontation that began in the fall of 1903 and lasted more than a year.

Frustrated in their past efforts to unionize, Utah miners found fresh hope in events taking place outside the state. Following the successful anthracite strike of 1902 in Pennsylvania, the United Mine Workers conducted an extensive campaign to expand their control. Prime areas of concern were the far western coal regions of Colorado, Wyoming, and Utah. Consequently the UMW responded immediately to a call for organizers from the Carbon County strikers in 1903. The Utah strike also coincided with strikes in the northern and southern coal fields of Colorado. The Colorado strike proved both an asset and a liability to the Utah strikers. Because of it the national UMW provided funds and organizers that otherwise might not have been available. Also, the movement of organizers back and forth between Utah and Colorado and the fact that some of the Utah miners, especially the Italians, had worked in the Colorado mines, provided ties between the two groups during the strikes. Psychologically this helped sustain the Utah strikers. On the other hand, the Colorado strike soon developed into virtual civil war, and many Utahns feared that the Carbon County strike would follow the same course. The strikers were therefore denied public sympathy from the beginning.

While several emotionally charged issues clouded the Utah strike, labor and management were irrevocably split on the right of workers to organize and would remain so throughout the strike. Because the coal miners' strike in Colorado had begun three days before the Utah strike, the Utah Fuel Company argued that Utah miners had no real grievances.

Mr. Powell is preservation historian at the Utah State Historical Society.

1 Selig Perlman and Philip Taft, History of Labor in the United States, 1896–1932, 4 vols. (New York, 1935), 4:13. However, it should be noted that during this time less than ten percent of the nation's wage earners were involved in the unions as members. Foster Rea Dulles, Labor in America, A History (New York, 1966), 186.

2 In January 1901, the miners at Scofield-Winter Quarters and Clear Creek, Utah, had gone out on strike. The striking miners sent an urgent request to United Mine Workers headquarters in Indianapolis for an organizer. The organizer never arrived. For an account of this strike, see Allan Kent Powell "Labor at the Beginning of the 20th Century: The Carbon County, Utah, Coal Fields, 1900–1905" (M.A. thesis, University of Utah, 1972,) 80–105.
but were only striking in sympathy with the Colorado miners. The strikers denounced this assessment and put forth a number of specific grievances. They charged that they were commonly cheated at the weighing scales (miners were paid by the amount of coal they mined, not the hours they worked), that they were taken advantage of through the scrip and company store system, and that the coal operators frequently violated Utah's eight-hour workday law for miners. In addition to settlement of these grievances, the miners also demanded an increase in pay and recognition of the United Mine Workers Union. The Utah Fuel Company had offered the miners a ten percent raise two days before the strike was called. (This was to be accompanied by a twenty-three percent increase in the price of coal to dealers.) The miners would probably have accepted the offer had the company been willing to recognize the UMW. Realizing that concessions won without union recognition were temporary at best and that without the union to protect them they would probably lose their jobs, the strikers remained firm in their determination to achieve union recognition.

The Utah Fuel Company responded to the strike by announcing that the company store was to go on a strictly cash basis and that credit would be given to no one until the trouble was settled. The company then posted notices assuring employees who remained loyal every possible protection from interference or menace by the strikers. The company's chief detective, C.W. Shores, hired guards to ensure the enforcement of these policies. His recruiting methods were simple and straightforward:

... Applicants arrived in large numbers. Immediately on the arrival of an applicant and a statement from him that he desired employment, Shores handed him a Winchester rifle, "Let's see you load and unload that before we can know whether or not you will suit," said Shores.

The Utah Fuel Company's public response to the strike appealed to nativistic sentiments. Company officials argued that support for the strike came from single men without families, those who had recently arrived in the coal fields, and the "worst element of foreigners." The old-time English-speaking miners, officials claimed, did not support the strike. The company continued to brand the walkout as simply a symp-
pathy strike for the miners of Colorado and blamed labor organizers and agitators from that area for stirring up the previously contented miners.

The company accusation that outside agitators had caused the strike lacked any basis in fact. The move for a strike at Sunnyside had been spearheaded by local American leaders of the United Mine Workers who were supported, initially, by all classes of miners but who ultimately received their most dedicated support from the Italian miners. Immediately after the vote to strike was taken on November 12, local leaders requested that organizers be sent to Sunnyside. The first attempt to bring in union organizers failed when a delegation of six strikers on their way from Sunnyside to Price to meet the incoming officials was intercepted by a party of armed men (supposedly employed by the Utah Fuel Company) and forced at gunpoint to return to Sunnyside. But for the union this proved a temporary setback only. By November 17, union leaders with the aid of the Italian organizer Charles DeMolli, who according to local legend secretly entered Sunnyside in a wagonload of hay, had succeeded in organizing a miners' union with an enrollment of 468 members.

Officials reacted quickly to the unionizing effort. On November 17, a regular payday at Sunnyside, all men not working were paid in full and notified to consider themselves discharged. Those occupying company houses were ordered to vacate. The company then launched an active recruiting program among farmers in the local areas to work the mines, in this manner succeeding in keeping the Sunnyside mines in operation, although production was curtailed greatly.

Following the initial success at Sunnyside, the UMW organizers turned their attention to the remaining Carbon County camps: Castle Gate, Clear Creek, and Scofield-Winter Quarters. On November 19,

---

6 In a letter from John Mitchell, president of the United Mine Workers of America, to Edwin F. Holmes, president of the Salt Lake City Commercial Club, November 27, 1903, Mitchell denied that the Utah strike had been called as a sympathetic strike for the Colorado strikers. "Utah miners are not striking in sympathy with miners of Colorado. On the contrary, they demand an increase of 20 percent in wages. Not to exceed three organizers are stationed in Utah. It is unreasonable to suppose that two or three organizers could intimidate Utah miners and prevent their working if they desired. I am anxious for an amicable settlement and am willing to meet representatives of the coal company for the purpose of arranging conditions of settlement." Quoted in the Salt Lake Tribune, November 28, 1903, p. 11.

6 According to the Eastern Utah Advocate (Price), December 3, 1903, the mining population of the Carbon County camps was as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Camp</th>
<th>Italian</th>
<th>English Speaking</th>
<th>Austrian</th>
<th>Finn</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Castle Gate</td>
<td>356</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunnyside</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>356</td>
<td>222</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clear Creek</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>95</td>
<td></td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winter Quarters</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>181</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
On November 21 the strike entered a new phase when Carbon County Sheriff Hyrum Wilcox, fearing the eruption of violence, requested help from Gov. Heber M. Wells who responded by sending Gen. John Q. Cannon of the Utah National Guard to investigate conditions in Carbon County. Cannon found the coal camps in a state of emotional excitement. Union organizers were at the pinnacle of their success in recruiting members, approximately twelve hundred miners having joined the union. Parades were held daily by the strikers, and at Castle Gate the parades were led by the Italian brass band. The articulate organizers effectively appealed to the miners’ dignity as men. In one speech William Price, a prominent organizer, reported:

I met the attorney general of Utah the other day and he said to me: “The men who dig coal in Utah make nearly as much, if not all as much, as the men who handle the pen.” Now, in the name of God, are not the men who dig coal entitled to as much as men who whirl the pen? The attorney general told me he went into the homes of the miners in Scofield. “You didn’t see any Brussel carpet there did you?” I said to him. Then I said: “Hasn’t my wife as much right to wear a silk dress as your wife, Mr. Kramer’s wife or Mr. Williams’ wife.” He said he supposed of course, if I could afford it, but I tell you, my friends, what these men say to us is: “Calico was made for you people and silk for us.”

The labor organizers continually urged their members to avoid any threats or acts of violence toward those who continued to work in the

---


8 The parades were colorful affairs. On February 18, 1904, the Eastern Utah Advocate noted that a parade had been held at Helper in which the strikers masqueraded as capitalists, miners, and slaves.

9 Salt Lake Herald, December 11, 1903, p. 2.
mines. They argued that only by peaceful means could they win public support for the strike. Nevertheless, threats were made and acts of intimidation were committed by a few of the strikers. The antiunion forces magnified these incidents until public opinion, for the most part, was swayed against the strikers. Some of the alleged acts included calling miners who were willing to work “scabs.” James Polve was threatened with expulsion from the Italian lodge at Castle Gate if he continued to work.10 Some men were prevented from going to work when their clothes were stolen or soaked with water so that they could not be worn. At Sunnyside strikers were accused of burning a partly loaded boxcar and the “murder” of a company guard’s cow.11 At Castle Gate and the upper camps the Italian strikers were accused of showing disrespect for the American flag when they carried it upside down in their parades. (Charles DeMolli, the Italian organizer, claimed that this was done out of ignorance, not disrespect.) Threatening letters were also sent to certain miners. One of the most colorful notes was written to John Knudsend:

Mr. John Kundsend [sic]: You are hereby notified that if you scab here any more you had better be buying a coffin, and that pretty soon, too. And if you ride that rope tomorrow you will be hung tomorrow night. Now, you ——— ——— ———, you look out, because we mean just what we say. The men that rote this letter belong to the White Cap society, and if you work tomorrow you will see them tomorrow night.12

On the other hand, the situation was aggravated by the presence of numerous company guards who had been deputized. They served without pay from the county but were given five dollars a day plus room and board by the Utah Fuel Company. Some company guards were sympathetic to the strikers; however, the extremely high wages paid the guards—many of them farmers who sought winter jobs to supplement their income—compromised their sympathies.13 Some guards were guilty of intimidating and bullying strikers, trying to provoke them to lawlessness.14

Upon General Cannon’s return to Salt Lake City Governor Wells held a conference with state officials and members of the legislature. The

11 Salt Lake Telegram, December 2, 1903, p. 4.
12 Deseret Evening News, November 24, 1903, p. 2.
13 Lott Powell, one of the guards at Sunnyside, said that although he agreed with the miners’ grievances, the unbelievable pay offered men to become company guards could not be turned down. Lott Powell, interview, Salt Lake City, January 3, 1971.
14 One such guard, C. L. “Gunplay” Maxwell, who continually sought to become a bona fide member of the Robber’s Roost gang, was the antithesis of the gallant Butch Cassidy.
The group reached a unanimous decision, based on General Cannon’s report, that sufficient cause existed for ordering state troops into the coal fields to preserve order. The following day, November 23, 1903, Governor Wells issued a proclamation calling out the Guard; and by November 24, the entire National Guard was in the coal fields of Carbon County. They took up positions at Castle Gate, Scofield, and Clear Creek. The strength of the National Guard was given as 34 officers and 399 men. Although the entire force had been called out, only three hundred or so actually went to Carbon County. Some guardsmen who were university students, farmers, or ranchers were excused unless conditions worsened.

According to newspaper reports and instructions given by National Guard officers, the troops were to aid county officials in protecting com-

---

One story from eastern Utah tells how Gunplay Maxwell rode into a camp of prospectors who were looking for gilsonite in the Hill Creek country east of Green River. To demonstrate how bad he was, Maxwell tried to pick fight with one of the smaller men. The prospectors invited Maxwell to take off his guns and fight. He boastfully replied, “I never take my guns off.” “The hell you don’t!” shouted the prospectors as they stripped Maxwell of his guns and turned the man loose on him. Following the fight, the half-dead badman was loaded on his horse and sent on his way. In 1898 Maxwell had been sentenced to prison for eighteen years for robbing the Springville bank, but on November 21, 1903, his sentence was commuted by influential friends, presumably Utah Fuel Company officials, and he went to Carbon County as a company guard. Charles Kelly, *The Outlaw Trail*, (New York, 1959), 185.


17 Matt T. Howard, interview, Nephi, Utah, February 4, 1971. Mr. Howard was a member of the Nephi Company called out in 1903.
pany property from destruction by the strikers and to prevent threats and intimidation against those miners who wanted to work. Some guardsmen held this procompany, antiunion attitude throughout the strike. However, many others, as a result of friendly relations with the strikers and growing disgust with the coal company, found their sympathies swayed.18 J.L. Ewing, sergeant in the Nephi Company and editor of the Nephi Record, noted this shift in one of his editorials:

When the militia was sent out it was supposed to be to protect the coal trust's property and the lives of its employees from a lot of anarchists and lawless people; but investigation so far has shown that the strikers are quite as law abiding as are the emissaries of the coal trust and that the striking miners are just as much in need of protection from the hired guards of the trust, as the company property and men are in need of protection from the striking miners....

We have but little sympathy with the miners out there, and we have still less sympathy for the coal trust. In the first place if the trust is paying $3 to $8 a day to miners as they claim, or an average of $3.50 to $3.75 a day they have no need to hire Finns or Dagos. They can get the best miners in the country for such pay; and if they have imported under contract or otherwise a lot of anarchists, as they claim they are, from the old countries, they have brought their trouble upon themselves and ought to suffer for it. As time goes on it is becoming plainer and plainer that the companies have been trying to prejudice the public by coloring the reports that have gone from the coal camps to favor the companies and to grossly misrepresent the strikers.

It is a very significant fact that most of the militiamen who have returned are in sympathy with the strikers, and when they left for the coal camps the very reverse was true....19

18 Citizens of Sunnyside, including the strikers, were quite hospitable to the troops. "Whenever a soldier enters the hut of a miner, wine, beer, and whiskey is at once produced and offense is taken if their hospitality is not accepted." Salt Lake Tribune, December 20, 1903, p. 8.

19 Nephi Record, December 11, 1903, p. 4.

National Guardsmen assembled at their armory to prepare for duty in Carbon County. Salt Lake Herald photograph by Harry Shipler, 1903.
One of the National Guard’s first duties was to assist Sheriff Wilcox in arresting the Italian organizer Charles DeMolli whose background and personal magnetism made him a strong adversary. DeMolli was born in 1870 in Brussels, Belgium. His father was a horse trainer from Milan and his mother a native of Como in Italy. He was educated at the Institute of Milan and served three years in the Italian army before going to work in the silk mills of Como. In 1895 he became involved in a strike and revolution at Como and was banished from Italy. Coming to the United States he began writing for Italian newspapers in the East. He drifted to the coal mines in Pennsylvania where he renewed his interest in unionism. Later DeMolli worked in the coal mines of Colorado until he became associated with the newspaper Il Lavoratore Italiano, published at Trinidad, Colorado, that served as the organ of the United Mine Workers among the Italians. The Salt Lake Herald described DeMolli’s charismatic appeal:

DeMolli, the silver-tongued, whose influence with his fellow countrymen is so feared by the Utah Fuel Company officials... is in appearance far from being the wild-eyed anarchist he is pictured by his enemies. A tall handsome man in appearance, dressed in the rough chin-in jacket, flannel shirt, corduroy trousers and laced boots of a miner, he has a handsome face, typically Italian, with a small sloping mustache. His voice is soft and his manners suave. ...

Besides being big and strong and handsome, and with a magnetic personality, DeMolli is eloquent with tongue and pen in the Italian language. Not only this but he can talk in their native tongues with Finns, Slavs, French, or representatives of other nationalities. With his level head, shrewd judgment, college education, suave manner, and great magnetism, he is regarded as one of the strongest men affiliated with the United Mine Workers and he is idolized by his followers.

On November 20 DeMolli and several other organizers went by train to Scofield, intending to organize the miners at Winter Quarters and Clear Creek. A committee of the Citizens Alliance and coal com-

---

20 In an interview printed in Salt Lake Herald, December 7, 1903, DeMolli described the Como strike: “It is true that I am an exile and cannot go back to my country for three years more. I took part in what has been called the Como revolution in 1895. At that time 40,000 workers struck. The general in command there in the city of Como telegraphed King Humbert—the king is dead now: may his soul rest in peace—and asked what he should do. King Humbert wired back ‘You are the general, do as you please.’ “The general then moved on the city with four regiments of soldiers and began arresting men, women and children. Many thousand of us went to the military district and got rifles and resisted. There were several killed and many wounded. They sent a man to treat with us and offered us terms. We were close to the border of Switzerland there, and they demanded that some of us who had been prominent should go over into Switzerland and stay. The leader on our side who was a deputy in the Italian parliament advised us to do this and I went. I was exiled for ten years...”

21 Ibid., p. 1., and December 8, 1903, p. 6.
pany employees met the organizers at Scofield and refused to let them detrain. DeMolli and his aides were told that it was useless for them to visit the camps because the miners had signed an agreement that they would not strike. DeMolli returned to Helper and enlisted the services of two cowboys who assured him that they would furnish an escort of twenty-five men if necessary and see to it that he arrived in Scofield without injury. The trip was made overland by horseback on November 23, evading company guards covering the railroads and highways. DeMolli’s influence was felt immediately; within two days the strike had been organized in the northern fields, and the entire county was then involved in the dispute.

The success at Clear Creek and Winter Quarters was marred by DeMolli’s arrest at Scofield by Sheriff Wilcox on the morning of November 25 on a charge of disturbing the peace. A detachment of guardsmen accompanied Wilcox to the Lone Star Saloon where DeMolli was speaking to a group of several hundred. The strikers could have easily overpowered the detachment. Reflecting apprehension and fear, one guardsman nudged the soldier next to him and said, “God! This looks like this is about the end. If they rush us we’ll look like rag dolls laying around here.” However, when DeMolli saw the sheriff he held up his hands and said in English, “Quiet down boys. Everything’s all right.” As he left with the sheriff, DeMolli once again cautioned the strikers to preserve the peace and avoid disturbances of any kind. The organizer was immediately taken before the local justice of the peace, found guilty of disturbing the peace, and sentenced to thirty days in the county jail at Price.

On November 30 a special court session at Price heard evidence in habeas corpus proceedings brought against the sheriff and jailer of Carbon County. After hearing the evidence Judge Jacob Johnson quashed the proceedings. An appeal was made to Justice William Burrows at Scofield. The appeal and a change of venue to Clear Creek were granted. At Clear Creek the trial lasted all day and late into the evening of December 4. But after ten minutes of deliberation the four jurymen returned a verdict of not guilty. DeMolli was free.

Meanwhile, the last days of November saw the arrival of Dr. Giuseppe Cuneo, the Italian consul, from Denver. Newspaper reports

---

22 Salt Lake Tribune, November 24, 1903, p. 3.
23 Howard interview.
24 Ibid.
said he had come at the solicitation of the coal company. In any event, he quickly alienated the striking Italians. First, they heard rumors that he had come to persuade them to go back to work. Further, he had not bothered to inform any of his countrymen of the visit, and upon his arrival at Scofield he met with General Cannon and other officials before seeing any of the strikers. When he finally issued a request for several of the leading Italians to meet with him, some refused, and those who did agree to see him were almost prevented from doing so when deputy marshals tried to break up a meeting at union headquarters called to elect representatives to speak with the consul. The deputy marshals retreated upon being shown an order from General Cannon granting permission for the meeting. In avowing a position of neutrality, Dr. Cuneo failed the striking Italians of Carbon County. With his strong support, the strike might have acquired a kind of legitimacy that it did not have. Ultimately the failure of Dr. Cuneo to sustain the Italians was seen by the public as testimony that the strike was unwarranted.

Before his arrest, DeMolli had expressed a desire to meet with Governor Wells to discuss the strike. Following his acquittal he traveled to Salt Lake City where he, John Thal of the Utah Federation of Labor, and two union attorneys, A.B. Edler and J.S. Fowler, met with the governor. DeMolli denied that the walkout had been called in sympathy with the Colorado strike and insisted that all the miners wanted was for the company to allow union men to work alongside nonunion men. The company was still demanding that miners foreswear any union affiliation as a prerequisite for returning to work. Union officials failed to obtain any support from the state. In fact, the union cause was struck a severe blow when Governor Wells was quoted as saying, “Mr. DeMolli, you are not welcome. We don’t want you, and the sooner you are out of the state, the better we will be pleased. We will facilitate your going in every way possible.” The day after the conference the *Salt Lake Herald* denounced DeMolli:

> We submit that a man whose ideas of government justify that sort of striking [referring to the Como strike of 1895] is not fit representative of either unionism or American citizenship; and we question whether any

---


26 *Salt Lake Tribune*, December 8, 1903, p. 1.
union of American citizens would tolerate his leadership a single day. . . . Every friend of the miners will hope that DeMolli will be discarded at once and invited to go elsewhere. If he isn’t, the union might well prepare to lose its case with the general public.  

Within a week DeMolli had left the state, but not permanently. In February of the following year he would return to Carbon County.

In the coal fields several isolated incidents kept the situation in a state of tension, but no serious violence occurred. Sheriff Wilcox, while at Clear Creek, was forced to give up his rifle by two shotgun-wielding Italian women. A Finn was arrested and charged with assault for throwing rocks at another Finn who wanted to work. On the road between Scofield and Winter Quarters, a fight took place when two Finns called John Burgess and Joe Ruff “scabs”; with the arrival of a soldier the Finns tried to run away but were caught and arrested. Reports of threats and intimidations against those who wanted to work were common. The peace of the area was further jeopardized by the arrival of a carload of wine for the Italian strikers on the same day the National Guard entered the northern camps. W. Lloyd Adams, a member of the Nephi Company gave the following account of his first experience on guard duty:

... My first beat was between two large square houses filled with Italians. They had unloaded a great many fifty gallon barrels of wine during the day. It seemed to be a celebration in these houses as I walked my beat up and down between those houses sometimes women would shake their fists at me and talk in a foreign language and sometimes men. I wasn’t more than 16 and of course I kept walking. I didn’t rest a minute on that beat.  

Meanwhile, the Utah Fuel Company accelerated its efforts to curtail the activities of the union organizers. Exerting great influence upon the civil authorities, the company saw to the arrest of most of the leading union officials. On December 8, William R. Lewis, a secretary, and

---

27 Salt Lake Herald, December 8, 1903, p. 4.  
28 W. Lloyd Adams, “Memoirs of W. Lloyd Adams,” pp. 6–7. A typescript copy of this portion of his unpublished memoirs was obtained by the author from Adams’s niece, Sadie Greenhalgh, Nephi, Utah.
William Marinelli, president of the Scofield union, were arrested, convicted, and sentenced to twenty days in jail on charges of vagrancy. David Wilson, secretary of the Sunnyside union, was arrested on a charge of disturbing the peace. Most sensational, however, was the arrest of A.B. Edler, attorney for the United Mine Workers. When Edler arrived at Scofield on December 9 to defend the union men who had been arrested, he was served with a warrant for his own arrest on a charge of criminal libel. The charge grew out of comments that Edler had made to the newspapers about the company guards.

During the proceedings that followed, William H. King, attorney for Edler, in one of his encounters with M.C. Braffet, attorney for the Utah Fuel Company, was quoted as saying:

> I have practiced before many courts, but I have never seen a place where the desire to railroad a man through to jail was so manifest. It is outrageous, and there is not another place where an attorney for a corporation is supreme to the court.\(^9\)

At the preliminary hearing Edler was released on bonds of $1,500. According to observers, the court session continually bordered on physical violence between the opposing lawyers. The Edler affair brought a strong warning from Governor Wells to the Utah Fuel Company officials, telling them to be careful and to keep a tight rein on the actions of their guards. The governor also requested General Cannon to make an investigation and submit a report on the Edler arrest and trial. After discussing the episode at some length, Cannon, in his report to the governor, concluded:

> I am of the opinion . . . that the whole incident has been ridiculously magnified by Mr. Edler himself in the interest of his own notoriety, and by the “war correspondents,” who in the absence of anything at all exciting in a campaign so entirely uneventful and peaceable as this, seize upon the merest pretext around which to weave a “story.” The episode would not have warranted more than an inch of space in the ordinary newspaper column if occurring under normal conditions.\(^10\)

The newspapers were critical of the general’s assessment of the Edler affair. A *Salt Lake Herald* editorial attacked him severely:

> ... Cannon has demonstrated his inability to observe clearly and state facts without prejudice. If his sentiments and attitude have been construed fairly he has no business in a position of judicial or semijudicial responsibility . . . he seems to assume that the state forces have been

\(^9\) *Salt Lake Tribune*, December 11, 1903, p. 1.
\(^10\) Cannon’s report was published in the *Deseret Evening News*, December 14, 1903, p. 5.
sent to Carbon county to be placed at the disposal of the Utah Fuel Com­pany till further orders, the taxpayers to settle all the bills.\footnote{Salt Lake Herald, December 14, 1903, p. 4.}

Tension continued to percolate through the coal camps. At Sunny­side Sunday evening, December 20, a public confrontation resulted in the arrest of thirty-three Italians. While at a dance, Virginio Bonvicini was asked if he would rather go back to work than move into a tent. He replied that he would rather return to work. At this point six or seven men began calling him a “scab” and other offensive names. When Bonvicini reported the matter to Justice George Hill, the Italians were arrested and charged with disturbing the peace. Nineteen of the thirty-three were found guilty: thirteen were fined five dollars plus costs; five were fined ten dollars plus costs; and one was fined twenty-four dollars plus costs. Two men paid their fines, but seventeen served time in the county jail in default of the money. They were described as being a “jolly good­natured set and accepted their sentences of imprisonment laughingly.”\footnote{Salt Lake Herald, December 23, 1903, p. 1.} Each Italian wore in his cap a feather plucked from a stuffed eagle in the Knights of Pythias hall at Sunnyside where they had been confined under guard.

As the strike continued, expressions of antiforeign sentiments grew more frequent. The coal company continually placed the blame for the strike on the Italians, claiming that it was the foreigners, not the English­speaking miners, that the labor agitators were able to stir up. The Salt Lake Herald echoed the refrain: “It is a satisfaction to know that . . . these threats have not come from American citizens, but from an alien class, ignorant in most cases, unlettered, and led by individuals who have little regard for the law and less for the institutions of civil liberty.”\footnote{Salt Lake Herald, November 25, 1903, p. 4.} The editors also noted that while there was no better citizen than the Italian from the north, there could not be any more undesirable citizen than the southern Italian.

As part of the antistrike rhetoric, Italians were sometimes characterized as opportunistic and niggardly. For example, James A. Harrison, Carbon County commissioner, commented:

\begin{quote}
The Italians as a class, live on about one-third what it costs the American miner, while at the same time they make the same amount of money for the same work. They have money saved to leave the country or remain in idleness for months. . . .\footnote{Ibid., November 20, 1903, p. 2.}
\end{quote}
Striking miners matched pennies to help pass the time. Deseret News photograph, 1903.

The Deseret Evening News, reflecting a similar point of view, charged that "these Italians have refused to amalgamate with Americans or learn the English language and have lived with the intention of getting out of this country all they could and then returning to their native land of olives and dirt." When Adjt. Gen. Charles S. Burton visited the coal camps local citizens told him that while the Italians were posing as the most peaceful and inoffensive people possible, they stood with a dagger concealed ready to plunge it into someone's back.

Discontent with the situation in Carbon County spread to the National Guard, many of whom found their experience unpleasant for a variety of reasons. For the first twenty days the common soldier was paid a dollar and fifty cents a day from state monies, but beginning with the twenty-first day of active duty the Guard went on the federal pay scale of forty-three cents a day. This caused much discontent, as many of the men had had to leave good paying jobs with no assurance that their posi-

---

35 Deseret Evening News, December 7, 1903, p. 4.
36 Ibid., p. 1.
tions would be held for them. Additionally, temperatures during November and December were very low, and the inexperienced guardsmen suffered accordingly; at least one private on guard duty was overcome by the cold and found unconscious at his post. Company H at Castle Gate became infested with lice and had to be fumigated. With little to do except carry out the monotonous task of guard duty the soldiers suffered also from boredom. One sergeant from Salt Lake City had written home so often describing the inactivity of the troops with the phrase “war is hell” that he began receiving letters addressed to “War is Hell” Tobias.

As weather permitted the guardsmen engaged in sports such as baseball and football. At Clear Creek the Nephi troops borrowed sleighs from the local Finnish children for use on the snow-covered hills of that camp. Occasionally, dances were held by the guardsmen where the only way to tell the “males” from the “females” was that the former wore hats and the latter did not. But idleness remained a problem and created strained relations among the soldiers. At one point two Nephi soldiers, after a disagreement, got their guns and started for the woods. One of them was heard to say, “We’re going up into that timber and one of us isn’t coming back.”

For a time some of the soldiers tried their hand at mining in the employment of the coal company, but this lasted only a few days. Certain guardsmen became jealous of others working for pay; and the company, after some soldiers barely escaped a cave-in, decided that the hiring of soldiers might create an unpleasant situation and no longer sought their employment.

While the National Guard had been enthusiastically welcomed by the local coal company, it was received with mixed feelings by the strikers. At Clear Creek the Finnish community offered the soldiers the

---

37 Ibid., p. 4.
38 Quoting from a letter written by Gen. John Q. Cannon to Adjt. Gen. Charles S. Burton, December 14, 1903: “The two companies here [Castle Gate] are so widely separated as to their camps that it is found necessary to have them mess separately. . . .

Another reason for causing the two companies to mess separately I dislike extremely to mention, but feel that perhaps I should do so. It is in brief that quite a number of the members of ‘H’ company are found to be lousy. We are taking the most heroic measures to eradicate the evil, and upon the receipt of certain supplies tomorrow shall thoroughly fumigate all bedding and tentage; have the men thoroughly bathed and put into new clothing, which at their expense we have been able to get from the store here. The first indication of the most lamentable condition was noted two or three days ago in one man who was immediately isolated from the others; but it has spread with considerable rapidity, though the company itself is made up of men who are on the whole rather superior as to their habits of cleanliness.” Cannon to Burton, December 14, 1903, in “Report—Militia At Scofield During Miners Strike, 1904.”
39 Salt Lake Tribune, December 18, 1903, p. 4.
40 Howard interview.
41 Ibid.
use of its social and cultural facility, Finn Hall, for their barracks. But at Winter Quarters the Finnish miners denied the soldiers use of a similar hall. In a practical sense the strikers were glad the National Guard was there, in the words of Charles DeMolli, “to protect them from the company guards and sheriffs.” From an ideological standpoint, however, the strikers disliked the presence of soldiers because it implied a state of lawlessness—a condition attributed to the strikers, not the company.

Despite newspaper reports and statements by government officials to the contrary, the public was not convinced of the necessity of the Guard’s remaining in the coal fields. From the day the Guard was called out, friends and relatives had tried to persuade the officers that certain soldiers were not needed or that conditions warranted their remaining at home. Many citizens resented the large expenditure necessary to maintain the Guard in the coal fields. Others were skeptical of the Guard’s purpose in Carbon County, especially after the Utah Fuel Company had said it would continue to discriminate against union men.

With the cold weather, inactivity, and approach of Christmas, many guardsmen became anxious to return home. Discontent was expressed in the following letter from a soldier in the field and quoted in the *Salt Lake Herald*:

> We have seen no trouble and there has been evidence of none. I understand public sentiment is against the whole thing and it ought to be. We wouldn’t any of us kick if there were need of us, but as it is this stunt will finish the national guard. I will ask for a discharge as soon as I reach Salt Lake, and almost all the company will do the same. . . .

Only two problems prevented the return of the militia before Christmas: the reopening of the mine at Castle Gate and the eviction of strikers from company houses, scheduled for the first of January.

The reopening of the Castle Gate mine was significant for a number of reasons. First, it was the only mine that had been shut down by the strike. In addition, the mine was a hard place to work, and there was some concern that sufficient miners could not be found to reopen it. On December 11, representatives of the strikers met at Helper and voted unani-

---

42 *Salt Lake Tribune*, December 3, 1903, p. 12. One of the most clever appeals was sent by a man from Provo in behalf of his son who had recently been married. Enclosed in the letter to General Cannon was the following scripture found in Deuteronomy 24:5. “When a man hath taken a new wife, he shall not go out to war, neither shall he be charged with any business; but he shall be free at home one year, and shall cheer up his wife which he has taken.”

43 *Ibid.*, December 14, 1903, p. 4. Commenting on this the *Salt Lake Tribune* said: “... the public has no interest whatever in supporting a blacklist against union men; and the time has come when the public must be considered, above any claim or contention of either party to the dispute.”

44 *Salt Lake Herald*, December 20, 1903, p. 4.
mously to return to work, providing the company did not discriminate against union men. The following day David Crow, mine superintendent at Castle Gate, posted a notice that the mine would reopen on December 21 and that applications from strikers and other miners would be accepted until noon on December 15. Newspapers were jubilant with the expectation that the coal company would agree to this concession. However, company officials demanded that prospective employees forego the union. They argued that those miners who had remained loyal to the company would refuse to work if the union men were hired. The strikers, on the other hand, charged that the company wanted to break the union completely. As a result the call to apply for work was ignored to a man by the union miners.

At another meeting held at Helper on December 18, union representatives drafted a formal address to company vice-president C.W. Kramer that contained a list of their grievances and at the same time expressed the desire to return to work provided no discrimination was made against members of the union. They waited in vain for a reply. The union had played its last hand, and now its strategy was to wait and see if the newly recruited men would be capable of taking over the strikers' jobs.

At 5 A.M. December 21 the whistle at Castle Gate called the miners from their sleep to work. Deadlines had been drawn at the east and west ends of the camp, and groups of six company guards patrolled them. On a hill overlooking the camp, guardsmen with their gatling guns in place were ready for any trouble. Estimates of the labor force recruited throughout the state ranged from the union calculation of 25 men to the company figure of 103 men. Regardless, the company succeeded in reopening the mine.

The eviction of strikers from company houses and their removal from company property was accomplished, with one exception, without violence. That exception occurred at Winter Quarters on December 27 when about twenty guards were in the process of evicting the unmarried Finnish strikers. The guards had also ordered three married men to move and attempted to force them out of their homes, even though the married strikers had been given until the first of January to leave. The guards were attacked by the Finns and several were severely beaten. The fate of the guards might have been worse had not one of their number escaped and run to the National Guard for assistance. Company F of Manti hurried to the scene. The company guards ordered the soldiers to open fire on the
mob, but the order was ignored. Through a simple request, the soldiers were able to persuade the Finns to cease hostilities. Company F had been the Christmas guests of the Finnish strikers the night before and were recognized as friends.

After their eviction, strikers from various company towns gathered in such labor union camps as Mitchellville (apparently named for John Mitchell, president of the United Mine Workers) near Sunnyside or the Half-Way House between Helper and Castle Gate. Here, and at other places, the strikers lived in tents provided by the union. Some men felt that the newly recruited labor force would soon prove inadequate, and the company would be forced to take them back. Others, less optimistic, left after a short stay. They were encouraged in this by the coal company which made arrangements with the Denver and Rio Grande Railroad to give the strikers a reduced rate, one cent a mile, on one-way tickets from Carbon County.

The company faced a particularly ticklish problem with the houses, some 225 of them, built by strikers on company land. Legally the houses belonged to the coal company, but public sympathy would not rest with the company in evicting strikers from houses built by the miners. A compromise was negotiated between G.W. Kramer of the Utah Fuel Company and William H. King, attorney for the strikers. A committee of three appraisers was appointed: one by the company, one by the union, and one by the two appointed appraisers. The committee would appraise the value of each house and improvements made by the strikers. They would also fix a reasonable rental value on the property. The strikers would then leave the homes but be paid the rental value fixed by the appraisers, in advance, for a period of six months. The strikers would also have the right to sell the property at any time before October 31, 1904, subject to the approval of the company. All of the strikers, with the exception of a group of Italians at Castle Gate, agreed to the compromise.

Following the peaceful reopening of the mine at Castle Gate and the relatively peaceful eviction of the striking miners, it was apparent to almost everyone that the National Guard was no longer needed. In

No records have been found as to how many houses were sold or how successful the compromise actually was. In 1923 attorneys for the striking miners of that year made the following comments regarding this 1904 agreement: "Houses and improvements, valued by a disinterested arbitration committee at approximately $60,000.00 were confiscated, and in only three or four instances was restitution ever made." Samuel A. King, "Statement and Brief Concerning the Campaign of the Coal Operators in Utah against Organized Labor and the Unionizing of the Utah Coal Fields," photocopy, Utah State Historical Society Library, Salt Lake City.

Some Carbon County citizens felt that the evacuation of the National Guard was premature. Strikers were among those who requested that the militia remain. . . . the strikers themselves, in the form of a petition in one instance, and in repeated personal requests to and conver-
retrospect, many citizens commented that the calling out of the entire National Guard had been unnecessary from the beginning and that the same duty could have been performed by a corporal’s guard in each of the coal camps. By the first week of January more than half of the soldiers in Carbon County had been relieved, and by January 24 all of the troops had returned home.

The Utah Fuel Company continued its recruiting attempts throughout the state, and as a result an issue that had been brewing finally surfaced. Since most of the strikebreakers were Mormon, the church attitude towards labor and unionism suddenly demanded definition. When Angus Cannon, president of the Salt Lake Stake, announced in the tabernacle that employment in the coal fields of Carbon County was available to anyone who wanted it, the issue burst into the open. Con Kelliner, organizer for the United Mine Workers, reacted to Cannon’s announcement by charging that “the Mormon church had commenced a fight to annihilate union labor in Utah” and warning that “union men must be aroused to the true situation and defend themselves and appeal to national labor organizations throughout America to assist in unseating Reed Smoot, who is a member and who would be a dangerous foe to labor in Congress.”

Kelliner also sent letters to Samuel Gompers, president of the American Federation of Labor, and John Mitchell, president of the United Mine Workers, calling upon them to use their power to prevent the seating of Reed Smoot in the U.S. Senate. Kelliner reasoned that Smoot in the Senate would be a dangerous and powerful foe to labor and that his unseating would serve as rebuke to the Mormon church for its intervention in the Carbon County labor dispute.

Kelliner’s charges prompted a telegram from the LDS First Presidency to Gompers and Mitchell in which the official church position was defined:

Reports have been circulated that the Mormon Church had used its influence against organized labor, and had endeavored to fill the places of union strikers with non-union men, we hereby emphatically deny that the Church over which we preside has taken any such steps or issued any instructions on this matter. The whole story originated in a false newspaper report. Joseph F. Smith, John R. Winder and Anthon H. Lund.

stations with me urged that the troops remain. It was peculiarly gratifying to feel that in a situation of such delicacy, our soldiers had gained the confidence of all elements of the community.” Cannon to Burton, December 31, 1903, in “Report—Militia at Scofield During Miners Strike, 1904.”

* Salt Lake Tribune, December 29, 1903, p. 4.
* Deseret Evening News, January 4, 1904, p. 4.
Thus the issue was played down. The church did not want labor unions as enemies in its attempt to seat Reed Smoot, and the labor union did not wish to fight both the coal company and the Mormon church in Utah.

Because Mormon miners did not remain in sufficient numbers, the company was forced, despite public promises to the contrary, to fall back on "foreign labor." Initially, a few Blacks and Japanese were hired. Later a group of twenty-five Greeks arrived to work in the mines, thus beginning the great influx of that important ethnic group into Carbon County.49

Meanwhile, during the first part of February 1904, Charles DeMolli, who had left the state at the governor's request in December 1903, returned to Carbon County. While at Sunnyside he and Joseph Barboglio, treasurer for the United Mine Workers, were arrested by company guards when they tried to cross a deadline on their way from Sunnyside to Helper. They were taken to the city jail and held without charges being preferred against them. That evening when company guards arrived to take their prisoners to the company boarding house for supper they found that the men had escaped by taking off the bolts on the inside of the door. DeMolli and Barboglio were caught late that night below the coal camp, taken before Justice Hill, and found guilty of breaking jail. They were sentenced to thirty days in jail and fined thirty dollars. After an appeal both were released on a $250 bond.

A week later John Trewarther, president, and Thomas Casley, secretary, of the Scofield miners' union were arrested, tried, and found guilty of conspiracy. Bonds were placed at $1,000 which Trewarther and Casley were unable to obtain. Three weeks later their attorney succeeded in having the bonds reduced to $500, and the men were released from jail.

Strategically the arrest of union leaders continued to be an effective tool used by procompany individuals to crush the strike. Although legal justification for the arrests and convictions was highly questionable, the policy as stated by one company guard seemed to be "damn the legality, so long as we make it stick."50 The arrest of union officials was insignificant, however, when compared to the arrest of 120 Italian strikers following the arrival of Mother Jones in Carbon County.

Mother Mary Jones was one of the most forceful and colorful individuals in the history of American labor. Born in 1830 in Cork, Ireland, she emigrated to America as a child. In 1861 she married, but six years

49 Helen Zeese Papanikolas, Toil and Rage in A New Land: The Greek Immigrants in Utah, published as Utah Historical Quarterly, 36 (Spring 1970).
50 Deseret Evening News, December 8, 1903, p. 10.
later while living in Memphis, Tennessee, she lost her husband and four small children in a yellow fever epidemic. Following this tragedy, she went to Chicago where she engaged in dressmaking. To working men, Mother Jones represented the best qualities of Joan of Arc and Mother Mary. But to her enemies she was a “vulgar, heartless, vicious creature, with a fiery temper and a coldblooded heart brutally rare even in the slums.” $^{51}$ She was accused of being a well-known character in the red light districts of Omaha, Kansas City, Chicago, and San Francisco. In Denver she allegedly had her own brothel and the Deseret Evening News reported that she was a good friend of the notorious Kate Flint, one of the pioneer scarlet women of Salt Lake City.$^{52}$

Mother Jones was active in Colorado until April 1904 when she came to Utah. Her arrival at Helper, as described by the News, was typical of her flamboyant style:

She walked to the best hotel and announced who she was. Later she entered the dining room and sat down to dinner. At the close of her meal the waitress placed a finger bowl before her. “Take it away my girl,” she said in a voice that could be heard all over the dining room, as was doubtlessly intended, “such things are not for me, they only give some poor overworked girl extra work at washing dishes.”

$^{51}$ Ibid., April 30, 1904, p. 6.
$^{52}$ Ibid.
The sentiment was applauded as being as noble a one as ever uttered by the white haired old woman dressed in black. The words were passed from mouth to mouth and the railroad hands who boarded at the hotel were filled with admiration for her sterling qualities.53

On the first Sunday after the arrival of Mother Jones, April 17, a meeting of all the strikers was held at Helper. Following the meeting she and several Italians visited William Price, an organizer for the United Mine Workers who had been active since the first days of the strike in Utah. Because of her exposure—Price was in quarantine with smallpox—officials attempted to put Mother Jones in quarantine for the customary fifteen days. A shed had been constructed at Helper for those exposed to the disease, and Mother Jones was to spend the fifteen days there. Just before her consignment, however, the shed mysteriously caught fire and burned to the ground.54 Mother Jones refused to remain in voluntary quarantine, and on the morning of April 21 Deputy Sheriff Harry World moved to arrest her and two Italians, Sylvester Tedesco and Caesar Antonia, for violating quarantine regulations. World later testified that upon his arrival at the Half-Way House, headquarters for the Italian strikers located between Helper and Castle Gate, he was prevented from making the arrests by at least one hundred armed Italians who occupied positions at the house and at all the rocks and prominent points surrounding the camp. Deputy World and county officials then requested that Governor Wells send the National Guard back to Carbon County to prevent possible violence and to see that the arrests were made.

Governor Wells again asked Gen. John Q. Cannon to inspect conditions in Carbon County to see if the situation warranted recalling the Guard. Once more emotions ran high. Rumors circulated that Mother Jones planned to lead the strikers in a march to Castle Gate in an attempt to regain possession of the houses built or occupied by the strikers before their eviction by the coal company. Company guards at Castle Gate re-

53 Ibid.
54 Dr. J.J. Dalpiaz in an interview with Philip Notarianni at Helper, Utah, February 5, 1972, gave the following statement about his father, Salias Dalpiaz and another Italian, Angelo Pilatti, regarding the burning of the shed: "... later when Mother Jones, the old union organizer, came through the country down here they were all going to lock her up. They built a house right over here right toward the east side of Helper over here. On the big flat and they were going to lock her up in this house. My dad and a fellow by the name of Angelo Pilatti walked over the hill way back there. They came over that hill way back and came down. They both had a gallon of kerosene. They both came down and went over that place. The shingles were not dry. They were still kind of green and it was wet and they couldn't... They spread this thing all over and they set the thing on fire and then they went over the hill down in and they went around Helper and went back. But my dad says by the time we got to the hill it was burning pretty good, but he says by the time we got on top it was smoldering out. They ruined it so that it couldn't be used."
ported that they had been fired upon by Italian strikers and that some thirty shots had been exchanged. When the strikers persuaded Italian coal heavers working for the Rio Grande Railroad to leave their jobs, the strike seemed suddenly to be gaining momentum.

Despite the anxiety of the county officials, Governor Wells decided against sending the National Guard back into Carbon County after hearing Cannon's verbal report. The governor could not forget that the $25,000 he had been forced to borrow from a New York bank to finance the Guard's earlier activities in Carbon County had become a serious blemish on his administration's record. Furthermore, Wells had received enough criticism of the first mobilization of the Guard to become hesitant about a repeat performance.

Following the refusal of Governor Wells to send the National Guard, Sheriff Wilcox began organizing a posse to go to the Half-Way House to arrest those guilty of violating quarantine regulations. The sheriff recruited between twenty-five and forty-five men, and at two o'clock on the morning of Sunday, April 24, the posse left Castle Gate for the Half-Way House. Concealing themselves in the rocks above the camp, the posse waited for daylight. At dawn they charged down the hill and within a short time had taken 120 Italians into custody. In her autobiography Mother Jones gives the following account of the raid:

On Saturday night I got tipped off by the postoffice master that the militia was going to raid the little tent colony in the early morning. I called the miners to me and asked them if they had guns. Sure, they had guns. They were western men, men of the mountains. I told them to go bury them between the boulders; deputies were coming to take them away from them. I did not tell them that there was to be a raid for I did not want any bloodshed. Better to submit to arrest.

Between 4:30 and 5 o'clock in the morning I heard the tramp of feet on the road. I looked out of my smallpox window and saw about forty-five deputies. They descended upon the sleeping tent colony, dragged the miners out of their beds. They did not allow them to put on their clothing. The miners begged to be allowed to put on their clothes, for at that early hour the mountain range is the coldest. Shaking with cold, followed by the shrieks and wails of their wives, and children, beaten along the road by guns, they were driven like cattle to Helper. In the evening they were packed in a box car and run down to Price, the county seat and put in jail.

Not one law had these miners broken. The pitiful screams of the women and children would have penetrated Heaven. Their tears melted the heart of the Mother of Sorrows. Their crime was that they had struck against the power of gold.55

The *Deseret Evening News*, in much more restrained words, also found sympathy for the Italians:

... When light enough the sheriff gave the order to charge the camp, compel every man to come out of his tent and put him under arrest. The orders were carried out. Many were hustled out of bed in their night clothes but were allowed to return and dress. The women also were forced out while the tents were searched for firearms. Some guns and ammunition were found. ...

When the officers were taking the strikers away the women were very abusive in their language and some threats were made. The men were very peaceable and made no resistance. As the strikers were being marched to the train, their wives and children who had followed them down to Helper, were weeping as they said good-bye. The scene will not be forgotten soon by those who witnessed it.56

Since the county jail at Price was far too small to house 120 prisoners, the Italians were sent to a bullpen owned by E.M. Olson where they were housed in a shed that had been used to store carriages. The entire area was surrounded by a high fence, and guards were hired to patrol.57 Local residents and hotels were asked to help by cooking meat for the prisoners. The Mormon bishop, Ernest S. Horsley, gathered food for the Italians, and water was obtained from private cisterns and hauled from the Price River. Sheriff Wilcox claimed that the Italians were better off in the bullpen than they had been at home, but others argued that the prisoners were suffering from lack of adequate shelter.58 Although the situation seemed quiet, there were some portents of violence. One prisoner was transferred to the jail after he threatened to burn down the shed inside the bullpen. Rumors were circulated that an attempt would be made to set all of the prisoners free. Attorney M.F. Braffett of the coal company called the prisoners "desperate marauders." The *Salt Lake Herald* accused the Italian women of abusing the officers and guards in broken English which "put to shame a drunken pirate."59

On the morning of April 27, the 120 Italian prisoners were loaded in three boxcars of a special train and taken to the schoolhouse at Helper to appear before Justice M.A. Ward. The charge covered a multitude of alleged lawless acts, including resisting an officer, rioting, intimidating men and driving them from work, and disturbing the peace. Attorneys for the Italians pleaded not guilty in each case. The next morning the court began trying each of the strikers individually. The outlook in

56 *Deseret Evening News*, April 25, 1904, p. 10.
57 Powell interview.
58 *Salt Lake Herald*, April 27, 1904, p. 1; *Deseret Evening News*, April 26, 1904, p. 5.
A Long Range View of a Carbon County Courtroom.

According to this Salt Lake Herald cartoon, 1903, the Utah Fuel Company had legal proceedings in Carbon County under control.

Helper was for a judicial marathon. The Salt Lake Herald's tongue-in-cheek assessment was that the trials would take at least two months, not counting Sundays.

By May 13 eleven Italians had been found guilty of the charges, and an equal number had been discharged. At this time the eighty-nine Italians remaining at the Price bullpen were also discharged. Several factors led to the dismissals: the wish to avoid lengthy court proceedings, insufficient evidence, the high cost to the county of feeding the prisoners, and a good deal of public sentiment against the arrest and imprisonment of seemingly peaceful and innocent Italians.60

"However, this was not the end of the episode. A few days after his release, Joseph Barboglio, treasurer of the United Mine Workers and later founder of the Helper State Bank and the Carbon Emery Bank, brought a $5,000 suit against Wilcox. The charge was false imprisonment. Apparently the suit was either dismissed or dropped because no further mention was made of the case in newspapers or court records.
From the time the governor was asked to send the National Guard back to Carbon County until the end of the court proceedings against the Italians, a very vocal segment of the public had protested the actions against the strikers. The unofficial leader of this group was the ambitious and imaginative Sam Gilson. Prior to his arrival in Price, Gilson had led an exciting life. At the age of fifteen he had left Illinois and traveled to Nevada where he entered the livestock industry and supplied horses to the Pony Express. As U.S. marshal he supervised the execution of John D. Lee at Mountain Meadows. Later he discovered and promoted many mining properties and invented several successful machines, including a hydraulic ore concentrator or separator. The mineral gilsonite took its name from him.61

In reply to Deputy World's request for National Guard troops to help serve warrants for the arrest of strikers violating quarantine regulations, Gilson, in a letter to the *Salt Lake Herald*, described the situation as he saw it:

> The facts are that neither the sheriff nor his deputies have ever tried to serve papers upon anyone as an officer gifted with any sense of judgment would have done. It is a notorious fact that all they have done has been in the interest of the Utah Fuel Company and not for the peace and quiet of the county.62

In another letter to the *Herald*, Gilson denounced the treatment of the Italians who had been arrested:

> What the charges against these men are I could not find out from the guards or deputies. The citizens, seeing that they were given but little to eat and that of the worst kind of food, started a subscrip-

---


*Samuel H. Gilson, Salt Lake Herald drawing, 1903.*
tion and raised $100. When they went to take provisions to the starving men they were told by Harry World, chief deputy sheriff, they would not be allowed to give them a thing. They are herding them inside the court house and will not allow anyone to speak to them. They don’t give them a trial to which they are entitled, but say they will try them when they get ready. They have preferred no charges, and no one seems to know what the men were arrested for. On the day following the arrest of the 120 strikers Gilson himself had been arrested on a charge of abusive language when he allegedly swore at Sheriff Wilcox and Deputy World. He was released on a twenty-five-dollar bond. In the next few weeks several indignation meetings were called by Gilson to protest the actions of the coal company and county officials.

While the strike dragged on, union support was gradually eroding. During the first week of the Italian imprisonment at Price, the executive board of the United Mine Workers adopted a motion instructing union officials to close up affairs in District 13, which included Colorado and Utah. On May 26 Harry Bousfield addressed a letter to H.G. Williams asking that they meet to discuss the strike. Clearly, Bousfield was attempting to carry out the executive council motion and obtain permission for the miners still on strike to return to work. The company, realizing that the union was anxious to call off the strike, became determined to make it as humiliating as possible.

By late July the union had ceased direct financial support of the strikers, leaving them with only two dollars a week assistance, the money coming from voluntary contributions from the miners of Butte, Montana, and elsewhere. This meagre income was not sufficient to support the strikers, and several of them turned to rustling local cattle for food.

During the last week of November $7,000 was sent to the First National Bank of Price by the United Mine Workers. The money was to be used for railroad fares and other necessities in aiding the remaining

63 Ibid., April 27, 1904, p. 1.

64 In a letter to Harry Bousfield, President John Mitchell admitted union defeat: “Close inquiry upon the part of our representatives satisfied us that the mines are being operated with reasonable success and there is no possibility of winning the strike. For this reason we have decided to bring the strike to a close at the earliest possible date. . . . The strike in district 15 has been more expensive to the national organization than any other strike in history. . . . It is our sincere hope that all those who have participated in the struggle may be able to secure speedy employment, that they may retain their interest in the organization and prepare themselves for a more successful movement at the first opportunity. It is not our intention to abandon the work of organization in Colorado and Utah.” Quoted in U.S., Congress, Senate, Commissioner of Labor, A Report of Labor Disturbances in the State of Colorado, from 1880 to 1904, Inclusive, with Correspondence Relating Thereto. Doc. No. 122, 58th Cong., 3d sess., 1904–5 (Washington, D.C., 1905), 331.

65 Eastern Utah Advocate, August 11, 1904, p. 1.
two hundred and fifty strikers to leave Carbon County. James D. Ritchey and R.M. Smith, officers of the union, visited the strikers and encouraged them to accept the offer and seek employment elsewhere. Some of the strikers did accept and were sent to the mines of Colorado. However, many of the men voted to decline the offer and were left to their own resources, the union refusing to provide further aid.

The remaining strikers, most of whom were Italians, never did return to the mines. Many became farmers along the Price River, raising produce for the miners who had replaced them. Others went into business in Helper. Although the Rio Grande Railroad was the parent company of Utah Fuel, a number of Italians were able to find work on the railroad gangs.

The union members had suffered defeat, but they were not alone. Ironically, the working miners were presented with a reduction of wages in January 1905. In this and other ways the coal company continued to abuse the miners, and the Carbon County coal fields simmered with labor unrest, culminating in another strike in 1922. This one was led by the Greeks, the unknowing “scabs” who had begun to replace the Italian miners in 1904.

From today’s perspective, the demands made by the union in 1903 were clearly justified. The Utah Fuel Company showed a willingness to negotiate on all demands except union recognition. To the miners, however, this was the most important item. As a result the struggle became a fight for union recognition with the question of working conditions deemphasized. This gave an advantage to the coal company, because many Americans regarded the union as a foreign import that, with its radical tendency toward socialism, had no place in democratic America. Given the prevailing fear of communism, the strike failed even though the public had no particular sympathy for the coal company.

Company forces made the most of the public’s nativistic sentiments, charging that the strike was led and supported by foreigners who could not and would not allow themselves to be assimilated into American society. Thus one’s patriotism was challenged if he supported the union. The dispute was seen by many as a struggle between a ruthless company, which was at least American, and a foreign-dominated labor union.

In the beginning the company was able to convince the public that a state of lawlessness existed in the coal fields and that the strikers were to blame. Later it was apparent that the company guards were as guilty, if not more so, of violence and intimidation than the strikers.
A remarkable characteristic in light of the confrontation between strikers and guards was the relatively little violence during the strike. This was due in large measure to the belief of union officials that the blame for any violence would be charged to them. Therefore they continually urged the strikers to conduct themselves peacefully. The presence of the National Guard in the coal fields served as another deterrent. Although the top officers of the Guard were procompany, the men maintained a fairly neutral position throughout the strike. In time many guardsmen became good friends with the strikers, and although they did not sympathize with the union, some did react strongly against the company.

Governor Wells tried to appear neutral, but he exerted a good deal more pressure on the union than on the coal company. He backed off from his attempt to settle the strike when the Utah Fuel Company refused to arbitrate. He also failed to act against the use of the courts by the company to restrict the activities of the union officials. Company guards who were causing serious problems received better treatment than union members whose offenses were minor. No company employees or supporters were arrested for their activities. The rights to free assembly and free speech were also denied union officials. Much of the situation was out of the governor’s control and in the hands of local officials who were naturally cautious about attacking the company that was largely responsible for the economy of the area and that paid seventy-eight percent of the local taxes. During a period of prosperity it was not as easy to find fault with the company as it would be during a time like the depressed thirties.

For its part, the union was strengthened by the nationwide efforts at unionization of the coal fields and by the ability of the organizers: Charles DeMolli, Con Kelliner, and William Price. At the same time, Utah coal miners were hurt by the violence of the Colorado strike. While the union was successful in signing about two-thirds of the miners, it failed to maintain the loyalty of many of those who joined, and they soon left the area. The continuing support of the foreign strikers proved a liability in obtaining public sympathy for the union.

In the end, the strike failed because the union simply did not have enough support, either internally or externally, to win against a powerful and influential company that effectively played on radical, antiforeign sentiments in defending its position.
South Slav Settlements in Utah, 1890-1935

BY JOSEPH STIPANOVIĆ

Midvale smelter, ca. 1906, employed many South Slavs. Note pioneer cemetery in foreground. Utah State Historical Society collections, courtesy of Utah Power & Light.

In the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century, Utah experienced a large influx of labor immigration. These labor immigrants were primarily Italians, Greeks, and Slavs from southern and eastern Europe. Collectively they were alien in culture, language, and religion to the natives in Utah, and as individual ethnic groups they were alien to each other.

Mr. Stipanovich is a doctoral candidate in history at the University of Minnesota.
The Slavic labor immigrants were mostly Serbs, Croats, and Slovenes. They came from Austria-Hungary to seek work in America, in most cases so that they might save their wages and return home to buy additional land. The Croats and Slovenes were Roman Catholic in religion, and Serbs were adherents to their national form of eastern Christian Orthodoxy, the Serbian Orthodox church. While the Slovenes spoke their own language, the Serbs and Croats shared one tongue which is known as Serbo-Croatian. The Serbs, Croats, and Slovenes are often referred to as the South Slavs, or Yugoslavs, to distinguish themselves and their Bulgarian and Macedonian neighbors from the other Slavic nationalities of eastern Europe.

This article is an attempt to reconstruct the process of settlement of South Slav labor immigrants in Utah. These people settled in many places in the state, but only three locations—Midvale, Highland Boy, and Helper—will be examined here. Collectively these places reflect the major settlement experiences of the South Slav labor immigrants in Utah.

**Midvale**

Serbs, Croats, and Slovenes, in fairly sizeable groups, began working in the smelters of the Midvale-Murray area as early as 1890. Not until the first decade of the twentieth century, however, did the South Slavs begin staying for extended periods of time and in greater numbers. This was partially because of the worsening agricultural conditions in the old country and the unsettled labor conditions in the larger Yugoslav settlements in the eastern United States, such as the coal fields of Pennsylvania. One immigrant recalled the frustrations and restlessness which he felt as a youth in his village in the old country:

My father couldn't read or write. He's dumb. That's the reason I get away from Yugoslavia, from Austro-Hungary . . . I wanted to get some education. Can't go to college over there, father broke, poor. All that I learned, I learned from my own head.¹

The growth of the South Slav settlement in Midvale was also related to the dramatic increase in the smelting of copper ores which began to be mined by the Utah Copper Company and others in Bingham Canyon. Prior to 1900, copper was known to be present in the canyon but was generally ignored because of the higher profits to be found in gold, silver,

¹ Interview with John Dunoskovich, September 16, 1972.
and lead mining operations. Furthermore, before 1900 there was no suitable smelting process for lowgrade copper ore.  

In 1904 the United States Smelting, Refining, and Mining Company had a smelter in Midvale, or Bingham Junction as it was called then. The American Smelting and Refining Company (ASARCO) and the Bingham Consolidated Mining and Smelting Company also had smelters there. ASARCO had an additional smelter in the Murray area and jointly operated a smelter in Magna with the Utah Copper Company after 1906. South Slavs sought employment in all these smelting operations, but apparently most of them were employed by ASARCO and lived in the Midvale area.  

After 1903 a growing number of the South Slavs in the Midvale area were young single men who did not own land in the old country. Many of them had uncles or fathers who had previously come to Midvale. Some had been working in smelters in Illinois, Montana, and Colorado, but they were attracted to the Salt Lake Valley by reports from fellow immigrants and through advertising developed by smelting companies and by agencies of the state government. These younger men lived in boardinghouses or with married South Slavic couples.  

The boardinghouses were of several different types, but the most common variety in Midvale at that time was run by a South Slav and his wife who provided a place to sleep, laundry service, and meals, including a lunch to take to work, in return for a monthly fee. The boarders sometimes gave bulk amounts of food to the woman in charge who then used it to develop a potluck cuisine. While this caused some problems, it was often preferred by the woman who could not speak English and who dreaded the thought of shopping among the English-speaking people of the surrounding community.  

These boardinghouses were usually homes of two or three rooms that had additional quarters built on and that provided only the minimum amount of space for sleeping and eating. Usually the smelter crews

---

4 See for example R. L. Polk and Co., *Salt Lake City Directory*, 1904 (Salt Lake City, 1904), and subsequent volumes.  
6 John Dunoskovich interview; John Cvar interview; interviews with Joseph Mazuran, December 18, 1972, and Joe Hinich, June 22, 1972. Advertisements for such establishments are found in *Salt Lake City Directory* during the years 1904 to 1914.
worked, slept, and ate in shifts. The burden of feeding, laundering, and cleaning for these men—sometimes numbering as high as forty—fell upon the shoulders of the woman who was often burdened with small children of her own. One woman described her experience in the following way:

“It was horrible awful. You know for awhile I had to carry all the water from a long way in . . . and no dry room. Wash and cook on coal stove and eat in two or three shifts. That was hell . . . woman was slave. That was time I went to see movie and I say if I stay and write my story that would be better than any show or story that they have.”

The boardinghouse provided a necessary service but was looked upon by boarders, landlords, and landladies alike as a temporary device only.

The more fortunate South Slavs owned or rented their own small homes, and many did not provide for large numbers of boarders. However, they did receive into their homes relatives or friends recently arrived from the old country. This arrangement was vastly different from the boardinghouse in that the personal tie between the boarder and his host was emphasized. The economic element was considered by both parties, but the arrangement was not a matter of livelihood for the host, and the boarder was more than willing to avoid the boardinghouse situation. Between blood relations, especially father with son and brother with brother, the monetary aspect of the relationship was often completely ignored.

Midvale was still in its initial stages of municipal development during this era. Consequently, land and buildings were distributed on a first come, first served basis, resulting in the dispersion of South Slav boardinghouses and private homes throughout the area. The distances between various buildings and homes were not overwhelmingly great, but given the modes of transportation available at the time, this dispersion nevertheless had an effect upon the development of the social facilities.

In the creation of intermediary institutions for social interaction the South Slavs drew upon their previous experiences in the old country and in older South Slav settlements in the United States. The first such device they developed was the saloon, based upon an old-country model but modified to the realities of the semiurban industrial environment of Midvale. Almost every South Slav peasant village in Austria-Hungary, especially in the regions of Croatia-Slavonia, had saloons that also served

---

7 Interview with Zorka Bogden, September 12, 1972.
8 John Dunoskovich interview; Joseph Mazuran interview; interviews with George Pezeli, July 9, 1972, Tonka Bolic, August 8, 1972, and Joseph Church, October 19, 1972.
as inns. Called biltiya, in parts of Croatia, they served as saloon, dance hall, casino, political meetinghouse, dinner club, and information center for the peasants in the surrounding farms. Since these same services were in demand in the smelter town, individual South Slav entrepreneurs began operating their own saloons.

There were two major changes in the biltiya as it developed in Midvale. First, it readjusted its operation to the demands of its customers who were now industrial workers instead of seasonally oriented peasant farmers. For the South Slavs in the old country the seasons were a measurement of time around which their existence was centered. Their church calendars corresponded to the cycle of agricultural production. In their new situation, however, they were forced to begin thinking in terms of hours and days. As a result, the Midvale biltiya operated from early morning until late at night, a great change from the emphasis upon evening service in the old country.

The other major modification in the Midvale biltiya was its new service as a protective device, shielding the immigrants from the unfamiliar world that surrounded them. In the saloon the worker could turn his thoughts to things other than his monotonous and tiring work. Over brandy, wine, and beer he could find a bit of the old country among people who spoke and acted in ways similar to his own. Major decisions were more comfortably made here, where problems common to marriage, citizenship, travel, money, and family were freely discussed. If the immigrant could not read or write he could surely find someone at the saloon who would be happy to read his mail to him or write a letter for him. In these informal discussions immigrants learned of new employment possibilities in the nearby mining camps of Bingham, Alta, and Park City. By listening to the trial and error experiences of his fellow immigrants, he learned how to avoid many difficulties. He could also entertain himself through storytelling, playing musical instruments, dancing, and singing.

In this period national South Slavic groups were organized and drew the South Slavs in Utah into their orbit. In 1908 a lodge affiliated with the Croatian Fraternal Union was organized by the Croats in Midvale. An independent group called the Serbian Benevolent Society was organ-

---

11 John Dunoskovich interview; interview with Mike Dragos, June 28, 1972.
ized by the Serbs in the same area. The Serbian society later affiliated with the Serb National Federation of Pittsburgh.

The primary service of these national groups was to provide life insurance at low cost to immigrants so that in times of distress survivors could count on a little cash to assist them temporarily. At the local level, in the individual lodges, the societies served as meeting groups similar to the saloon. Sometimes lodge meetings were even held in the saloon. The difference between the function of the saloon and the lodge meeting lay in the formality and respectability attached to the national organizations that stood behind the lodge.

In those early days the individuals who took on the responsibility of handling the secretarial chores of the lodges were transformed into de facto leaders of their community. The first secretary of the Midvale Croatian Lodge was a Croat immigrant named John Dunoskovich. He was only twenty-one years of age when he assumed these duties in 1908, but he managed to impress his neighbors with his abilities and became one of the early spokesmen for the Croats in Midvale. The leadership

13 John Dunoskovich interview; interview with Milka Smilanich, December 14, 1972.
14 John Dunoskovich and John Cvar interviews. At the time of this research Mr. Dunoskovich was still living in Midvale, tending a large garden and assisting in the management of lodge affairs.
of the Serbian organization in Midvale was somewhat more collective in nature than the Croat group. George Lemaich (or Lemich) was one of the prominent figures active in the Serb community. He and the other lodge leaders coordinated activities among South Slav communities throughout the state and represented the interests of their fellow lodge members at conventions of the national societies.

The Serbian leadership in Midvale between 1908 and 1916 decided that the Serbs in the area would benefit from the presence of a Serbian Orthodox church. (The Croats, being Roman Catholic, utilized Catholic churches already in the area). The Serbs took subscriptions from members of the community and finished building their church in the summer of 1918. Sometime during that year a Serbian Orthodox priest arrived in Midvale to minister to the religious needs of the Serb community there.

The priest's name was Yakov J. Odzich. Born in Austria-Hungary in 1856, he arrived in Midvale at age sixty-two. Within a year and a half after his arrival Father Odzich found himself at odds with his congregation over his salary and maintenance. In 1920 he sued the Serbian Benevolent Society for back wages and rent he claimed were owed to him. The suit named the Serbian Benevolent Society and its leading members individually. The list included George Lemaich, Danye Gerbich, Danye Merech, Danye Marachich, George Bozickovich, Milan Pritza, Stanko Gerich, and Nikola Masich. Odzich's suit was initially defeated, but he won a favorable judgment in a second effort at litigation.

The priest's victories in the courts were pyrrhic. At the conclusion of the litigation the Serbs of Midvale were thoroughly disenchanted with the attitudes and the actions of their cleric from the old country. Within a year they severed relations with the priest, who was forced to become a dependent and resident of the Salt Lake County Infirmary. The Serbs made no attempt to get a replacement for Odzich, who died in the County Infirmary in 1935. The church building was maintained and its basement was used for continued meetings of the Benevolent Society. In 1938 an improvement tax was levied against the property because it was held by a nonreligious organization. Faced with financial difficulties and

---

15 Mike Dragos, Milka Smilanich, and Joseph Mazuran interviews.
16 State of Utah, Third District Court, Salt Lake County, Case No. 28179, 1920.
17 State of Utah, Third District Court, Salt Lake County, Case No. 29417, 1920.
18 Salt Lake City Directory, 1921. In this edition and subsequent editions until his death in 1935, Odzich is listed as an inmate of the Salt Lake County Infirmary. Also see Mike Dragos, Joe Mikich, Joe Hinich, and John Dunoskovich interviews.
the general lack of funds attending the Depression, the society was forced to surrender the property to the City of Midvale. The city then sold the building to recover a portion of the tax, and the land was incorporated into the city cemetery.

Despite the religious difficulties they encountered, the Serbs of Midvale maintained ties with each other and with their Croat and Slovene neighbors. The celebration of holidays, especially Easter and Christmas, was anticipated with great excitement by the South Slav community. Easter was their favorite holiday, with a great feast of barbecued lamb central to its celebration. Through the darkest days of the Depression the lamb was still consumed at Easter and the roasted pig at Christmas. In the driest days of Prohibition the red wines and plum brandies, or slivovice, still flowed freely. The South Slavs, as was their custom, made the holidays into day-long festivals with eating, drinking, singing, and dancing following their religious observances. At Christmas, the Croats and Slovenes invited the Serbs to celebrate with them on December 25. On January 7 the Serbs celebrated the Orthodox Christmas according to their religious calendar and invited the Croats and Slovenes to join in their celebrations. This reciprocal activity was a great source of pride to the South Slavs who felt they got the best of two worlds through their dual celebrations.

The South Slav settlement at Midvale was a remarkable one in several ways. First, it was developed in a relatively ordered fashion with much less social dislocation and cultural disorientation than immigrants generally experienced in their American environments. Second, the South Slavs were able to establish organizations that eased their process of transition to American life without any major difficulties with their neighbors. Third, Midvale served as a place of arrival and dispersal for many of the South Slavs who came to northern Utah, because it was one of the oldest, largest, and the most centrally located of all the South Slav settlements.

**Highland Boy**

In 1898 Highland Boy was a small camp nestled at the west end of Bingham Canyon. Residences were located around the Highland Boy

21 Conversation with George Bagley, December 5, 1972; Joseph Mazuran interview. Both men were city officials in Midvale, Utah, at the time of this research.

22 Mike Dragos, Joseph Mazuran, Joe Hinich, Peter Klasna, and Joe Mikich interviews; interview with Grey Melich, January 20, 1973.

23 John Dunoskovich, George Pezell, Joseph Mazuran, Mike Dragos, Joe Hinich, and Grey Melich interviews.
South Slav Settlements

Gold Mine and housed a population of approximately one hundred fifty people.\textsuperscript{24} When Utah Copper and other companies began mining copper ores in the canyon in the early 1900s the population of Highland Boy began to grow. By 1902 it jumped to approximately four hundred and by 1910 to almost one thousand people.\textsuperscript{25} More than half of Highland Boy’s population in 1908 was comprised of Serbs and Croats.\textsuperscript{26}

The South Slavs in Highland Boy came from the copper mines in Montana, the smelters in Midvale, settlements in eastern and midwestern cities, and directly from the old country. At this same time in the South Slav lands in Austria-Hungary, violence erupted in many areas because of Croatian resentment of the preferential treatment given the Serbs by the Austrian and Magyar overlords.\textsuperscript{27} The ill feeling generated in the old country was carried to Highland Boy by Serb and Croat immigrants who arrived in large numbers between 1903 and 1914.

For several years the Serbs and Croats of Highland Boy waged a guerrilla war of sorts. The fighting often gave birth to blood feuds and some loss of life and property among both groups.\textsuperscript{28} The ill will was slow to dissipate, and this early period of ethnic violence affected the relations between the Serbs and Croats in Highland Boy until after World War I. Local authorities were unable to comprehend the violence, much less control it. The mining companies showed little concern as long as the miners restricted the bulk of their activities to areas outside the mines. Many immigrants who experienced this turbulent period attributed the beginning of the end of strife to a fire that reportedly leveled the majority of Slavic dwellings in 1908.\textsuperscript{29}

As in Midvale, Serbs and Croats at Highland Boy established lodges that became associated with national mutual insurance organizations. Also, the ever-present boardinghouse was established, and by 1904 there were four in Highland Boy; but with sixty-three private dwellings in the camp a large number of both Serbs and Croats were spared the boardinghouse existence. To serve their other physical and social needs there were three saloons, three general purpose stores, a Chinese laundry and bathhouse, and a millinery.\textsuperscript{30}

\textsuperscript{24} Sanborn Map Co., *Map of Bingham Canyon* (New York, 1898), plate 5.
\textsuperscript{25} Ibid., 1902 and 1907 editions, plates 1–13.
\textsuperscript{26} Record books of Croatian and Serbian lodges in Bingham, Utah.
\textsuperscript{28} George Pezell, Joe Hinich, Tonka Bolic, John Dunoskovich, John Cvar, Milka Smilanich, and Mike Dragos interviews; interview with Walter Bolic, August 8, 1972.
\textsuperscript{29} George Pezell, Tonka Bolic, Mike Dragos, and Joe Mikich interviews.
\textsuperscript{30} *Map of Bingham Canyon*, 1907, plates 1–8.
South Slavs in the Bingham area congregated at Highland Boy on the slopes of upper Bingham Canyon. Utah State Historical Society collections, courtesy of Wilbur Smith.

One of the stores was the Serb Mercantile Company, owned and operated by a Serb named Joe Melich. He became the leading individual in the Serbian community at Highland Boy and was known throughout Bingham Canyon. Melich was born in Gospic in Croatia. He emigrated at a young age and came to Utah soon after his arrival in America where he was joined by several of his brothers. Born Bogdanovich, Melich changed his name sometime after his arrival in America. He established a store and a saloon in Highland Boy, and the two operations became the focal point of the Serb community. Newspapers printed in the Cyrillic alphabet and originating in the larger Serbian communities in other parts of America were distributed by Melich in his saloon and store, and he was generally thought of as a knowledgeable man concerning politics and business.

Melich appears in retrospect to have been extremely literate for a South Slav immigrant of the period. He also exhibited a very forceful personality, one that inspired personal devotion to him from the other Serbian men in the mining community. When World War I erupted he

\[31\] Grey Melich and Mike Dragos interviews.
became an ardent supporter of the idea of the creation of a Greater Serbia which would include the South Slav lands, then a part of Austria-Hungary. From its creation in America, the South Slav press had championed certain political ideologies related to the realities of the political situation in the old country. The Serbs in Highland Boy merely adopted a policy that was closest to their outlook once the war had begun. The nationalistic impulses of the Serbs in America had received an original boost during the two wars that racked the Balkans in 1912 and 1913. By 1914, communities like the one in Highland Boy were at a fever pitch.

Melich mobilized the pro-Serbian sentiment in Bingham Canyon, and when the Serbian government issued a call for volunteers from Serbian communities in America, Bingham responded with great enthusiasm. Throughout 1917 groups of Serbs continued to volunteer for service in the Serbian army at Corfu and Salonika, and by early 1918 the number of volunteers reached the one hundred mark. Those immigrants who were not citizens of the United States were required to register with local administrative bodies but were not required to serve in the U.S. Army. The local conscription authorities sought to detect immigrants who did not register for the draft and attempted to pressure them into such action by staging periodic raids in Bingham Canyon. One such raid in May 1918 resulted in the temporary detention of about three hundred men, many of whom were South Slavs.

The Serbs in Highland Boy blamed the Croats in the area for the embarrassment to which both groups were subjected. The Croats and Slovenes felt great reluctance to join Allied armies because they had relatives and friends serving in the armies of the Central Powers, especially Austria-Hungary. In 1916 several Croatian national organizations voted in favor of giving money to the Austrian Red Cross to assist that organization’s war relief efforts in their homeland. This action was supported by Croatian communities throughout America, and their repre-

---

32 Conversations with John Dunoskovich, Mike Dragos, Grey Melich.
35 Bogdan Krizman, “Serbian War Mission to the USA,” Jugoslovenski Istorijski Casopis, 1, no. 2 (1968), 43–73.
39 Prpic, Croatian Immigrants in America, 241–47.
sentatives were verbally abused by Serbs and other groups in America who did not appreciate the humanitarian aspects of the gesture.

In Highland Boy, Joe Melich attempted to ease such difficulties, but he continued his recruitment activities for the Serbian army. He also kept in touch with the Yugoslav Committees in London and Washington, D.C. Both of these groups sent representatives to Bingham Canyon to urge the Serbs and Croats to enlist in the Serbian army. When World War I ended, the Serbian community, under the leadership of Melich, had sent more than two hundred volunteers to the Serbian army and about fifteen volunteers to the U.S. Army.⁴⁰

Despite many problems that developed during the war, the Serbs and Croats were able to move toward more cordial relations in the post-war period, partially because many young Serbs left Highland Boy. Once the war ended, the government of the Kingdom of Serbs, Croats, and Slovenes offered free homesteads to the overseas volunteers in the Serbian army. Many volunteers, including some from Highland Boy, took the land and remained in the old country.⁴¹ The economic troubles that plagued the entire nation after World War I also helped end the strife between Serbs and Croats, because the miners were required to turn their attention more and more to the difficult task of making a living. In addition to these considerations, Bingham Canyon was exposed to the ravages of the influenza epidemic in the fall of 1918 and the winter of 1919.⁴²

Joe Melich emerged from the war period as a figure of prominence among the Serbian immigrants in America generally. As a result, he was elected president of the Serb National Federation in 1920.⁴³ His election was remarkable because he was from a small Serb community in the West and because his opponent was the internationally known scientist, Mikhail Pupin. The particulars of this election remain obscure, but it brought to the Utah settlements of the South Slavs recognition from other South Slav communities throughout the country. Melich served also as sheriff of the incorporated town of Phoenix, and deputy county sheriff. His life ended prematurely in 1922, however—an apparent victim of pneumonia.⁴⁴

By 1929 Highland Boy had grown into a stable community of some two thousand people. Following the war both Serbs and Croats built their

---

⁴¹ Jozo Tomasevich, Peasants, Politics, and Economic Change in Yugoslavia (Stanford, Calif., 1955), 228–35.
⁴² Bingham Press Bulletin, various issues from October 1918 through January 1919.
⁴³ Grey Melich and Mike Dragos interviews.
⁴⁴ Grey Melich interview.
own separate lodge halls, but they were in proximity to each other. In those same years there appeared four more boardinghouses, ten new lodging houses, three tenement structures, two movie houses, a cobbler’s shop, two schools, four new saloons, three barbershops, and six restaurants. Surprisingly, there were only two stores (both owned by South Slavs, one Serb and one Croat) in Highland Boy in 1929, while there had been three in 1907. Shoppers in Highland Boy were more mobile and were utilizing stores in other parts of the canyon and in the Salt Lake Valley, especially Midvale and West Jordan, through a variety of methods, such as the delivery truck.

Highland Boy was one of the few places in Utah where the South Slavs outnumbered other groups and one of the rare communities where the strife and turmoil of the old country was transplanted intact to a place of settlement. Because of these two factors the South Slavs in Highland Boy produced leaders who exerted greater influence than was general elsewhere. Social and cultural decisions were more highly centralized in Highland Boy for a long period of time, making the development of the group there significantly different from the experience of other groups in other settlements.

45 Map of Bingham Canyon, 1929, plates 10–11.
46 Walter Bolic interview.
The town of Helper was founded in 1892 as a railroad camp where additional engine power could be provided for trains trying to cross the Soldier Summit Divide going west.\(^{47}\) The discovery of coal in areas contiguous to Helper soon made the town the center of Utah's most productive coal mining region. The mine at Castle Gate was opened in 1883, Clear Creek in 1898, Hiawatha in the early 1900s, Sunnyside in 1904, Kenilworth in 1908, Spring Canyon in 1912, Standardville in 1913, and Rains in 1916. All required the services of a large, centrally located community.\(^{48}\) Helper, along with Price a few miles to the south and east, filled this central service role to the Carbon County coal fields.

South Slavs went into Carbon County as railroad workers in the 1890s, but in the following years more and more of them became coal miners. This early period was turbulent. The Serbs, Croats, and Slovenes who came into the area soon gained a reputation for being hard working but also hot tempered and eager to confront any adversary.\(^{49}\) As early as 1903 the South Slav miners became associated with rudimentary union movements in the Carbon County mines.\(^{50}\) Greek miners were brought into the area to serve as strikebreakers against a strike that the South Slavs mounted with Italian miners in that same year.\(^{51}\) The demand for labor in the coal mines continued to grow, however, and the number of South Slavs around Helper increased as time went on.

By 1914 more than five hundred Slav miners lived in the coal camps of Clear Creek, Winter Quarters, Sunnyside, and Castle Gate alone.\(^{52}\) Slavs also lived in different camps, and a large number of them were engaged in various businesses throughout the county. While most of the South Slavs were either miners or small businessmen, a small group came to the coal fields as gamblers and purveyors of other vices. Generally, the South Slavs tolerated such renegades in their saloons as long as they desired their services and as long they were of the South Slav nationality.\(^{53}\)

\(^{47}\) Utah Historical Records Survey Project (WPA), *Inventory of the County Archives of Utah, No. 4, Carbon County* (Ogden, 1940), 10.
\(^{48}\) Allen, *Company Town in the American West*, 169–75.
\(^{49}\) Eastern Utah Advocate, October 9, 1902, p. 1. and August 16, 1900, p. 2.
\(^{50}\) State of Utah, *Report of the Coal Mine Inspector for 1903 and 1904* (Salt Lake City, 1905), 66.
\(^{52}\) State of Utah, *Facts and Figures Pertaining to Utah (Second Report of the State Bureau of Immigration, Labor and Statistics)* (Salt Lake City, 1915), 95.
\(^{53}\) Interview with Marko Yelinich, February 15, 1973; Joe Hinich and Martin Kramerich interviews.
The activities of the South Slavs around Helper were very much intertwined with the coal mining industry. The South Slavs were highly sympathetic to the concept of unionization as a legitimate remedy for the problems associated with working in the mines. Their major concerns centered around wage rates, safety conditions, and the problem of weighing the coal to determine actual daily wages. These questions and others figured in three major strikes—in 1903, 1922, and 1933. In each of these strikes the miners sought management recognition of their unions, and the South Slav miners supported each effort. The willingness of the South Slavs to join unions and go on strike was looked upon by the non-coal-mining segments of the LDS community in Carbon County as un-American activity. From the first attempts at labor organization, the Slavs found their Mormon neighbors hostile and antipathetic. In addition, the Slavs failed to comprehend Mormon racial attitudes.

The Slavs, generally, had difficulty explaining their own ethnic background, and they came to be recognized as “Austrians” or “Bohunks” to the rest of the community, rather than Serbs, Croats, or Slovenes. The Slavs had little choice but to endure such epithets. (The name “Austrian” was not really off the mark, for they had been citizens of Austria-Hungary.) One Serb coal miner explained how he felt after years of labor trouble and racial bitterness:

---

M. Dragos interview.
Yeah, they called me everything but white man . . . sure I leave Carbon County. You could die down there and nobody care.\textsuperscript{55}

The tense relations between the immigrants and the rest of the community contributed to the development of Helper as one of the few predominantly non-Mormon towns of any size in Utah. As a result, business opportunities were equal to, if not greater than, those available anywhere else in the state for Slavs, Greeks, Italians, and other immigrants. The Italians, Slovenes, and Croats often entered into joint business ventures. One of these efforts led to the creation of the Mutual Mercantile Company of Helper, begun in 1924 by J.P. Rolando, an Italian; John Skerl, a Slovene; and A. Dolinsky, nationality undetermined. It remains a very successful enterprise to the present.\textsuperscript{56} Many South Slavs, especially Slovenes, came to Carbon County after World War I. Carbon County was the only South Slav area of settlement that experienced a large influx of immigrants in the postwar period. Some of these immigrants came to join relatives already in Utah, because their native villages were incorporated into Italy after the war.\textsuperscript{57} Also, Croats and Slovenes immigrated to Helper from the coal mines of southeastern Colorado in search of better working and living conditions.

The Croats and Slovenes founded their local branches of national lodges, the Croats creating two and the Slovenians three in Carbon County.\textsuperscript{58} Because the majority of the Slovenes and Croats were Roman Catholics they had the services of their religion close at hand. A priest from Price would travel periodically to Helper to say Mass and minister the other sacraments to the immigrants.

In addition to their lodges, the South Slavs also relied upon organizations like unions, joint business ventures, and collective participation in the political processes to maintain and improve their existence. Such traditional institutions as insurance lodges and church congregations proved to be inadequate in meeting the challenges that existed in the unique social and economic situation in Carbon County. Institutional diversity along with other factors made the development of the South Slav community in Helper significantly different than elsewhere in the state.

\textsuperscript{56} Interview with John Skerl, January 15, 1973.
\textsuperscript{58} Croatian and Slovenian lodge charters for the lodges involved.
CONCLUSION

One of the most significant aspects of the South Slav labor settlements in Utah was that these immigrants were part of a general movement of workers throughout the West. The Slovene, Serb, and Croat workers moved not only from one place to another, but they also moved from one occupation to another and from one industry to another. These geographical and occupational moves did not always achieve an improvement of the workers' situation, but they reflected the labor immigrant's constant search for work and wages that he one day hoped to take back to the old country with him. Sometimes employers made moving necessary for the immigrant by laying him off, discharging him, or by closing down the operation.

Together Highland Boy, Midvale, and Helper reflect the three major areas of industrial development in the Rocky Mountain West: metal mining, smelting, and coal mining. These interrelated industries were tied together by the railroads that provided the fourth major draw for immigrant labor. The various phases that each of these industries experienced greatly affected the immigrants and determined, to a great extent, the pattern of all immigrant settlement.

It is important to emphasize that the Serbs, Croats, and Slovenes were only three groups operating among many. Naturalization records in Carbon County show that members of twenty-seven nationality groups applied for American citizenship between 1901 and 1937. The other mining and smelting areas of Utah, and the West, reflect similar situations, although Carbon County may have been unusually varied in composition. The heterogeneous nature of Utah's workers makes analysis of them very difficult.

Fortunately, most groups developed institutions within their separate national and cultural contexts that pulled together the many disparate strands into a community or group "ethos." As a result, many records of the groups have been preserved. In combination with more traditional and more accessible historical sources these materials provide fascinating insights into the story of the labor immigrants, like the South Slavs, and the role they played in the industrialization of Utah and the West.
COSTITUZIONE
DELLA
SOCIETA’ DI MUTUO SOCCORSO
Frattellanza Minatori
IN
SUNNYSIDE, UTAH
STATI UNITI D’AMERICA
ORGANIZZATA IL 2 FEBBRAIO 1902
Uniti alla Federazione Colombiana
delle Societa’ Italo-Americane
il giorno 28 del mese d’Aprile 1902
LOGGIA NO. 98
Con Aggiunte e Modificazioni

Italian
Fraternal Organizations in Utah,
1897-1934

BY PHILIP F. NOTARIANNI

Immigrants, seeking security among people who spoke their language and who could offer assistance with such exigent needs as finding work, were drawn to communities where sizeable numbers of their nationality resided. There they often found organizations and associations already founded by their countrymen for protection and improvement, within which they could gain an identity in a new environment fraught with uncertainties and prejudices.

Mr. Notarianni is a doctoral student in history at the University of Minnesota.
At its apex in 1920, the Italian-born immigrants in Utah numbered 3,225—with most of them living in Carbon, Salt Lake, and Weber counties. These immigrants quickly organized a number of lodges and societies for mutual aid during times of illness or other misfortune and for protection against nativism. Once self-protection and mutual aid were achieved, the organizations were used as vehicles for expressing Italian interests to the larger community. Accordingly, they served an important function in promoting integration and eventual acculturation of this distinctive ethnic group into the English-speaking Utah society.

In Carbon County, where a major Italian settlement grew in response to the opening of coal mines, an Italian lodge, Stella D'America, was founded in Castle Gate on January 15, 1898. Stella D'America ("Star of America") was part of the Columbian Federation of Italian Societies, a national organization established October 10, 1893, at a convention sponsored by the Italian Society of Mutual Aid of Hurley, Wisconsin. It subsequently moved its national headquarters to Pueblo, Colorado. The national organization extracted dues from its associate lodges, comprised of Italian societies throughout the country, commensurate with the number of members enrolled. In turn, it provided its membership—almost totally factory workers, miners, and section hands—aid in cases of death or serious injury.

Lodges throughout the United States that were affiliated with the federation had similar goals for their individual localities. They were all concerned with mutual aid and protection, but they also sought to refute nativistic denunciations and to illustrate their loyalty to American ideas and ideals. This latter expression was disclosed at the 1893 convention:

A platform which among other things, set forth a strong recommendations [sic] that it be one of the principal aims of all societies to foster and advocate the spirit of loyalty and patriotism to the Constitution and laws of the United States and all American institutions was drawn up by a committee of ten and adopted by the convention.  

Loyalty to America was exemplified in the emblem adopted by the Stella D'America Lodge of Castle Gate, depicting the Italian flag tied with the American flag above clasped hands of friendship uniting the two peoples.

---

1 Statuto e Regolamento, Stella D'America Collection, Western Americana, Marriott Library, University of Utah, Salt Lake City.
3 Quoted in Ibid., p. 259.
Stella D’America developed at a time when Italian immigrants were relatively new to Utah, but by concentrating themselves in the mining camps they became conspicuous. Local residents harbored ambivalent attitudes toward them, but the majority clearly viewed Italians as undesirable. Instances of racial bias were legion, particularly in the press. In 1899, an article in the *Eastern Utah Advocate* stated: “The Chinese section men here are no more. They were let out on first of May and their places taken by white men and Italians.”4 Nationality was almost always mentioned when describing a crime, as the following examples illustrate:

Monday evening a row occurred at Cedar Siding between section foreman Cummings and the Italian section men. . . . Cummings it seems was in the car making out the payrolls when the Italians came in and demanded higher wages which was refused by Cummings. . . . The Italians were armed to the teeth and evidently had blood in their eye for they started for Cummings threatening to make mince meat of him. . . .

Sevencio, the Italian who was shot in the knee by the discharge of a shotgun last week, died that same night. . . . It is a mystery who did the shooting, for when any crime is committed by any of this class of people they will not give any particulars.6

Dominic Williams, the “Italian Terror” brought to court for disturbing the peace.7

Italian culture and customs were foreign to most resident Utahns. Nativism in Utah began with ignorance of Italians and was compounded by stereotyped images of the Italian as presented in national and local press reports. Additionally, attitudes of Mormons may have been affected by their interest in tracing Old Testament lineage. To what extent this heightened an awareness of ethnic differences is difficult to assess, but at least one Mormon writer of the era cited Joseph Smith as his authority in referring to northern European countries as the place where the choice “blood of Israel” was most heavily concentrated.8

The rules and regulations as enumerated in the constitution of Stella D’America had been approved by the general assembly on May 4, 1899.8 Eastern Utah Advocate (Price), May 4, 1899.9 Eastern Utah Telegraph, May 7, 1891. The title of the article read: “Italy Again Heard From.”

*Eastern Utah Advocate*, April 22, 1897.

*Eastern Utah Advocate*, March 9, 1899. See also the stereotyped treatment of Italians in “Whiskey, Knives and Bad Blood,” an article in *Eastern Utah Advocate*, July 24, 1902.

Nathaniel Baldwin, *Times of the Gentiles. Fullness of the Gentiles. A Discussion with Scriptural References* (Salt Lake City, ca. 1917), 1. Although the LDS church did establish an Italian mission in 1849, its success was minimal. Most of the converts, approximately fifty-seven in number, were Protestant Vaudois of the Waldensian persuasion from the Alpine valleys in northwestern Italy. *Doctrine and Covenants* (64:56) states: “For, verily I say that the rebellious are not of the blood of Ephraim [as the Mormons consider themselves to be], wherefore, they shall be plucked out.” Italian involvement in Utah labor strikes makes this passage more significant.
25, 1899. The Society, as stated in these regulations, had as its purpose "... the most selected and loyal brotherhood and mutual benefit ... to promote the good of all, for one another, and to cooperate efficiently for the common benefit." The rules stipulated further that "the members shall receive protection and in case of sickness or accidents have the right to general benefits as provided in the Benefits Chapter." 

The benefits, or subsidies, provided, in cases of illness or accident, one dollar a day, except Sunday. Benefits for illness began after the sixth day, if the sickness lasted beyond four weeks. In long-term illnesses this sum substantially aided the members who, in most cases, were not receiving other compensation while ill or convalescing. For accidental injury, a member was entitled to a subsidy beginning on the first day, once seven consecutive sick days had passed. No subsidy was paid, however, if an illness occurred as a result of fighting, drunkenness, or venereal disease.

Investigation of the ledgers containing the minutes of the meetings and financial records show that the lodge’s primary interests involved monetary compensations for members who became ill. To illustrate this priority, the *Raporto Amaliti* [sic] the “Illness Report,” constituted the first order of business discussed at lodge meetings.

The bylaws of Stella D’America made it a well-structured organization; all rules and regulations were enumerated fully. Membership was limited to men, and age limitations were set at sixteen to fifty. Those from sixteen to thirty-five years of age paid a twenty-dollar admission fee, whereas those from thirty-six to fifty years of age paid twenty-five dollars. Monthly dues were set at one dollar, with members compelled to keep their payments current; otherwise, a fine or expulsion could result.

Lodge members were required to attend the funerals of brothers as well as those of members’ wives. The care of the sick was also a paramount concern, according to Dr. Joseph Dalpiaz, a long-time member and president of Stella D’America, who said the lodge was “established to help... at that time, the miners, none of them were married; very few had any families... It was a mutual aid society... if a man was sick, one of the lodge members spent an evening, a night with him; they’d take turns.”

---

* Ibid.
* Ibid., p. 35.
* Interview with Dr. Joseph Dalpiaz, Helper, February 5, 1972. This is implied in the lodge’s full title: Società di Mutuo Soccorso Fratellanza Italiana Stella D’America. Mutuo Soccorso is translated literally as “mutual aid”. 
After the 1903 strike, the Italian strikers were forced out of Castle Gate. Many of them settled in the nearby community of Helper where Stella D’America was transferred in 1903. Personal loans may have been secured through the lodge that enabled blacklisted miners to establish small businesses or to become farmers. Article 7, chapter 3, of the Statuto e Regolamento ("Rules and Regulations") stated that if the lodge was in good financial condition a loan could be secured by a member, provided he obtained the cosignature of two other members.

By financial criteria Stella D’America attained considerable success, especially during the 1920s. Prosperity among the Italians, and all southern and eastern European immigrant groups, produced resentment among the other Utahns. A typical example is found in an article published in the News Advocate:

The facts are that the misunderstanding in Carbon County [concerning the strike of 1922] in all probability, would have been long ago composed if the foreign element [Greeks and Italians] had not been permitted to become so domineering a factor. With their low standard of living, and with the high wages that most of them have been able to earn, nearly all of these foreigners have considerable amounts of money on hand...

The lodge provided many loans or personal notes to its members during the early twenties when antagonisms against immigrants rose and culminated in the Ku Klux Klan campaign of 1924–25. It also secured Liberty Bonds and obtained bank notes from Helper State Bank whose president was Joseph Barboglio, himself an Italian immigrant.

The financial operations of the lodge exposed many of its members to the American system of banking and finance and also provided money, through its investment in the Helper State Bank, to the community.

For a discussion on the 1903 strike, see Allan Kent Powell, "Labor at the Beginning of the 20th Century: The Carbon County, Utah, Coal Fields, 1900–1905." (M.A. thesis, University of Utah, 1972). It was reported that "scabs" would be dismissed from the lodge, implying that the early organization could have served as a labor union.

*Statuto e Regolamento, Stella D’America, p. 34.*

*News Advocate, June 29, 1922.*

Ledger of Lodge Meeting Minutes, February 22, 1920, to June 5, 1927, p. 144; Stella D’America Collection. To illustrate these transactions the following is a translated portion from the financial report for the year 1920:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Note</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Antonio Elegante</td>
<td>$530.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Stefano Gianotti</td>
<td>212.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Joe Limone</td>
<td>721.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Battista Flaim</td>
<td>1,060.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Pietro Bianco</td>
<td>206.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deposited to the care of Helper State Bank</td>
<td>1,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the hands of the treasurer</td>
<td>397.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$4,126.28</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This report did not include medical subsidies paid. Also, in 1903 the interest rate for personal loans was about three percent; and, in 1927 it was six percent. The records from 1898 to 1920 were destroyed by fire.
In Carbon County, antagonisms between northern and southern Italians sparked the creation of another Italian lodge. The dichotomy of the life in Italy—the industrialized north versus the poor, agrarian south—has always produced tensions between countrymen. In Utah mine inspector reports, as in U.S. immigration reports, Italians listed themselves as north Italians or south Italians. The criminal element in Italian life was generally attributed to southern Italians or Sicilians. An example is found in a newspaper article titled “Italians Use Knives”:

Albert Rieci, Northern Italian, was stabbed by Paul Ardison and Tom Pessetto, Southern Italians. Stabbing occurred at Magnolia Hall. The incident seemed to stem from the hatreds of the North and South in the "old" country.18

The founding members of Stella D’America were all from northern Italy. The other Italian society, developed at Castle Gate, was called Principe Di Napoli Lodge. Limited information exists on this society, but the title suggests that the lodge must have been comprised of southern Italians; it is doubtful that northern Italians would have named their organization after the Prince of Naples.

On December 31, 1903, a meeting was held by the Principe Di Napoli Lodge to change its name to Stella D’America.19 This name change suggests a merger between Principe Di Napoli and Stella D’America (Helper Lodge), a logical development since the 1903 strike was then in full progress and unity was the order of the day. Interlodge activities between Stella D’America and other Italian societies soon followed and further served to foster a common identity and ease enmities within the Italian community of Carbon County.20

Throughout this period of prejudice and disruption, Stella D’America worked steadily to guide the immigrants to an accommodation with other Utahns. The only real vestige of Italianità maintained in lodge activities was the use of the Italian language in all correspondence. Lodge members invested in Liberty Bonds, especially during World War I, to demonstrate their loyalty, and participated in July 4 celebrations.

18 Eastern Utah Advocate, September 5, 1912.
19 Ibid., November 26, 1903. The Principe Di Napoli Lodge, as remembered by Italian residents of Carbon County, was reportedly a “Black Hand” society. This Black Hand activity was associated with the extortion of money from northern Italians by southern Italians. The extent of such actions cannot be fully determined; but, an article that appeared in the News Advocate, July 7, 1928, entitled: “Two Black Hand Suspects Freed on Bonds by Court,” mentioned Pete Constanza and Frank Zacario(a) as the suspects who were released following a preliminary hearing before J.W. Hammond. Also, John V. Martina was listed as the secretary of the Principe Di Napoli.
20 Ledger of Lodge Meeting Minutes, p. 31. For example, in May 1920 the lodge celebrated Decoration Day with the Christopher Columbus Lodge of Castle Gate.
as well as civic duties such as beautifying the local cemetery. During the 1920s, many lodge members participated actively in the Moose, Elks, and other organizations. The exposure they had received to organizational functionings through Stella D'America aided them in a variety of ways with their endeavors outside the Italian community.

Similar lodges and societies developed in other parts of Carbon County. Information on these organizations is meager, and material must be pieced together in order to arrive at conclusions. The Principe Di Napoli Lodge of Castle Gate, as mentioned, merged with Stella D'America in 1903. Investigation of Stella D'America records has revealed that in 1920 there existed in Castle Gate a lodge entitled La Società Cristoforo Colombo ("The Christopher Columbus Society") No. 157, presumably founded sometime after 1903. A majority of the Italian societies in Utah became affiliated with the Columbian Federation of Italian Societies; however, the naming of each lodge was left to the discretion of its members. A 1930 Italian publication reveals that a lodge designated Società Minatori Italiana ("Italian Miners Society") existed in Sunnyside.\footnote{[Zopito Vallentina], \textit{Attività Italiane nell Intermountain Region} (Salt Lake City, 1930), 86. The lodge was designated in its constitution as Fratellanza Minatori.} This organization, Lodge No. 98 of the Columbian
Italian Fraternal Organizations 179

Federation was founded February 2, 1902, to provide mutual aid for Italian coal miners in that area.

In an attempt to comply with the compulsory Americanization Law of 1919, the Italians looked to a new type of organization. During the week of April 4, 1920, several Italians took steps to organize the Italian Americanization Club of Carbon County. The club was to serve as a social organization with its paramount objective being “100 percent Americanization” among the Carbon County Italian population. Lessons in the English language and American law and customs were part of its program. Carbon County residents viewed this work favorably. The News Advocate reported:

A party filling three autos and led by P.O. Silvagni, Frank Grosso, Dominick Bergera, Henry Ruggeri, Oreste Ganzeria, Fred Larcher, and Fr. A.F. Giovannoni went to Sunnyside Sunday to talk with Italians of the camp about the plans of the Italian Americanization Club. They found the Italians of Sunnyside anxious to get an auxiliary organization formed and to get to work along the lines outlined by the visitors. The club is rapidly growing. . . . The movement is one of the most important ever launched in the county. . . . The club is doing splendid work and that work is appreciated by the businessmen of Carbon County.

The consensus was that the Americanization Club benefited the Italians as well as other Utahns. Speakers acknowledged publicly on October 12, 1920, at a Columbus Day celebration, that hundreds of Italians were members of the organization and that the leaders deserved the heartiest thanks of the community for their efforts. Non-Italian speakers praised the Italian character and ability and spoke highly of the Italian nation and of those Italians who had left it for broader opportunities in the United States. These speakers were among the same people who earlier had condemned the Italians as “undesirable”; but now that the Italian community seemed to conform to the demands of compulsory Americanization, residents looked on them in a favorable manner. Such conformity played a vital role toward the eventual acceptance of the Italian minority by the dominant group, the Mormons, in Utah.

23 News Advocate, April 8, 1920.
24 Ibid., April 29, 1920. Fr. Giovannoni, the parish priest in Price, was instrumental in aiding, guiding, and unifying the Italian immigrants.
25 Ibid., August 19, 1920. Henry Ruggeri, in a private interview with the writer, stated that the “businessmen” appreciated the club because club leaders were encouraged to suggest to members not to use excessive credit when purchasing.
26 Ibid., October 14, 1920.
The Italian-Americanization Club, however, existed for only a short duration, approximately nine to twelve months. Judge Henry Ruggeri, one of the founders of the club, stated that the organization was discontinued because of a "lack of interest," but the ephemeral program of a similar organization in Salt Lake suggests that many Italians of the state, like other ethnic groups, resented compulsory Americanization because they saw in it a stripping away of their cultural distinctiveness. The Americanization Club, however, demonstrated that the Italian community had at least attempted to conform to nativistic demands.

But lodge activities could not totally sweep away nativistic sentiments against Italians in Salt Lake County. Italian laborers who favored unionization and would strike to obtain demands were often the object of anti-foreign demonstrations. In 1908, for example, a strike was called in Murray against the United States Smelter owned by the American Smelting and Refining Company. The *Salt Lake Tribune* reported the event:

No more foreigners will be employed at the United States Smelter at Murray, according to the placards that were posted. . . . The notices read to the effect that all Greeks, Austrians, and Italians can get their money at the time . . . and that . . . they are to consider themselves discharged from further duty for an indefinite period. All white men who were compelled to stay out on account of the attitude of the strikers can also secure their pay checks.28

The most poignant example of nativistic impressions toward Italians, as well as southern Europeans in general, is found in a thesis purportedly written "On the Housing Problem in Salt Lake City." Beginning as a survey of westside neighborhoods in order to view housing conditions in the city, the study quickly degenerated into an undocumented degradation of Italian and Greek immigrants who lived in the area. The work also reflected the nativistic attitudes of renters and nonforeign residents in the areas visited by the author. The following are excerpts from that thesis:

. . . the landlords prefer Americans to Southern Europeans. . . . Thus when Italians, Greeks, Japs or Chinese apply for a house and the landlord is particular who shall occupy the place, the rent is a little higher than

---

27 Interview with Henry Ruggeri, Price, December 18, 1971. Judge Ruggeri, Carbon County attorney during the 1920s, also stated that during the time he held office many Italian residents of Carbon County became naturalized American citizens. This can be attributed, in part, to the Americanization Club.

28 *Salt Lake Tribune*, May 6, 1908.
Italian Fraternal Organizations

The U. S. flag was prominently displayed by Società Cristoforo Colombo at a Columbus Day banquet, October 12, 1944, in Salt Lake City. Photograph courtesy of Mr. and Mrs. Jim Chiado.

for the ordinary houses in the same locality and of the same size. In such cases the demand and supply of houses is modified by race prejudice.29

Of all peoples that do not have sufficient recreation, the Italians are by far the worst off. They seem to have no initiative or resources of their own. . . . No one ever encourages them to enter any social activities whatever. In fact all is discouragement since they believe them to be below their dignity and will shun all such foreigners. They lack a fighting and persevering spirit that might lead them to a better life. Even the children attending school are tortured and left out of the play of other children.30

The Greeks and Italians are perhaps the most careless and shiftless people found. . . . The standard of living among them is lower than of any other nationality.31

That this thesis, illustrating antiimmigrant prejudices, met with the approval of the author’s graduate committee at the University of Utah might indicate that “intellectuals” shared similar notions. The attitudes expressed in the thesis revealed the formidable obstacles with which the Italians had to deal; organization proved one way that such obstacles could be overcome.

La Società Cristoforo Columbo became the major Italian society of Salt Lake County. Organized April 28, 1897, in Salt Lake City, the lodge resembled Stella D’America in that its main purpose was also to establish

30 Ibid., 44. One Italian informant related to this writer that as a child he was afraid to tell his friends that he ate spaghetti because of the harassment he might receive. Another stated that as a child attending school in Magna, he never once received a Valentine card from other children—a custom that was practiced at that time.
31 Ibid., 47.
mutual aid among the membership. Its pursuits were similar to those of other societies already discussed. Illness compensation was awarded on a dollar-a-day basis, but if a member required hospitalization he received an additional fifty cents daily. For illnesses that were not serious and did not demand specialists or hospitalization, the lodge provided its members with free medical service. Although membership was restricted to men only, it became customary to have annual dinners to which members brought their wives. Monthly dances to the music of the Vito Carone Orchestra highlighted lodge activities. The Italian language was used in lodge proceedings, and for many years the Christopher Columbus Society conducted a celebration on September 20 to commemorate the unification of Italy. This celebration was unique since other Italian societies in Utah, as can be determined from existing sources, refrained from acknowledging traditional Italian holidays. The eventual deletion of this holiday pointed to new identities taking shape; lodge celebrations took on different meanings.

In about 1924 the Italians began to participate in the annual celebrations of July 24, although this activity faded in the later years of the Depression because of financial difficulties. Pioneer Day festivities were celebrated by a Christopher Columbus Lodge float entry in the annual parade, usually depicting the discovery of America by Columbus. Joe Merabelle said the lodge members wanted to show their goodwill and "to be proud of living in this community." This inclination toward an outward display of respect, not only for the pioneers (both Mormon and Italian) but also for the custom itself, demonstrated the willingness of the Italians to seek a common denominator with their fellow Utahns.

The celebration that generated the most excitement among Italians, however, was Columbus Day, October 12. Annual dances sponsored by the Christopher Columbus Lodge were well attended by the Italian community of Salt Lake County. An early celebration in the 1920s was held at the old Salt Palace on Ninth South. Almost seven hundred people took part in the festivities. Italians from Tooele, Magna, Garfield, and other areas came in full force. According to the Salt Lake newspaper, Corriere

---

32 Interview with Joe Merabelle, Salt Lake City, January 20, 1972. The ledgers and correspondence of the lodge are lost.
33 Ibid.
34 Ibid. Presumably to avoid further antagonizing nativists.
35 Ibid. The Lodge was the first Italian organization in Utah and thus a pioneer itself.
36 Ibid. When the Salt Palace was destroyed by fire, the Bonneville Dance Hall was erected at the site and was used by the lodge for its dances.
Italian Fraternal Organizations

183

Italian groups gave a special flavor to local celebrations, as the Pioneer Day float, ca. 1924, of the Salt Lake City Christopher Columbus Lodge demonstrates. Photograph courtesy of Joe Merabelle.

D’America, which was published from 1929 to 1933, these dances were still functioning well into the early 1930s.

The establishment of Columbus Day as a legal state holiday in Utah can be attributed indirectly to an Italian society. Fortunato Anselmo, Italian vice-consul for Utah, was a member of the Christopher Columbus Lodge. In 1915 he left the society and established the organization Figli D’Italia (“Sons of Italy”), also known as Società Giuseppe Mazzini. Anselmo, under the auspices of Figli D’Italia and as Italian vice-consul, lobbied in 1919, along with members of the Knights of Columbus, during World War I, $1,000 from the Figli D’Italia treasury was donated to the Red Cross.

Subsequent research has revealed that a celebration took place in Salt Lake City on May 24, 1918, in honor of the third anniversary of the entrance of Italy into World War I. This was in response to a directive issued by President Wilson that on that day all public buildings were to display the Italian flag. Governor Bamberger asked that the message be met with compliance in Utah. As covered in the Salt Lake Tribune for May 24 and 25, the parade that followed was composed of the Sunnyvale Italian Band, Italian societies (Sons of Italy, Christopher Columbus Lodge, Italian society from Ophir, and the Bingham society) marching with red, white, and green sashes, and numerous non-Italian peoples and organizations.

37 Ibid.
38 Ibid. Attivita’ Italiane listed the organization as La Società Giuseppe Mazzini and also as a part of the Figli D’Italia. However, in Baldo Aquilano, L’Ordine Figli D’Italia in America (New York, 1925), Utah was not mentioned as having a Figli D’Italia lodge. It is quite possible that the organization did not affiliate with the National Sons of Italy in California because it merged back with the Christopher Columbus Lodge in the 1930s. It is interesting to note that during World War I, $1,000 from the Figli D’Italia treasury was donated to the Red Cross.

Subsequent research has revealed that a celebration took place in Salt Lake City on May 24, 1918, in honor of the third anniversary of the entrance of Italy into World War I. This was in response to a directive issued by President Wilson that on that day all public buildings were to display the Italian flag. Governor Bamberger asked that the message be met with compliance in Utah. As covered in the Salt Lake Tribune for May 24 and 25, the parade that followed was composed of the Sunnyvale Italian Band, Italian societies (Sons of Italy, Christopher Columbus Lodge, Italian society from Ophir, and the Bingham society) marching with red, white, and green sashes, and numerous non-Italian peoples and organizations.
for a bill that would declare Columbus Day a legal state holiday. Their efforts met with success, and on March 13, 1919, Gov. Simon Bamberger signed into law House Bill No. 130, amending Section 2896 of the compiled Laws of Utah, 1917, and recognizing October 12, Columbus Day, as a legal state holiday. This set the stage for the largest Columbus Day celebration in the history of the state. A description of the festivities appeared in an article in the *Salt Lake Tribune*, October 13, 1919:

This afternoon one of the most pretentious pageants ever held in the city is traversing the streets. It marks the first of what will hereafter be an annual event in connection with Columbus Day. . . . Christopher Columbus Lodges from Carbon County, Utah, and Pocatello, Idaho, are represented in the parade. Almost the entire local Italian and Greek colonies are taking part, in addition to various fraternal organizations.

The article mentioned that the Knights of Columbus of Salt Lake and the Elks, Moose, and Eagles lodges were represented. Also taking part in the parade were the Italian Mother's Club of Salt Lake and the Italian Band from Sunnyside, Utah; Governor Bamberger; Salt Lake Mayor W. Mont Ferry; Bishop Joseph S. Glass of the Catholic Diocese; LDS President Heber J. Grant; and Fortunato Anselmo.  

---

39 Simon Bamberger, *Letters of Transmittal P-Q 1919*, Governors Correspondence Papers, Utah State Archives, State Capitol, Salt Lake City. This type of legislation had already been enacted in many other states.

40 *Salt Lake Telegram*, October 13, 1919.
The celebration reflected the mutual cooperation of the Italian and non-Italian communities. It was an occasion with which both groups could identify, and it served as another common denominator between them. This cooperation occurred in the nationalistic postwar period and reflected what advocates of Americanization desired, but they apparently did not recognize it as such.

In addition to the Christopher Columbus Lodge, various other societies were established throughout the state—their ephemeral programs now obscure. In 1907 or 1908 the Italians of Bingham Canyon established La Società Italiana Di Beneficenza ("The Italian Society of Charity"). From 1909 until the Columbus Day celebration of 1919, reports of this society are nebulous, although the organization was solely responsible for the Columbus Day celebration of 1919 in Bingham. The lodge's activities were not strictly social. In 1924 the Bingham Society No. 68 expressed to Sen. Reed Smoot their dislike of the pending legislation that restricted Italian immigration. By 1930 Lodge No. 68 was called the Christopher Columbus Society, headed by John Vietti.

---

41 *Il Minatore* (Salt Lake City), January 16, 1909. The society was referred to as the Italian Lodge No. 68, adding some confusion to the record.

42 U.S., Senate, *Congressional Record*, 68th Cong., 1st sess., 1960. Their efforts were unsuccessful.

43 [Vallentini,] *Attivita' Italiane*, p. 86.

Members of Federazione Columbiana, Lodge no. 68, of Bingham celebrated Columbus Day 1929. Photograph courtesy of Mrs. Tony Barrutia.
Lodge No. 68 is difficult to follow, for in 1908 there existed a social benefit lodge in Mercur known as Società No. 68, which sponsored a Columbus Day celebration that year, and a Christopher Columbus Lodge. Possibly the Bingham and Mercur societies merged, but this is speculation.\(^44\)

The Club Dante Alighieri was founded in 1908 at Salt Lake City by Mose Paggi, an Italian notary public.\(^45\) Paggi also managed *Il Minatore*, the only known Italian newspaper in Utah during the 1908-9 period. In the 1900–1910 decade, many immigrants throughout the United States were attempting to blunt nativistic sentiment by pleading to their countrymen to prove their assimilability. Paggi was one such individual. In his newspaper columns two articles appeared exhorting his *paesani* to become American citizens. “Fatevi Cittadini Americani” (“Become American Citizens”) and “Per Divenire Cittadini Americani” (“To Become American Citizens”) were features that appeared in practically every issue of *Il Minatore*. The former contained questions that would most likely be included in examinations for American citizenship; the latter listed the personal information needed when applying for “first” and “second” citizenship papers.\(^46\)

An epilogue to the various Italian societies was the founding of the Italian-American Civic League on January 18, 1934, as a result of correspondence between Joe Merabelle and Antonio R. Rizzuto of Omaha, Nebraska:\(^47\)

> The Italian-American Civic League was born in the depth of a depression to fill a necessity. The year was 1934. The necessity was a feeling among the people of Italian descent that they were considered a minority. Immigration laws discriminated and there was a need to plow a path towards integration with those Americans who constituted the majority.\(^48\)

---

\(^{44}\) *Il Minatore*, September 12, 1908.

\(^{45}\) Mose Paggi was a most interesting character. In 1910 he was made Italian consular agent in Utah. However, in December 1912 he entered into a partnership with L.G. Skliris, the Greek padrone unmasked in the Bingham strike of 1912. This suggests that Paggi could have also been a padrone. He was well educated, had consular power, and was an Italian notary public. For complete details of the partnership see: *Pacific Reporter*, 179 (St. Paul, 1919), 739–40.

\(^{46}\) A Christopher Columbus Lodge was organized in Ogden with Carlo Rogers as president. Little else is known about it. See [Vallentini,] *Attivita' Italiane*, p. 86.

\(^{47}\) The history of the league, written by Elsie Rock Murray and Marcel Richeda, appeared in the *Souvenir Program, 14th Annual All-State Italian Day*, July 20, 1947, pamphlet 5212, Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City. A brief history of Antonio R. Rizzuto is found in the *Program of the 50th Golden Anniversary, UNICO National*, UNICO National Convention, Miami Beach, Florida, August 16–19, 1972, Immigrant Archives, University of Minnesota, Saint Paul.

The league evolved into an organization engaged in making the "good will" of the Italian community known to others. This was accomplished by contributions to charitable causes, offering scholarships to Utah colleges for worthy students of Italian descent, and sponsoring an annual picnic, Italian Day, for all Italians, at the Lagoon resort in Davis County. This organization comprised of women's and men's chapters, is still functioning well and attempting to encourage younger generations of Italian descent to become involved.\(^{49}\)

Over the years, interlodge activities proved to be of a limited nature. Societies within the same county mingled, but activity between lodges from Carbon, Salt Lake, and Weber counties was rare, primarily because of the distance involved and lingering old-country distinctions. Transportation and the need to secure lodging when traveling discouraged the interaction that should have taken place. This lack of social intermingling, which would have enabled Italians of the state to gather and identify with each other, reinforced old-country antagonisms among the Italians of Salt Lake City, Ogden, and Carbon County. The Italian-American Civic League has attempted to remedy this situation, and the current interest to reidentify with ethnic origins may very well lead to a better understanding and cooperation on the part of Utah's Italian population.

The clubs and fraternal orders that developed in Utah gave the Italian immigrants a sense of security. This, coupled with a "feeling of continuity with the past,"\(^{50}\) aided in the prevention of general demoralization among individual Italians. Once this security was achieved, the mutual aid societies functioned as a means for preparing the immigrants to assume a role in American life. The Columbus Day and July 24 celebrations illustrate that through lodge functions an accommodation to the non-Italian community was progressing in a gradual and natural manner.

\(^{49}\) Stella D'America and the Christopher Columbus Lodge of Salt Lake are also still in existence but not as active as they were previously. Present-day league members desire a return to stronger ties with their Italian heritage, an indication that perhaps Italians have at last acquired the vital sense of security.

In Memoriam

Joel Edward Ricks

1889-1974
On the eve of this past Thanksgiving the Utah State Historical Society lost a valiant and dedicated servant. Dr. Joel E. Ricks died on November 26, 1974, just a few weeks beyond his eighty-fifth birthday. He was born in Rexburg, Idaho, on October 18, 1889. His education was obtained at the University of Utah and the University of Chicago. From the latter institution he earned his master's and doctor's degrees in 1920 and 1930.

In his younger years he had a succession of important educational positions. He was the first principal of Gunnison High School. He left there to become head of the history department at Weber College, and in 1920 he was appointed president of that college. Two years later he became chairman of the history department at Utah State Agricultural College. Here he found his professional home, and here he stayed until his retirement thirty-three years later.

In addition to his academic interests, Joel Ricks devoted a good portion of his mature life to the development and growth of the Historical Society. Indeed, he became a member of the Board of Trustees in 1925 and served continuously for forty years, until 1965, longer than anyone else in the distinguished history of the Society. He was elected president in 1949 and continued in that office for eight years. It was during his presidency that the professional foundations of the Society and its staff were laid.

The hiring of a professional director-editor, a librarian, an archivist, significant increases in the budget, the establishment of the *Utah Historical Quarterly* as a true quarterly, acquiring a distinguished home for the Society and its activities, all of these developments, and more, took place during the tenure of Joel E. Ricks as president.

If the foregoing sounds stiff and prosaic, permit me the indulgence of a brief look at Joel Ricks as a person and a gentleman. From a superficial and brief acquaintance, particularly in a formal situation, one might get the impression that he was cold, stiff, and, of course, very conservative. It is true he was a dignified man; more importantly he was a large man, both in spirit and in physical presence. His formality was more apparent than real. From a large handful of years of intimate professional relations with him, I can testify to his warmth, his humanity, and his philosophical liberalism. At least from my experience, he had breadth of view and an open mind in basic intellectual and philosophical matters. He had the qualities of an abiding loyalty and love in several areas: to his beloved wife Katherine, to his church, to his profession and college, and not least to the Utah State Historical Society which he served so well over so many years. In simple truth it will be a long time before his like will come this way again. From his long and distinguished career in education and history, he has left a legacy that will be remembered long into the indefinite future.

A. Russell Mortensen

*Chief Historian*

*National Park Service*

No other name is more central to the history of Utah than Brigham Young. And now nearly a century after his death and after a half-dozen or so biographies, none of which is avowedly adequate and true to the man, we have the first significant publication of personal writings of the pioneer leader. Under a new program of research and publication out of the Historical Department of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, this first volume in the Mormon Heritage Series, under the general editorship of Leonard J. Arrington, has been produced by Dean C. Jessee, already well known for his critical studies into the provenance, authenticity, and authorship of basic manuscript documents for Mormon history. The volume is a tribute to his devotion to the pioneer leader, his dedication to the ideals of professional editing, and his thoroughness as a practicing historian.

Brigham Young had seventeen sons and twenty-nine daughters who grew to maturity. Here are published letters from the father to thirteen of those sons—mostly while they were away from home, at school, on missions, on business trips, or in the military service. The ninety-five letters date from August 1854 to August 1877 (the month of Young's death); two-thirds of them were written during the 1870s.

The volume is well composed. A foreword by Jack H. Adamson and an introduction by Dean Jessee prepare the reader for a variety of uses of and insights into the volume. An appropriate statement of editorial procedure defends the rendering of the originals into modern typography, a procedure that follows current and acceptable standards for the publication of historical manuscripts. For each son (even the four for whom letters do not survive) there is an excellent biographical sketch. Letters to each son are arranged chronologically behind that son's biography. Individual letters or groups of letters are briefly introduced with further historical background, sometimes including quotations from a son's letters. At no point is the reader left wondering about the historical setting for any letter. Notes to sources for the biographies and to the letters are placed at the back where the reader will also find a biographical appendix of the names of persons mentioned in the letters. Useful appendices include a chronology of events in the life of Brigham Young, a list of Brigham Young's wives by whom he had children (no dates), a chronological table of the life spans of his children, and a chronological list of the letters of Brigham Young here published. An index completes the volume.

"If you wish to know the oak-rooted values of any ruler," writes Jack Adamson in his foreword, "read his letters to his sons." Certainly the major contribution of the publication is the primary and intimate glimpse presented
into the mind, heart, and spirit of the Mormon church president. And the image is anything but the nineteenth-century stereotype given by most writers. In fact, Mormons themselves will be enlightened on facets of his character, though not surprised. One sees Brigham Young the religious man, the sensitive, solicitous and affectionate father, the exemplar, the man of integrity and honesty devoted to the fundamentals of the Mormon ethic. We are transported into a complex family and become acquainted with an array of unusual and individualistic sons. We share the president's feelings concerning his children and his associates, church affairs, political and economic matters.

The latter topics are slighted in this presentation because the decision was made to exclude those letters that dealt mainly with business matters. The letters selected give "the best reflection of his domestic relationship with his children. Other letters to his sons dealing exclusively with business matters or detailing local events have not been included here" (xlii). And we would have had a still better view of the man had the decision been made to include the letters to his daughters!

The book is a landmark in another respect. In a state known for book publishing and its look-alike books, this volume was designed by Keith Montague of Bailey & Montague. The attractiveness of the volume itself and the readability of the text is a tribute to Mr. Montague. But to the professional eye it will be apparent that there were lapses of diligence at the press.

Hopefully the volume is the harbinger of a new era when the Historical Department will systematically publish the most significant of the documentary sources for Mormon church history. The publication of the letters of Brigham Young giving moral and religious advice to his sons seems a safe and logical place to begin.

Historians love to read other people's mail, and to read the letters Brigham Young wrote to his sons is of genuine and beneficial value. Every student of Utah history and Mormon life and thought will appreciate this significant work.

S. GEORGE ELLSWORTH
Professor of History
Utah State University


In their preface the authors indicate that their book is in the tradition of Herbert Eugene Bolton and Walter Prescott Webb, which explain their concentration on the Trans-Mississippi Southwest. The northern Great Plains and the Pacific Northwest are not treated as adequately as the Southwest. Details that would help explain the acquisition of the Pacific Northwest, such as the rather intricate diplomacy involved in the boundary settlement with Great Britain, including the "54° 40' or Fight" issue, have been left out.

The book is divided into five major chapters dealing with the colonial West, American penetration of the West, consolidating American control, internal developments, and the maturity of the West. Under these broad headings such topics as the trapping, mining, cattle and farming frontiers are treated. Also treated are territorial acquisition, railroad building, Indian wars, state-making, and the problems of modern urbanization. The authors state in the preface that "the land, the people, their history, and their interaction—we feel explain
the West as it is today.” However, the final chapter dealing with the maturity of the West, or the West as it is today, contains the least amount of material. The authors could have appreciably strengthened the usefulness of the book for serious students of the West by developing a more in-depth interpretation of the twentieth-century West.

The book suffers from a problem common to short histories, i.e., there is little development of major themes, events, or characters, although brief biographical sketches of major characters are included.

There are some errors of fact in the book. The authors write about “John Coulter [he seems to have preferred the spelling “Colter”] who in 1804 had gone up the Missouri and on his return trip to St. Louis had met the Lewis and Clark group; in fact had been persuaded to go west with them” (p. 99). Actually John Colter had formally enlisted as a private with the Lewis and Clark expedition on October 15, 1803. Also the authors state, in regard to the Mormon prophet, Joseph Smith, Jr., that “angry Gentiles stormed the jail, removed the leader of the Saints, and hanged him without benefit of a trial” (p. 159). In fact he was shot and killed without benefit of a trial.

The book is indexed and contains a fine bibliography listing some major primary, secondary, and periodical sources under each of the general chapter headings. Twenty maps, which are well done, are included in the book and help to identify and pinpoint material presented in the narrative.

The book is well written and interesting to read. It would appeal to the individual who desires a broad outline of the history of the Trans-Mississippi West.

David L. Crowder
Coordinator
History Department
Ricks College
Rexburg, Idaho


Zane Grey’s works, which contained as many as a hundred violent deaths and usually one kidnapping of an innocent woman or child per book, and in which the main characters of each novel were inevitably related to one another unbeknownst to them all until the final happy scenes, are the main focus of Carlton Jackson’s small volume entitled simply Zane Grey. The book is not a biography, nor does it purport to be. Unlike Frank Gruber’s previous work, which covers Grey’s life in great detail, this study treats his life “only as it relates to his publishing record.” The reader effectively comes to know Grey through the themes he developed in his writings: e.g., his concern over the foul treatment of the Indian, dislike of the “fanaticism” of religious zealots — particularly Mormons — alarm over the ecological misuse of the land by the entrepreneur, and belief in the ennobling effect of love and the nobility of women. Jackson relies heavily on Grey’s diaries and correspondence to show attitudes held by Grey and traces these through plot lines in the novelist's works.

The book is a feast for the Zane Grey follower. By categorizing Grey’s novels into five major types — desert, mountain, horse, historical, and cowboy — and discussing each in turn, the book covers Grey’s works with far more continuity than has any previous volume. Unfortunately, Jackson employs no serious literary criticism, primarily confining his study of Grey’s books to a plot
summary and statement of theme. Indeed, the bulk of the work is a series of masterplots of Grey's works aimed more at the Grey disciple than the serious scholar. One may argue this as a failing in Grey, however, and not Jackson. It is difficult to find depth and symbolism in books that contain none.

From Ripley Hitchcock, who felt Grey had no ability to write "either narrative or fiction," to most contemporary critics, the quality of Zane Grey's literary output has been seriously questioned. In an attempt to treat Grey's writing seriously, Jackson faces a dilemma: how to justify the study without discrediting himself with his fellow critics. Hence the book, although generally complimentary, often refers to the critics' estimation of Grey and his weak use of characterization. When Jackson notes that Grey's popularity resulted primarily because his "talents and ability to write for sustained periods coincided with America's 'Golden Age' of pulp magazines," he says by implication most of what there is to say about Grey's success and place in literature.

Although thoroughly researched and effectively written, the book lacks depth and breadth. Jackson fails to show any significant effect Grey's writings might have had on either the social and cultural patterns of the day or the literary community. He fails to compare Grey's writings to that of his contemporaries or literary peers, which would have given a better perspective of the author's quality, contribution, and importance; and one must conclude at the end of the work that Grey is worth studying only because he was prolific. Jackson seems to have fallen under the spell of the infinitely likable and immensely popular Grey and to have lost perspective of his subject's writing abilities.

Nevertheless, for those who enjoy Grey as an entertaining escapist author, the book is a delight. It not only gives insights into the man and his work, it helps the reader separate fact from fiction and better understand the part Grey had in making the romantic West a dream to be reckoned with.

REBECCA VAN DYKE
Cedar City


Every historian desires in his lifetime to write at least one work that will become a classic. Some succeed, but most simply provide stop-gap works that exist until something better is produced. The definition of a classic is a work of enduring excellence and insights that is well written and remains an authoritative source. This is also an accurate description of Frances Fuller Victor's *River of the West*, originally published in 1870. The Brooks-Sterling Company has now produced a facsimile edition of 1,500 copies especially for the collector of Western Americana.

Mrs. Victor did two things in this work. First, she presented a biography of Joseph L. Meek, the fur trapper and mountain man; and second, she wove around him a history of the Pacific Northwest, specifically detailing the development of the Oregon Territory. This work is unique because she, herself an early citizen of Oregon, was an actual acquaintance of Meek. She was able, therefore, to create a personal picture of the man and the territory and their effect upon each other, with insights unparalleled by a modern historian. This firsthand knowledge makes her work a sourcebook that others must continue to draw upon.

Although by current standards the author's style of writing is somewhat
dated, her scholarship is highly reliable and the book itself quite readable. It was certainly of sufficient quality in her own time to attract the attention of the famous Hubert Howe Bancroft, for whom she later wrote the History of Oregon. Now the style merely helps qualify the work as a literary period-piece as well as a historical classic.

Although Mrs. Victor relies heavily upon Joe Meek's adventures to unify the work, some of the chapters that treat other topics are among the best. For example, the interesting details in the chapter concerning the Whitman Massacre help explain the deaths of some of the Sager children, whose earlier story was recently made the subject of a movie. Another such detail concerns the account of the controversial Mr. McBean whose reasons for refusing help to the survivors are still debated.

The last five chapters are quite different from those preceding, since in them she discusses such varied topics as the Northern Pacific Railway, the Washington Territory, the Montana Territory, soil, climate and resources. This is certainly a notable attempt on the author's part to present such an encyclopedic tour. It is kept from becoming dull, however, because the author is an able tour guide and provides the reader with fascinating insights into the Pacific Northwest that only a firsthand observer of the 1860s could produce.

Readers, with pleasure, will thank the publishers for allowing them to become reacquainted with The River of the West, for it is truly a classic. However, this new edition would have been even more useful with a scholar's introduction or editing to reflect later research on the subject. Beautifully bound and printed with the original line drawings, this edition, like the original, will undoubtedly become a collector's item.

DELMONT R. OSWALD
Assistant Director
Utah Endowment for the Humanities


The Classic Southwest is a collection of twelve articles published during what might be termed the golden age of anthropological research in the American Southwest. All but two of these papers were originally published prior to 1930, and six appeared in print between 1880 and 1900. The book includes papers by T. Mitchell Prudden, A. V. Kidder, Charles F. Lummis, Adolph F. Bandelier, J. Walter Fewkes, William P. Blake, Donald D. Brand, and William Duncan Strong. Most of these names are familiar to anyone even casually acquainted with the history of southwestern research, and most, if not all, of these articles are available at any large university library.

The papers make for fascinating reading and individually stand on their own merit. However, as a set of collected readings, I am a little apprehensive about the potential utility of the book. It is purportedly “intended for specialists in various disciplines who will have a quick, ready-at-hand reference to a variety of papers, some of which they will most probably not have on their shelves.” With only twelve articles, covering a diverse range of topics from the self-flagellating Penitent Brothers to the feather symbol in ancient Hopi designs, it is unlikely that a “specialist” would need to consult this book frequently enough to justify its cost. In short, the editors have spread themselves too thin.
by trying to incorporate too much. The book should have been made much longer and divided into appropriate sections, or the scope of the subject matter should have been much more narrowly focused. Either option would have produced a more valuable research source.

I fully agree with the editors’ introductory comments acknowledging our intellectual debt to earlier workers. As one who has gained innumerable insights from reviewing “outdated” documents, I can only echo their criticism of “New Archaeologists” who tend to reject any data published prior to the revelations of Lewis Binford. The editors’ expressed desire that this book “will lead those who are totally devoted to the ‘New’ to discover the great value—and their dependence upon it—of the ‘Old,’ and to explore still further the available riches of the past, now lying fallow” is a worthy goal whether or not it is realized.

Perhaps we can look forward to a second edition of The Classic Southwest designed toward this end.

MICHAEL S. BERRY
Assistant Utah State Archaeologist
Antiquities Section
Division of State History


More than half a century of contact between the author, Harry C. James, and the Hopi people has resulted in an unusual opportunity for long informative talks with friends from the villages. These conversations in a variety of circumstances have helped to give depth to an understanding and appreciation uncommon among persons not born and raised in the Hopi way.

Long companionship with persons such as Frederick Webb Hodge, who knew the Hopi well, has also helped to mature the author’s judgment as he has engaged in research and writing that has resulted in a number of books about Hopi history and culture.

This work gives a comprehensive view of the Hopi as a people, in length of time covered as well as in depth and breadth. Commencing with the Hopi traditions of the way things began, the account continues through the migrations of the clans and contacts with Spaniards, Mexicans, and the early representatives of the United States. More detail is supplied after the reader is introduced to events of the present century.

The closeness of the author to individual Hopis gives insights into the personal lives of selected leaders, as well as views of the rivalry that has developed over the years between particular groups. Eyewitness accounts of American “purification” rites, such as compulsory bathing in vats filled with a solution similar to sheep dip, to rid the Hopi — men and women — of germs that were supposedly contributing to the spread of white man’s diseases, serve as examples of the inhumane treatment sometimes meted out to Indians by representatives of federal agencies in the process of carrying opportunities to participate in education, health, and other socially oriented programs, to Indian country.

The closing chapters include information concerning the envelopment of the Hopi Reservation within an enlarged Navajo Reservation and the gradual encroachment of Navajo tribesmen on Hopi territory, sometimes over the protests of representatives of the Bureau of Indian Affairs and sometimes with their acquiescence or outright approval.

The bibliography included in this work gives evidence of a broad knowl-
edge of printed and manuscript sources as well as information gained through personal interviews and the experiences of a lifetime. An appendix includes the “Constitution and By-Laws of the Hopi Tribe.” Judiciously selected illustrative material adds to one’s understanding and appreciation of Hopi history and culture. A useful index is supplied. Although we have a general knowledge of where the Hopi villages lie in northern Arizona, selected maps of the region would have added to the helpfulness of the work.


Professor Bartlett’s Nature’s Yellowstone is quite obviously a labor of love by a man who knows and understands the park and its natural and human history. It is therefore difficult to comprehend or to explain why the book somehow does not quite live up to either Professor Bartlett’s talent and scholarship or to his subject matter. Part of the problem is that, although the reader is promised “the story of Yellowstone as Nature created it,” the book is really not about nature’s Yellowstone but about the early exploration of the territory that was set aside in 1872 as the first national park. Only in the first third of the book is the highly complex physiography, geology, and ecology of the Yellowstone region dealt with. The remaining two-thirds treats man’s entry into and travel through the region, from the Sheepeaters clear through to the Montanans who eventually saw to the creation of Yellowstone National Park. This is a difficult transition for a reader to make, particularly if he has been lured into thinking that the book is to be a paean to Yellowstone’s natural history by that part of the preface which relegates men in Yellowstone to “and finally . . . .”

Despite this, both stories of Yellowstone are admirably told—the one which the book purports to be about and the one that it really is about. In part one, “Nature’s Age,” the natural history of the region is described. Using a clever scheme of viewing the park as the face of a clock (to keep the reader geographically oriented), Professor Bartlett follows a noon-to-noon sweep of the region, describing the mountain fastness which surrounds the park on one twelve-hour cycle and relating the geology (particularly that of geothermal activity) of the Yellowstone Plateau on a second circuit. In addition, the flora and fauna of the park are described by one who has obviously seen a great deal more than the average tourist who sticks to the main roads.

Part two, “Wanderers and Explorers,” forms the bulk of the book, and here the author gets down to his real (as opposed to his stated) business. On the whole, he does it well. The travel accounts of men from John Colter to Ferdinand Hayden provide the basis of the narrative. Although repetitive citing from diaries tends to get a little tedious, a great deal of the human response to and perception of Yellowstone’s natural wonders comes through. But perhaps perception doesn’t come through enough—and this is a second part of the prob-
lem of the book. For it was not the won­
ders of nature that shaped the history
of Yellowstone, it was man's reaction to
them. A great chance to illustrate the
nineteenth-century American's attitude
toward nature was missed by the author.

Hopefully, this will be remedied in the
sequel to Nature's Yellowstone.

JOHN L. ALLEN
Associate Professor of Geography
University of Connecticut
Storrs

The Water Seekers. By Remi A. Nadeau. (Rev. ed.; Santa Barbara and Salt Lake

All too often historians are guilty of
giving inadequate attention to topics
they feel personally ill-equipped by
training or disposition to handle. Such
a topic for many of us is the role of
water in the growth and development
of the arid lands of the southwestern
United States, fraught with legal com­
plexities and engineering technicalities.
Still, a moment's reflection forces us to
acknowledge that hardly anything has
been more important to the unfolding
story of this region — and perhaps es­
pecially to southern California — than
the acquisition, control, and distribution
of this fundamental life-giving liquid.
"Whoever brings the water," said Wil­
liam Mulholland, "will bring the peo­
ple."

With the first publication of The
Water Seekers in 1950 by author-lector
Remi Nadeau, a well written and
informative popular account of the
water problems of the country's driest
quarter was finally provided. While not
ostensibly a "scholarly" work (eschewing
footnotes, for example), the book was
obviously based on wide-ranging and
detailed research in the essential pri­
mary sources; the author had done his
homework. Now, almost a quarter of a
century later, there is more of the story
to tell, but one suspects that the prin­
cipal reason for issuance of this revised
edition is the manner in which chang­ing conditions have called into question
many of the water seekers’ basic as­
sumptions.

To be sure, much of Nadeau's ac­
count remains unchanged. Still present
are the colorful personality sketches of
men with courage, imagination, and,
ocasionally, appalling judgment, like
Mulholland, Fred Eaton, Charles Rock­
wood, George Chaffey, Harry Cory,
Mark Rose, Phil Swing, and a dozen
others. Still present are the interesting
narratives of the Owens Valley-Los An­
geles Aqueduct battle, the irrigation
(and inundation) of the Imperial Val­
ley, the Boulder Dam project, and the
continuing struggle over allocation of the
Colorado River's inadequate and unruly
flow. One of the author's strengths is
his ability to see controversies from dif­
erent sides. The reader is allowed to
sympathize with the plight of the Owens
Valley farmers without forgetting the
crucial nature of their water source for
the booming metropolis to the south.
Even Arizona receives its "day" in this
volume. Fault could be found with
various stylistic touches, but tolerance
of a florid or inappropriate adjective
here and there is a small price to pay
for the author's refusal to let his prose
become as dry as the land it describes.
More detailed maps might have been
provided, and the impression lingers
that Nadeau is less comfortable when
he is compelled to relate his story to the
larger national scene. (One wonders,
for example, why there is no mention at
all of George Norris or the public-versus-
private power controversy over Muscle
Shoals that was certainly contemporane­
ous with consideration of the Boulder
Dam proposal in the 1920s.) But minor
flaws should not obscure this book's sub-
stantial virtues. Peregrine Smith has done a handsome job of printing a revised edition that is remarkably free from typographical errors and includes a section of pertinent illustrations.

Perhaps most intriguing, however, is the interpretive shift between the two editions. In 1950 the critical importance of water to the Southwest was stressed; the reader was warned that "the foreseeable future must be founded on far more ingenious water developments than the remarkable projects its people have already seen." Now Nadeau has clearly had second thoughts as he observes that "this feast of material achievement is turning to ashes in their mouths. It has brought with it pollution, congestion, and most all the discomforts that the Eastern millions had sought to escape in Los Angeles." The water seekers, caught up in the booster spirit, may have been too successful, "for if California now has enough water to more than double in population, then much of California is doomed to become insufferable." It is a sobering thought.

F. ALAN COOMBS
Associate Professor of History
University of Utah

BOOK NOTICES

Interurbans of Utah. By IRA L. SWETT.
(Cerritos, Calif.: Author, 1974. iv + 140 pp. Paper, $8.00.)

This useful compendium contains much valuable information on Utah's five electric railways: Emigration Canyon, Bamberger, Salt Lake & Utah, Utah-Idaho Central, and Salt Lake, Garfield & Western. The Salt Lake Terminal Company and the city transit systems of Ogden and Logan are also covered.

The 1954 edition of Interurbans of Utah has been out of print for some time. This new work incorporates most of the ninety-six-page original and adds more than forty new pages of text and photographs. The detailed specifications on the cars of each line will please railway buffs; the history of each line will intrigue the general reader.

Browsing through this kind of book and then putting it away is as difficult as eating a single potato chip. One would like to know more, for example, about W.C. Orem who financed and constructed the Orem Road (Salt Lake & Utah) or Mrs. W.M. Smith—said to be the only woman railroad contractor in the world—who built part of the SL&U and other roads in the West.


Ecclesiastical histories tend to examine the lives of important hierarchs and the congregations that boast wealth, influence, and an advantageous urban location. Father Weber's timely new volume—richly flavored with vignettes of lesser figures—was written in response to an appeal from Pope Paul VI for "a renewed and deepened appreciation for our respective dioceses, our own parishes.
and our legitimate community.” This encouragement of decentralized history by a major institution will add impetus to the growing nationwide interest in state and local history.


This modestly priced book will appeal to those who love the slickrock wilderness of southeastern Utah. Wolf von dem Bussche’s photographs in color and black-and-white sensitively capture the natural environment, forego the tendency found in most big picture books to overwhelm the viewer with dramatic contrasts. _Canyons and Mesas_ provides low-key, pleasant reading that will refresh those who have had a surfeit of alarmist literature on the state’s wilderness areas.

_A Critique of Utah’s Culture and Economy: A Selection of Essays_. By Joseph A. Geddes. (Logan: Merrill Library, Utah State University, 1974. vii + 139 pp.)

A sociologist and economist, Professor Emeritus Geddes was a major figure in the development of cooperatives in Utah and of a state library system. The essays “show the continuing effort of a man not only to clarify cultural problems but also to offer constructive criticism to the religious, educational and governmental forces involved with them.”


The primary author, Little Pigeon (Clara B. Nicholas in private life, according to the dust jacket), presents her conviction that Indians are descended from the house of Israel. This social and historical treatise is full of generalizations about “the Indian” and lacks discipline in thought and organization.


Designed as a text for political geography courses, this book, with its regional emphasis, is also aimed at students of social, urban, and North American geography as well as advanced students of American politics or political systems and cultures.


A detailed river-runners’ guide with notes on history, wildlife, and geology.


Reprinted in 1970, this popular book focuses primarily on the Italians in the American West—a geographical emphasis not clearly conveyed by the title. The section on Italian immigration to Utah is brief but interesting. The book in general is well researched, interpretative, and highly readable. It contains photographs and an excellent bibliography.

_Mighty Men of Zion: General Authorities of the Last Dispensation_. By Lawrence R. Flake. (Salt Lake City: Karl D. Butler, 1974. xxi + 539 pp.)

Nearly two hundred General Authorities of the Church of Jesus Christ of
Latter-day Saints are included in this compilation. The brief vignettes accompanying each entry are “inspirational” rather than strictly biographical.


Founded on the shore of Utah Lake in the early years of this century, the community of Mosida came amazingly close to establishing a viable agricultural base. All that remains now is an interesting story.


A family biography with life sketches of many ancestors, including James Brown and Truman O. Angell.


This book aims to help automobile travelers locate the route of the Butterfield Overland, using simple maps that show present highways and rail lines and clear, printed directions that tell what to look for and where to turn off the road. Photographs also assist the visitor in locating sites. Travelers will find the guide useful. Historians and others familiar with the herculean road-building efforts of Col. Philip St. George Cooke (spelled “Cook” by the author) and the Mormon Battalion will find the skimpy history disappointing.

BUSINESS AND POLITICS


Articles and Notes


Smith, Dean. “The Thieving Thirteenth,” *American History Illustrated*, 9 (October 1974), 24–33. Arizona Territory’s legislative assembly of 1885 passed much good legislation despite scandals that were investigated by two U.S. grand juries.


**ETHNICS**


**HISTORICAL SOURCES AND METHOD**


Elzy, Martin I. “Scholarship versus Economy: Records Appraisal at the National Archives,” *Prologue*, 6 (Fall 1974), 183–88. Appraisal archivists determine which records will be preserved and which disposed of, thereby affecting future historical research.


Jett, Stephen C. “The Journals of George C. Fraser ’93: Early Twentieth-Century Travels in the South and Southwest,” *The Princeton University Library Chronicle*, 35 (Spring 1974), 290–308. The Fraser journals, now at Princeton, will be of interest to historians of southern Utah and the remote areas of the Southwest.


BIOGRAPHY, LITERATURE, AND FOLKLORE


The beginning of the Paul Bunyan legend, based on an interview with W.B. Laughhead who “embellished” tales he had heard to advertise Red River Lumber Company.

Johnston, Kenneth G. “Hemingway’s ‘Wine of Wyoming’: Disappointment in America,” *Western American Literature*, 9 (Fall 1974), 159-68.


MORMONS


Crawley, Peter. “Two Rare Missouri Documents,” *Brigham Young University Studies*, 14 (Summer 1974), 502-27.


NATURAL RESOURCES


URBAN AND SOCIAL


The library of the Utah State Historical Society has acquired a variety of manuscript materials recently, including: diaries of Charles W. Penrose for the years 1854-57, 1865-68, 1904, 1906-11, 1914; diary of Volney King for the years 1914-17; diary, autobiography, daybook, and reminiscences of Aaron Johnson, Jr.; diary of Charles Kelly for the years 1918-71, photocopy of a typescript; microfilm of the 1776-77 diary of Father Escalante, in Spanish, from the original in Chicago's Newberry Library; letters to George F. Kunz concerning mineral exploration in Utah and Colorado; diary of Hattie Mable McMartin Bills; correspondence between Dale L. Morgan and Todd I. Berens pertaining to the Salt Lake-Los Angeles Road; ledger of the Young Men's Co-op (1905-6); ledger of the Anderson Brothers General Mercantile and Grocery (1905-12), Brigham City; guest register (1877-78) of Salt Lake City's Walker House hotel.

A number of records have been added to the Western Americana collection on Jews in Utah at the Marriott Library, University of Utah: B'nai Israel Sisterhood minutes, 1911-45; B'nai Israel Temple records, 1926-62; records of the B'nai Israel Cemetery Association, 1905-13; manuscript and notes of Leon L. Watters's Pioneer Jews of Utah. Other accessions include: two hundred volumes on Freemasonry; papers of Edward Hunter, presiding bishop of the Mormon church; records of the Utah State Federation of Business and Professional Women; papers of Arthur Shepherd, a prominent Utah composer.

The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints and the Reorganized Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints have exchanged copies of historic Mormon documents. Items added to the LDS Historical Department archives in Salt Lake City were: Book of Mormon manuscript, manuscript of the "Inspired Version" of the Bible, 1867 RLDS committee manuscript of the "Inspired Version," 1828 H. & E. Phinney edition of the Bible with Joseph Smith's marginal notations, book of John Whitmer, Book of Commandments, letters of Joseph Smith, three Scott letters of the Nauvoo period.

Archbishop Robert J. Dwyer, well known to historians as the author of The Gentile Comes to Utah, has been appointed editor of the National Catholic Register. A native of Salt Lake City, Archbishop Dwyer resigned his post as Archbishop of Portland, Oregon, to devote all his time to Catholic journalism.

The National Archives will conduct a National Institute on Genealogical Research in Washington, D.C., July 7-25, 1975. Interested persons are advised to apply for admission as early as possible. Inquiries should be addressed to the Central Reference Division, National Archives, Washington, D.C. 20408.
The Utah State Historical Society was organized in 1897 by public-spirited Utahns to collect, preserve, and publish Utah and related history. Today, under state sponsorship, the Society fulfills its obligations by publishing the *Utah Historical Quarterly* and other historical materials; locating, documenting, and preserving historic and prehistoric buildings and sites; and maintaining a specialized research library. Donations and gifts to the Society's programs or its library are encouraged, for only through such means can it live up to its responsibility of preserving the record of Utah's past.

MEMBERSHIP
Membership in the Utah State Historical Society is open to all individuals and institutions interested in Utah history. Membership applications and change of address notices should be sent to the membership secretary. Annual dues are: Institutions, $7.00; individuals, $3.00; students, $3.00; Life memberships, $100.00. Tax-deductible donations for special projects of the Society may be made on the following membership basis: sustaining, $250.00; patron, $500.00; benefactor, $1,000.00. Your interest and support are most welcome.